

Public Personnel Review

SOCIAL SCIENCES

DETROIT PUBLIC LIBRARY JAN 28 1959

JANUARY, 1959

Personnel Panorama—1958

Designing Public Service To Meet Modern Needs

Selective Placement in Hiring the Handicapped

Formal Education Programs for Local Government Employees

The Federal Wage Board Program—Part II

Experience With a Cost-of-Living Pay Plan

Personnel Administration in the Middle East

Effective Steps in Conducting Job Audits and Appeals

1958 Business Meeting of the Public Personnel Association

Research and Results

Personnel Opinions . . . Personnel Literature

The Bookshelf . . . Around the Personnel World

Our Readers Write

Journal of the Public Personnel Association

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

The Journal of the Public Personnel Association

Formerly Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada

1313 E. 60th Street

Chicago 37, Illinois

EDITORIAL STAFF

KENNETH O. WARNER, *Editor*
J. J. DONOVAN, *Managing Editor*
ANN LIPÓVAC, *Assistant Editor*

EDITORIAL BOARD

JOSEPH W. HAWTHORNE, *General Manager, Los Angeles, California, City Civil Service Commission*
PHILIP R. BERGER, *Personnel Director, Alameda County, California, Civil Service Commission*
JOHN D. FOSTER, *Personnel Director, Port of New York Authority*
WILLIAM T. McDONALD, *Director, Executive Training Conferences, The Brookings Institution*
MISS MAUDE MYERS, *President, Illinois State Civil Service Commission*
ANGUS LAIRD, *Supervisor, Florida Merit System*
DAVID M. WATTERS, *Secretary, Treasury Board of Canada*

EDITORIAL CONSULTANTS

O. E. AULT, *Director, Planning and Development, Civil Service Commission of Canada*
SCHUYLER HOSLETT, *Vice President, Reuben H. Donnelly Corporation*
JAMES M. MITCHELL, *Associate Director, National Science Foundation*
ROLLIN B. POSEY, *Managing Director, College Department, Row, Peterson & Company*
DONALD PRICE, *Dean, Littauer Center, Harvard University*
FOSTER B. ROSER, *Personnel Director, Philadelphia Personnel Department*
ED SHELLEY, *Personnel Director, Tennessee Valley Authority*
O. GLENN STAHL, *Director, Programs & Standards Bureau, U.S. Civil Service Commission*
KATHERINE TAYLOR, *Regional Representative, U.S. Health, Education, and Welfare Department, Dallas*
CHARLES W. TERRY, *Director, Oregon State Civil Service Commission*
PAUL VAN RIPER, *Associate Professor of Administration, Cornell University*
ARNOLD S. ZANDER, *International President, American Federation of State, County, and Municipal Employees*

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October, by the Public Personnel Association, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois. U. S. and Canada subscription rates, \$6.50 per year; foreign \$7.50 per year; single copies, \$2.00, in advance. Second class postage paid at Chicago, Illinois, with additional entry at Brattleboro, Vermont.

POSTMASTER: Send Form 3579 to Public Personnel Review, 1313 East 60th St., Chicago 37, Ill.

SS

Public Personnel Review

Journal of the
PUBLIC PERSONNEL ASSOCIATION

Volume 20

JANUARY, 1959

Number 1

CONTENTS

PAGE

Personnel Panorama—1958

| | | |
|--|--|----|
| I. Personnel Legislation in the 85th Congress | Harvey Dean Brown | 5 |
| II. U.S. State and Local and Canadian Developments | Keith Ocheltree | 14 |
| Designing Public Service To Meet Modern Needs | John W. Macy, Jr. | 20 |
| Selective Placement in Hiring the Handicapped | Jack Pockrass | 25 |
| Formal Education Programs for Local Government Employees | Beatrice Dinerman and Eugene P. Dvorin | 33 |
| The Federal Wage Board Program—Part II | J. Kenneth Mulligan | 38 |
| Experience With a Cost-of-Living Pay Plan | William Monat | 43 |
| Personnel Administration in the Middle East | Ferrel Heady | 49 |
| Effective Steps in Conducting Job Audits and Appeals | Robert A. Gross | 56 |
| 1958 Business Meeting of the Public Personnel Association | Kenneth O. Warner | 60 |
| Research and Results | Cecil E. Goode | 66 |
| Around the Personnel World | | 72 |
| Personnel Opinions | | 76 |
| "Under what conditions, if any, should a public employee be disqualified for a pension because of misconduct?" | | 81 |
| The Bookshelf | | 81 |
| "The Essence of Management" . . . "Public Administration" . . . "The Evaluation Interview" . . . "The Theory of Wage Determination" . . . Book and Pamphlet Notes . . . "Group Insurance for Public Employees" (An Annotated Bibliography, Library, U. S. Civil Service Commission). | | |
| Personnel Literature | | 90 |
| Our Readers Write | | 96 |

Public Personnel Review

The quarterly journal of the Public Personnel Association provides a medium for the publication of factual material, and for materials that may represent divergent ideas, judgments, and opinions. The views expressed in articles and other contributions are those of the authors, and may not be construed as reflecting the views of the Association or the editors unless so stated.

Subscription Rates. U. S. and Canada, \$6.50 per year; foreign \$7.50; single copies, \$2.00, in advance. Prices on back issues quoted on request.

All correspondence regarding manuscripts, subscriptions, and advertising should be addressed to the editorial and business offices of *Public Personnel Review*, Room 456, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois.

editorial

People, Issues, and Outlook

ONE of the "letters to the editor" in the last issue of the *Review* made a thoughtful case for giving more attention to the "people" part of personnel administration as a way to gain and hold greater reader interest.

We heartily agree that this is a worthy editorial goal. But along with human interest as a fulcrum for raising reader attention, we urge the importance of facing squarely some of the basic issues before us today. On the surface these issues may appear rather impersonal and lacking in magnetic reader pulling power. But closer inspection, we think, shows that they involve broad concepts of public policy—concepts that will influence the future of the public personnel field and the men and women who have chosen it as their career.

Sketched below are just a few of the current issues in public personnel administration that merit our thoughtful attention:

1. The proper role of unions in the public service and an appropriate government policy to deal with them in such a way that fair treatment of government employees and the general public welfare will both be achieved.
2. A realistic policy governing political activities . . . a policy that prevents patronage, assures public workers freedom to exercise their civic rights, and maintains the merit system on a solid footing.
3. A set of principles that will help decide which positions should be included and which ones excluded from the classified career service.
4. An acceptable statement of the proper role and status of the personnel executive.
5. Guidelines to determine the role of the civil service commission, as well as the organizational setup that will best enable it to discharge its responsibilities.

This list of issues might be expanded. But in those mentioned above we discern certain common elements. On each issue, widely divergent views are held among employee groups, personnel officials, civil service commissioners, political leaders, and civic re-

formers. However these vital issues may be resolved, they bear directly on the lives of millions of government workers and not merely those engaged in personnel work.

How do we meet the challenge presented in these pressing issues, the effects of which are so far-reaching? Perhaps we can best illustrate one possible approach by commenting on one of the central issues—the role of the civil service agency.

In barest essentials, this issue may be stated thus: Should the traditionally independent civil service commission be superseded by an arrangement wherein it becomes an advisory, appellate body, and its service activity functions are transferred to management, to be directed by an appointee of the chief executive.

Viewpoints among proponents and opponents of the independent civil service commission differ sharply on a number of basic points. Proponents argue that the age of maturity in public affairs remains in the future; hence the continuing need for a civil service watchdog that will prevent patronage and obtain qualified employees strictly on merit. Opponents of the idea desire to integrate "personnel" with management, so responsible elected officials can see to it that their policies are carried out adequately.

Let's see where the independent civil service commission practice stands today. The initial adoption of civil service followed the traditional line. With very few exceptions, recent new statewide legislation on civil service in local governments provided for the independent type of agency. Last year, civil service in fire and police departments was established for smaller communities in Illinois, Nebraska, and Iowa, following the historic arrangement. In many larger communities, governed by special acts, the traditional viewpoints guided revisions and new civil service laws.

In point of fact, personnel functions have been married to management in very few places in the United States. Notable are the states of Rhode Island, Kansas, and Illinois, and the City of New York. Connecticut recently set up a more independent arrangement after years of experience with an integrated system.

There has been and continues to be much
(Continued on page 48)

Meet the Authors

Beatrice Dinerman

... co-author of *Formal Education Programs for Local Government Employees* is Public Administration Analyst, Bureau of Governmental Research, at the University of California, Los Angeles. Miss Dinerman attended Hunter College and Brooklyn College, receiving her B.A. degree from the latter institution in 1954. In 1957, she received the degree of Master of Public Administration from U.C.L.A. She is currently Secretary, Los Angeles Metropolitan Chapter of the American Society for Public Administration.

Harvey Dean Brown

... author of *Personnel Legislation in the 85th Congress*, *Personnel Panorama—1958*, is Staff Assistant to the President's Special Assistant for Personnel Management, The White House. He received his B.S. degree at the University of Utah in 1949 and a Graduate Certificate in Public Administration in 1950. He entered the federal service in 1950 under the Civil Service Commission's Junior Management Assistant Intern Program, worked as an Organization and Methods Examiner, Executive Secretary of Civil Service Commission Incentive Awards Committee and as Forms Control Officer from 1950 to 1954. He joined the staff of the President's Adviser on Personnel Management in July of 1954. He has contributed several articles on personnel legislation to *Public Personnel Review*.

Eugene P. Dvorin

... co-author of *Formal Education Programs for Local Government Employees* is Assistant Professor of Government at Los Angeles State College. Mr. Dvorin graduated from U.C.L.A. and received the Ph.D. degree in Political Science from that institution in 1955. During 1955-56 he was engaged in research on civil service problems in British Central Africa as a Ford Foundation Foreign Research Fellow. During the 1956-57 academic year he was on

the faculty of Michigan State University where he offered courses in political science and public administration. Mr. Dvorin has also taught at the University of California, Los Angeles. He has contributed articles to professional political and social science journals in the United States and abroad. Among the journals in which his contributions have appeared are *Western Political Quarterly*, *Social Science*, *Harvard Law Review*, *National Municipal Review*, and *Public Personnel Review*.

Robert A. Gross

... author of *Effective Steps in Conducting Job Audits and Appeals* is Chief, Classification and Compensation, Department of Personnel, St. Louis. He received his Bachelor's degree in Public Administration from Washington University in 1948 and has had graduate work in political science there. He has been Chief, Classification and Compensation, in the Department of Personnel, City of St. Louis, since 1952. He was previously employed as Administrative Analyst, City and County of Denver, 1948-50, and Director of Research, St. Clair County (Illinois) Taxpayer's Association, 1950-52. He has also served as consultant to the East St. Louis, Illinois, Chamber of Commerce and as Research Director for the Citizen's Fact-Finding Committee of East St. Louis.

Ferrel Heady

... author of *Personnel Administration in the Middle East* is Associate Director, Institute of Public Administration and Professor of Political Science, University of Michigan. He spent a sabbatical leave in 1957 in several countries of the Middle East studying their civil service systems. In 1953-54, he was Director of the Institute of Public Administration at the University of the Philippines. He is a member of the Committee on Comparative Administration of the American Society for Public Administration, and co-author of an annotated bibliography on comparative administration

published by the Michigan Institute. Other experience includes work with the U.S. Department of Agriculture, the First Hoover Commission, and the Inter-University Case Program.

John W. Macy, Jr.

... author of *Designing Public Service To Meet Modern Needs* has been Executive Vice President of Wesleyan University in Middletown, Connecticut since February, 1958. For 5 years prior to his Wesleyan appointment, he was executive director of the U. S. Civil Service Commission, the ranking career officer in the federal merit system. In this post, he was in charge of the administration of the nation's largest personnel program, under which more than 2¼ million federal workers are employed. He resigned the post in order to return to Wesleyan, where he received his Bachelor's degree in 1938. Mr. Macy is the national president of the American Society for Public Administration. He serves as a consultant to several government agencies and participates in various university and professional management development programs.

William R. Monat

... author of *Experience With a Cost-of-Living Pay Plan* is Administrative Assistant to Governor G. Mennen Williams of Michigan. He holds his present assignment while on leave of absence as an assistant professor of Political Science, Wayne State University. His article is based on a portion of his doctoral dissertation "Merit System Administration in Minnesota State Government: An Inquiry into Staff-Line Relations," done at the University of Minnesota. In addition to his Wayne State University position, Dr. Monat has been a teaching assistant and instructor in Political Science at the University of Minnesota and a special consultant, Public Health Service, Department of Health, Education, and Welfare.

J. Kenneth Mulligan

... author of *The Federal Wage Board Program—Part II* was appointed in August, 1958, to his present position as Executive Vice-Chairman of the Interagency Advisory Group of the United States Civil Service

Commission. For the last 2 years he has been responsible for wage board coordination for the federal government and will continue with this assignment. Previously he was with the Navy Department wage and classification program and in various personnel posts in federal and local government. He served as nonpaid Chairman of the Personnel Board for the Town of Wakefield, Mass., from 1953-56. Last year he was Chairman of the Compensation Work Group of the Society for Personnel Administration.

Keith Ocheltree

... author of *State and Local and Canadian Developments, Personnel Panorama—1958*, is a Senior Staff Member of the Public Personnel Association and is assigned to the Advisory Service. His background includes graduate work in public administration at Syracuse University, a public administration internship in New York state, a year as a member of the staff of the Training Division of the New York State Civil Service Department, and over five years as a field staff member of Public Administration Service. In the last-named capacity he supervised and participated in a variety of survey projects including many in the field of personnel administration.

Jack Pockrass

... author of *Selective Placement in Hiring the Physically Handicapped* has been civilian Air Force Chief of Placement and Employee Relations for more than 10 years. Prior to his military service, 1943-1946, he had served several years as Personnel Consultant in the Social Security Board's merit system programs for State Welfare and Employment agencies. A clinical psychologist by training, he has published articles on merit system administration and personnel management.

His activities in employment of the physically handicapped stemmed from this professional background rather than his later affliction with multiple sclerosis. After earlier citations for work in promoting employment of the physically handicapped, he received the first Public Personnel Award from the President's Committee.

Personnel Panorama—1958:

I. Personnel Legislation in the 85th Congress

Harvey Dean Brown

One of the most productive sessions in years, personnelwise, measurably improves attractiveness of federal employment.

IT CAN BE SAID, without a doubt, that with regard to personnel legislation, the second session of the 85th Congress was one of the most productive sessions in recent years. While its achievement was outstanding in terms of numbers alone—35 separate acts—the real accomplishment was in the significance of some of the measures. The salary increases for more than a million and a half employees, the governmentwide authority for training; the increased number of top-level positions, the authority to fix the entrance hiring grades at GS-7 as well as GS-5, and the authority to pay scientists' and engineers' expenses for moving to first duty stations are important achievements which will bring government practices more nearly in line with those of private industry and will measurably improve the attractiveness of the federal service as the nation's largest employer of personnel. The many other measures which clarified existing law and corrected certain inequities will also contribute to the increased effectiveness of federal personnel management.

Pay and Compensation

The salary legislation enacted by the second session of the 85th Congress for federal and postal employees represents a significant improvement in the government's salary position. Although providing less of an increase than the employee organizations advocated, and not going as far as the President recommended in realigning the salary structure, these measures materially strengthen the government's position in recruiting and retaining quality personnel.

Increases in Compensation for Postal Employees (P.L. 85-426)

Early in the session the President recommended a 6 per cent increase for postal employees. The bills introduced proposed increases ranging from 6 per cent to over 12 per cent. After extensive hearings and considerable discussion, the salary increase proposals were incorporated into an act which readjusted postal rates and established a congressional policy for determining postal rates.

Under Title IV of P.L. 85-426, which was finally approved May 27, 1958, postal employees are granted a permanent increase in salary of 7½ per cent, plus a temporary or 3-year cost-of-living adjustment of 2½ per cent in levels 1 through 6 and 1½ per cent in level 7 of the postal field service schedule. Comparable increases are also provided for rural carriers and fourth-class postmasters. Both increases were retroactive to the first pay period, beginning on or after January 1, 1958, and affect some 530,000 postal employees.

Federal Employees Salary Increase Act (P.L. 85-462)

Early in the Second Session, the President submitted a comprehensive proposal for a realignment of the salary structure of the Classification Act. In order to relieve the compression which has gradually occurred between the salary levels of the various grades, a minimum increase of 6 per cent in Grades 1 through GS-10 was proposed. The rates for GS-11 through GS-14 would have been increased by 7.5 per cent, and the rates for the higher grades would have increased to a maximum rate for a GS-18 of \$19,500. The President's proposal also recommended

removal of the statutory limitation on the number of positions which could be classified in Grades GS-16, 17, and 18 and proposed instead that positions be classified in these grades by the Civil Service Commission whenever their duties and responsibilities so warrant it.

As signed into law June 20, 1958, the Salary Increase Act provided 10 per cent salary increases, retroactive to January 1, 1958, for more than a million federal employees. In addition to the 978,000 federal and District of Columbia government employees paid under the Classification Act, the measure also covers some 41,000 employees of the legislative and judicial branches, the state department's foreign service, the veterans' administration's Department of Medicine and Surgery, and certain other agencies where pay rates are fixed administratively. The increase adds more than \$500 million annually to the federal payroll.

In addition to the pay raises, the Federal Employee's Salary Increase Act contained a number of other progressive improvements. Among these were:

Authority to permit recruitment for entry-level scientific, professional, and managerial positions at GS-7 (\$4980) as well as at GS-5 (\$4040). This authority was sought and granted on the basis that the government was lagging in its ability to recruit "top quality" graduates whose college records indicate high potential in their field of endeavor. The Civil Service Commission has since capitalized on this authority by permitting the higher entrance salaries to be paid applicants (1) having a "B" or better grade average in college or, (2) who are in the upper 25 per cent of their class in college.

Authorization for 322 additional positions paying up to \$19,000 for top scientific and professional personnel. The act also extends the authority to establish such positions to four additional agencies. These authorities were sorely needed to strengthen government research and development organizations.

Authorization for an increase of 340 additional top positions in grades GS-16, 17, and 18. Fifty-three of the new positions are for designated agencies. With the exception of positions authorized for the Federal Bureau of Investigation, and those filled by presidential appointees, all appointments to "supergrade" positions must be approved by the Civil Service Commission.

Increased the maximum pay for classified employees (grade GS-18) from \$16,000 to \$17,500 per year.

Increased pay for postal supervisors, postmaster, and other postal field service employees in levels 7 through 19 by an additional 2.5 per cent to provide for them the full 10 per cent increase which was authorized for postal employees up to level 7.

Fixing Effective Dates of Pay Increases for Blue Collar Employees (P.L. 85-872)

Section 202(b) of the Classification Act of 1949, as amended, provides that the approximately 750,000 employees in recognized skilled or unskilled trades or crafts shall have their compensation fixed and adjusted from time to time by their agencies in accordance with prevailing rates in industry. During the hearings on the bill, it was established that agencies often take 3 months or longer to collect and analyze the data. The net result of this is that there is a lag of from 3 to 5 months before increases in pay of employees in industry are reflected in the pay of similar employees who are employed in the government.

The new legislation requires that whenever an increase in compensation is granted wage-board employees in accordance with local prevailing rates, such increases must become effective not later than 45 days following the date on which the survey used to determine the new rate was officially ordered to be made.

High Level Scientific and Administrative Positions

There is increasing evidence in a number of recent measures that Congress is apparently recognizing the need to strengthen the government's competitive position with industry with regard to top level salaries. With the creation of two new agencies—the National Aeronautics and Space Administration and the Federal Aviation Agency—over 50 new supergrade positions were established, and nearly 300 new scientific, professional, and administrative positions, paying up to \$19,500 per year, were set up. Other agencies also received authorization for increased number of supergrade positions, and, for the first time, authority was granted some agencies to include "administrative or executive" positions among those positions

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

paying up to \$19,000. Such authority was previously limited to "scientific and professional" positions.

National Aeronautics and Space Act of 1958 (P.L. 85-568)

The new space agency is formed around the nucleus of the old National Advisory Committee for Aeronautics. NASA is responsible for formulating a national space policy and for the conduct of the aeronautical and space activities of the country. To direct this important function, the law establishes the position of administrator (\$22,500), deputy administrator (\$21,500), and two other positions (\$20,000) which are presidential appointments requiring Senate confirmation. In addition, the Agency is authorized to set up 253 scientific, engineering, and administrative positions paying up to \$19,000. Ten positions may also be established paying \$21,000 per year.

The Act also grants the Agency special authority to recruit specially qualified engineering and scientific talent at two grades higher than the entrance level authorized by the Classification Act (GS-7).

Federal Aviation Act of 1958 (P.L. 85-726)

To facilitate the staffing of top positions of the new Federal Aviation Agency created by this Act, Congress authorized the establishment of 50 new supergrade positions, 10 new scientific and professional positions paying up to \$19,000 annually, and 10 administrative positions paying \$19,500 per year. The administrator and his deputy are compensated at \$22,500 and \$20,500 respectively. The Act also authorizes the establishment of 8 new supergrade positions for the Civil Aeronautics Board.

Under the Act, the Federal Aviation Agency, which was established to provide for the safe and efficient use of navigable air space by both civil and military operations, will replace the present Civil Aeronautics Administration as well as the Airways Modernization Board. In addition, the Act authorizes the President to transfer military air traffic control and air navigation operational functions and personnel to the Agency. Ultimately this means that more

than 18,000 positions now filled by military personnel at over 300 military bases will be civilianized and assimilated by the new Agency bringing its total staff to over 40,000 persons.

Because of the tremendous personnel problems implicit in such a conversion and the special needs inherent in air traffic control work and the other functions of the Agency, the administrator was directed to make a study of personnel problems and report to Congress thereon before January 1, 1960.

Public Health Service and Food and Drug Administration Positions (P.L. 85-914)

This legislation amends the federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act to prohibit the use in food of additives which have not been adequately tested to establish their safety. Section 8 increases the salary of the commissioner of Food and Drugs from the grade GS-18 salary of \$17,500 to \$20,000 per annum. Section 9 amends Section 208(g) of the Public Health Service Act which authorizes positions of the Public Law 313 type by changing the description of the "professional and scientific service" to "professional, scientific, and executive service" and by changing the description of the personnel therein from "specially qualified scientific or professional personnel" to "specially qualified scientific, professional, and administrative personnel."

Additional Supergrades for Railroad Retirement Board (P.L. 85-927)

The amendments to the Railroad Retirement Act contained in this measure include authorization for the Railroad Retirement Board to place, without regard to the numerical limitations in the Classification Act, 4 positions in grade GS-16, 4 positions in grade GS-17 and 1 position in grade GS-18.

Increase in Salary for Commissioner of Patents (P.L. 85-933)

This enactment increases the salary of the commissioner of patents from \$17,500 to \$20,000, to make it more nearly commensurate with the duties and responsibilities of the position. To handle the large volume of appeals from the decisions of the patent ex-

aminers, this Act also authorizes an increase in the membership of the Board of Appeals of the Patent Office from 9 to 15. It also provides that persons designated examiners-in-chief may be compensated at the established rate for the position in which they are temporarily serving. A legal technicality previously prevented such a practice.

Salary Increases for U. S. Board of Parole Members (P.L. 85-928)

This act increases the compensation of the members of the United States Board of Parole from their present Classification Act grade of GS-15, \$13,970, to \$17,500 per year thereby bringing the salaries more into line with the quasi-judicial administrative agencies having more or less comparable responsibilities.

Training

Government Employees Training Act (P.L. 85-507)

Another significant accomplishment which will strengthen and improve the performance of essential functions in the federal service is the new Government Employees Training Act. For the first time it establishes a comprehensive governmentwide policy regarding the training of federal employees, which will enable the government to develop the full potential of present employees and will aid materially in the recruitment and retention of high caliber personnel. Long sought by the executive branch and recommended by both Hoover Commissions, the new law authorizes all types of employee training, including training within the federal service and in non-federal facilities such as colleges, universities, manufacturing plants, and laboratories.

The Civil Service Commission is responsible for the general administration of the law and for the issuance of governmentwide regulations under which the agencies will operate their own training programs. The Commission is directed to continue providing in-service training assistance to agencies and to review agencies' out-service training programs for compliance with the law and regulations. The Act also reaffirms the necessity for employee self-development and

in-service training, but it adds few, if any, new controls to programs operating wholly within government. Agency heads remain responsible for determining the kinds of training to be given, when it is to be given, which employees need training, and how much money to allot for training purposes within the limits of appropriations.

The Act, however, does specify certain controls to govern out-service training. Trainees must agree in advance to remain with the agency for at least three times the length of the training period or repay the training costs, and no employee with less than 1 year of continuous service may be given out-service training. An employee may not receive more than 1 year of out-service training for each 10 years of total service, and such training may not be given solely for purposes of promotion or the obtaining of academic degrees. Additionally, the training which an agency may authorize in non-federal facilities is also limited to 1 per cent of its authorized personnel strength.

Even with these limitations, the new authority is a major achievement for the executive branch, and one which will enable the government agencies to bring their training programs more nearly in line with those in private industry.

Travel Allowances

Payment of Travel and Moving Expenses for New Employees (P.L. 85-749)

The government's efforts to recruit scientists and engineers should be materially improved by the recent amendment to the Administrative Expenses Act of 1946, as amended, which will permit federal agencies to pay travel and moving expenses of prospective employees in scientific and engineering and architectural occupations. Under the provisions of the new legislation, travel expenses of persons selected for appointment, and transportation of their immediate families and household effects, may be paid from their residences to their first duty stations. Although the Act limits such payments to positions in which manpower shortages exist and in which skills are critical to national defense, it is a step in the right direction and will improve considerably the government's competitive position with in-

dustry in recruiting and retaining technical professional personnel.

Allowance for Transportation of Trailers (P.L. 85-326)

The Administrative Expense Act of 1946 authorizes payment by the government for packing, crating, hauling, and transportation of household goods and personal effects of civilian officers and employees when transferred from one permanent official station to another. This authority, however, did not cover the movement of house trailers. Although military personnel have received an allowance for the movement of house trailers since 1955, the civilian employee had to move his trailer at his own expense when transferred. This entailed considerable hardships and was in effect a discrimination against employees who lived in trailers.

The new legislation corrects this inequity by permitting the payment of a mileage allowance of up to 20 cents per mile to civilian employees for the transportation of house trailers.

Travel Expenses for Presidential Employees Assigned Overseas (P.L. 85-858)

This law authorizes the payment of travel expenses of certain presidential appointees assigned to duty posts outside the continental United States. It was prompted by a ruling of the Comptroller General that Section 7 of the Administrative Expenses Act of 1946, as amended, which authorizes expenses of round trip travel of employees and transportation of immediate families from overseas posts to their residences for purposes of annual leave every 2 years, did not apply to presidential employees who are appointed for a fixed time. The Amendment enables these appointees to enjoy the same benefits as other overseas employees.

Retirement

Civil Service Retirement Annuity Increases (P.L. 85-465)

The new law provides 10 per cent increases in annuities to retirees and survivor annuitants whose present annuities are based on service which terminated before October 1, 1956. (Annuitants whose benefits are based on service that ended after that date are already receiving more liberal payments

under the Civil Service Retirement Act amendments of 1956, so their annuities will not be increased by the new law.) The last general adjustment in civil service annuities was in 1955.

The increase, justified on the basis of the increased cost of living, added some \$3,500,000 to the approximately \$35,000,000 being paid each month to the 232,000 retirees and 90,000 survivors who will benefit.

In addition, the law extends annuity benefits to certain surviving widows or widowers of employees who died before February 29, 1948. Individuals who qualify for these benefits are eligible to receive new survivor annuities up to \$63 per month. The Civil Service Commission reports that, as of November 1, over 18,000 widows or widowers had filed for such benefits.

Increased Foreign Service Annuities (P.L. 85-882)

The purpose of the legislation is to provide a 10 per cent increase in annuities to retired foreign service personnel and to their widows. In the case of retired officers, the increase is limited to a maximum of \$500 per annum and, in the case of widows, to \$250 per annum. This would confer on those individuals who come under the foreign service retirement and disability system the same increase as was given retired civil service annuitants under Public Law 85-465.

Benefits to Widows of Employees of Lighthouse Service (P.L. 85-351)

This Act would increase from \$50 to \$75 per month the amount of benefits payable to some 415 un-remarried widows of certain former employees of the Lighthouse Service. The annuities are payable under the non-contributory retirement system set up by the Lighthouse Retirement Act of 1918.

Survivorship Benefits for Members of Congress (P.L. 85-722)

Previously under the existing retirement law, when a covered employee died after completing at least 5 years' civilian service, survivor annuity benefits become payable to his widow and children. Similarly, upon death of a covered member of Congress with at least 5 years' member service to his

credit, his eligible widow and children are entitled to survivor annuity.

These provisions give rise to an anomalous situation in a very limited number of cases when an employee is elected or appointed as a member of Congress. Regardless of his length of employee service, he no longer has annuity protection for his survivors upon becoming a member and electing retirement coverage. The earliest his survivor protection will again attach is on (1) completion of 5 years' covered member service, or (2) return to non-member employment under the retirement law, at any time before acquiring survivor protection as a member. His death in the interim, however, would support no annuity award to his widow or children.

P.L. 85-722 would correct this inequity by providing that the minimum service required for survivor protection upon the death of either an employee or member would be 5 years' civilian service. The effect of this change is that survivor protection once obtained would be uninterrupted regardless of whether the individual goes from employee to member service and coverage or vice versa.

Withdrawal of Voluntary Retirement Contributions (P.L. 85-661)

Participants in the retirement program can, under the Civil Service Retirement law, pay voluntarily into the retirement fund additional amounts not in excess of 10 per cent of their basic salaries. These voluntary payments are for the purpose of purchasing additional lifetime annuities. Previously, however, the law did not authorize a withdrawal of such voluntary contributions while the individual is still employed or after he becomes entitled to an annuity.

The new act authorizes the refund of such contributions provided the person elects to take the lump sum refund before he receives any annuity.

Retirement Benefits for Certain Rural Letter Carriers (P.L. 85-827)

This Act accords coverage, under the Civil Service Retirement Act, to certain temporary rural carrier service performed between October 23, 1943, and March 6,

1946, by employees whom the post office department intended to convert to war-service indefinite status, but due to an administrative oversight or omission were not so converted.

Postal Service Employees

Increased Equipment Allowance for Rural Carriers (P.L. 85-399)

This Act increases the basic equipment allowance for rural carriers of the post office department from 9 cents to 10 cents per mile, or \$3.50 per day, whichever is greater. The law previously provided that in addition to the basic allowance of 9 cents per mile, carriers serving "heavily" patronized routes could be given an extra amount which, together with the mileage allowance, could not exceed a total of \$3.00 per day. Thus, this limitation prevented a rural carrier serving a route of 33 miles or over from receiving any additional allowance even though he was serving a route deemed "heavily" patronized since his basic mileage allowance would be in excess of the \$3.00 ceiling. P.L. 85-399 amends the previous law in this regard by providing that the Postmaster may pay an allowance not in excess of \$2.50 per day to rural carriers entitled to additional compensation for serving heavily patronized routes, without regard to the basic equipment allowance.

Step-Increase Anniversary Dates for Postal Employees (P.L. 85-432)

This legislation corrects inequities with respect to the occurrence of anniversary dates of certain postal field service employees for automatic advancement by step increases under the Postal Field Service Compensation Act of 1955. It also provides for the crediting, for longevity step-increase purposes, of certain services performed in the postal accounts division of the General Accounting Office by some employees prior to their transfer to the postal field service as a result of the Post Office Financial Control Act of 1950.

Longevity Credit for Service in the Panama Canal Zone (P.L. 85-751)

Corrects an inequity in the postal field service by granting longevity credit to em-

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

employees in the postal field service in the United States for service performed by them while in the Panama Canal Zone Postal Service.

Canal Zone

Rural

Adjusting Conditions of Employment in the Canal Zone (P.L. 85-550)

ment
office
s per
eater.
addi-
s per
nized
ount
ance,
day,
l car-
from
even
emed
leage
33.00
vious
the
ot in
riers
for
hout
.

Postal

with
sary
plo-
o in-
Com-
for
ease
d in
neral
prior
e as
ontrol

ama

field
em-

On January 25, 1955, the government of the United States and the Republic of Panama entered into a treaty (referred to as the Treaty of Mutual Understanding and Cooperation) to which was attached a memorandum of understanding. The memorandum of understandings, which is an executive agreement separate from the treaty, contained 11 items to which the United States agreed as necessary to the proper implementation of the intent and purpose of the treaty.

Item 1 of the memorandum of understandings pertaining to wage and employment practices and personnel administration generally of the government of the United States in the Canal Zone contains policies, principles, standards, and statements which are implemented by P.L. 85-550. The law establishes the principle that the basic wage for a given grade level will usually be the same for qualified personnel regardless of citizenship. Since the enactment of this measure removes the employees in the Canal Zone from the competitive civil service system and the Classification Act of 1949, a provision is included which requires that a Canal Zone Merit System and a Canal Zone Board of Appeals be established.

The act also makes inoperative the Cash Relief Act which provides retirement coverage for non-citizens of Canal Zone Government and Panama Canal Company and brings such employees under the Civil Service Retirement Act. Finally, the act establishes specifically the authority of the President as the coordinating executive authority with respect to the application and operation of the provisions of the Act.

Authorizing Dual Jobs for Canal Zone Teachers (P.L. 85-613)

This Act exempts Panama Canal Zone teachers from application of dual employ-

ment and dual compensation laws. This legislation was needed in order to properly and efficiently staff the night and vacation schools since, by reason of its isolation, the only teachers available for the conduct of such schools in the Canal Zone are the teachers in the regular school system.

Other Legislation

Salary Retention in Downgrading Actions (P.L. 85-737)

The purpose of this Act is to clarify the application of Section 507 of the Classification Act of 1949, as amended, with respect to the preservation of the rates of basic compensation of certain officers or employees whose positions are downgraded through no fault of theirs. It was found that the restrictive language of the law denied protection to employees whose duties had been changed in the slightest degree. Since this was not the intent of Congress, this measure broadens the eligibility thus eliminating distinctions having no fair and valid basis. It also extends the coverage of this legislation to employees in those positions under the Library of Congress, the Architect of the Capitol, the Botanic Garden, and the municipal government of the District of Columbia, for which salaries are fixed in accordance with the Classification Act rates. The amendments also limit to a period of 2 years the time during which the salary saving provisions shall apply.

Career Service Reinstatement Rights for Certain Employees (P.L. 85-847)

Enacted principally to rectify an administrative oversight which deprived some 25 maintenance and custodial workers of the National Security Agency from acquiring civil service status, this Act provides the opportunity for persons who did not receive career-conditional or career appointments under Public Law 380, 84th Congress, because of administrative errors by their employing agency, to obtain such appointments. The legislation extended indefinitely, the reinstatement rights to the competitive service that were provided for a 2-year period under P.L. 380 to those persons whose positions were removed from the competi-

tive service between January 23, 1955, and November 10, 1955.

Payment of Accrued Annual Leave to Survivors of Deceased Employees (P.L. 85-914)

At the time the Congress amended the Annual and Sick Leave Act of 1951 to limit accumulated leave to 30 days for employees in the continental United States, and 45 days for overseas employees, they also amended the act of August 3, 1950, which provides for the settlement of claims of deceased federal employees. This amendment acted to limit the payment to the estate of the deceased federal employee in all leave systems of the federal government to 30 days' accumulated leave, plus leave earned in the current year in which the employee died.

This limitation on the provisions of the Act of August 3, 1950, created an inequity in that it denied the estate of the deceased federal employee payment for leave for which he would have been paid had he lived and remained in the service for the expiration of such accumulated and accrued leaves. This Act will remove the inequitable limitation and provide for full payment to the estate of the deceased employee.

Employee Compensation and War Risk Hazards Benefits (P.L. 85-608)

This Act amends and makes permanent provisions of existing law relating to workman's compensation and war-risk hazards benefits for federal employees and employees of contractors of the federal government working in overseas areas. For many years, Congress has extended temporary legislation of this kind from year to year. However, since it is unlikely that American commitments in overseas areas will substantially diminish in the foreseeable future, permanent legislation was needed to clarify certain provisions and to relieve Congress of the burden of granting annual extensions.

Movement of Employees from the Legislative to the Executive Branch (P.L. 85-432)

Sec. 4 of the above Act permits legislative employees to transfer to the executive

branch at above the minimum of the grade. In the past, the comptroller general had ruled that an employee's movement from the legislative to the executive branch must be considered an appointment instead of a transfer. Civil service regulations governing appointments require that they be made at the first step of the grade. Thus, when a legislative employee moved to an executive branch position he was compelled to start at the minimum rate of the appropriate grade, even though he may have been receiving a higher salary in his legislative job. This situation is now corrected.

The so-called Ramspect Act of 1949, which extended the classified civil service, established a basis whereby certain legislative employees in specified occupations could acquire status. A number of the present positions were not in existence at the time of the Act and thus are not included among those eligible to acquire status. Section 5 of P.L. 85-432 removes this impediment, making it uniformly applicable to all employees in the legislative branch.

Overtime Pay for Certain "Long Tour" Employees (P.L. 85-525)

This legislation amends the Federal Employees' Pay Act of 1945, as amended, to require the payment of overtime at the usual rate of time and one-half to fire fighters and other employees for irregular and unscheduled overtime duty in proportion to the amount of time they are required to perform.

Since 1954, the agencies have been authorized to pay additional compensation, not to exceed 25% of basic compensation, to employees having irregular hours of duty substantially in excess of 40 hours a week, including a considerable portion of standby duty. The employee concerned receives additional pay on an annual basis distributed evenly over all pay periods during a year, irrespective of the number of hours of overtime performed during any particular period.

This provision has operated to reduce the overtime pay in many instances far below the amount of overtime pay affected employees would receive if they were given the usual time and one-half pay for time in ex-

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

cess of their regularly established tours of duty. The new law corrects this inequity.

Transfer of Federal Employees to International Organizations (P.L. 85-795)

This Act encourages and authorizes the details and transfers of federal employees for temporary service with international organizations. It provides for the retention of certain rights and benefits such as retirement coverage, life insurance coverage, and reemployment rights up to a period of 3 years. The primary purpose of P.L. 85-795 is to provide an improved means and a greater incentive for federal specialist personnel to accept positions with international organizations by making such transfers more attractive. It is hoped that such action will assist present efforts to raise the percentage of well-qualified Americans occupying professional positions with these organizations and, at the same time, broaden the opportunities of federal personnel to acquire international experience of value to the government.

Funds for Assuming Beneficial Association Insurance Plans (P.L. 85-377)

Public Law 356, approved August 11, 1955, authorized the Civil Service Commis-

sion to take over the assets and liabilities of federal employee beneficial associations whose insurance programs were jeopardized by the passage of the Federal Employees' Group Life Insurance Act of 1954. Since 1955, the Commission has assumed the liabilities and assets of 16 beneficial associations but was without funds with which to perform the job it was directed by law to accomplish. This Act authorizes the Commission to draw on the insurance reserve fund as necessary to complete the assumption of the assets and liabilities of the remaining 9 associations.

In Summary

The information presented above is an attempt to summarize in limited space the action taken by the Second Session of the 85th Congress on legislation in the federal personnel field. It does not include some 12 measures dealing with personnel management for the District of Columbia government. Also, many details of implementation and administration have necessarily been omitted. It is hoped, however, that the above inventory will be useful as a reference guide, and that those personnel administrators and students interested in further information will refer to the basic acts.

Rehiring the Retiring . . .

The Governor's Retirement Study Commission is going to take a good look at the re-employment of retired state, county, and municipal employees by the governing agency which retired them in the first place. The 1957 legislature repealed the \$1200 limit on a retired employee's earnings upon retirement at age 65.

Under the former law, no retired employee could keep his pension and also earn more than \$1200 a year working for the state or a local unit of government participating in the Wisconsin Retirement Fund.

Under the present law, an employee may be retired and rehired 30 days later with no limit on his earnings and no effect on his pension. Some members of the commission are concerned about discriminatory and public relations problems if this authority is abused by the various public employers.—
From The Wisconsin State Employee.

Personnel Panorama—1958:

II. U.S. State and Local and Canadian Developments

Keith Ocheltree

A new look has been given to many areas in the U.S. personnel field; in Canada, a broad re-examination is in progress.

ALTHOUGH the business recession of 1958 eased public personnel problems somewhat in the areas of turnover and pressures for salary increases, as well as recruitment for some categories, there were still enough problems to keep the personnel man busy. More jurisdictions adopted the merit system, and the number of public employees continued to increase. In addition, the public personnel man was experimenting with new administrative arrangements, while continuing to give considerable attention to new techniques of recruitment and training and developing new approaches to employee relations and matters of employee welfare.

Increases in Number of Merit Systems

The observance of the 75th Anniversary of Civil Service in the State of New York and New York City was accompanied by continued growth in the merit system all over the country. According to the American Federation of State, County, and Municipal Employees, only 11 states, 5 counties, and 500 cities had merit systems in 1936. Today, in 24 states the majority of state employees have civil service protection, and in an additional 5, a substantial number are covered. In addition, 745 cities over 10,000 population have substantial civil service coverage.

The number of employees in state and local jurisdictions also continue to rise. Municipalities now employ more than 1½ million persons and, following the federal government and school districts, constitute the third largest group of public employers. About 70 per cent of city employees earn between \$3000 and \$6000 annually and all but 5 per cent of full-time employees are

now covered by some kind of retirement system.

Fewer Pay Increases

The year 1958 also brought a reduction in the rate at which general pay increases were granted to public employees. According to the PPA semiannual pay surveys, fewer over-all pay raises were given during the first 6 months of 1958 as compared with the same period during 1957. The percentage of local jurisdictions which granted general raises decreased from about 37 per cent to under 20 per cent.

Administrative Changes

Jurisdictions continued to seek ways of improving the administration of their personnel programs. A report on personnel management in the State of Connecticut called for increased emphasis on the selection and development of managerial personnel, the establishment of a personnel advisory committee to work with the personnel director, and the setting up of personnel committees in each agency with more than 300 employees. The study also recommended improvements in the state's classification and pay plans, provision for education leave, and in-service training for the examination and classification staffs. In New York State, a revised civil service law will go into effect in 1959. The new act makes no sweeping changes but replaces the Act of 1909 which had grown cumbersome because of many amendments.

Pennsylvania became the first state to install a large-scale electronic computing system. The installation will first be used in processing the entire state payroll and will later be used for retirement system account-

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

ing and record keeping, central personnel data processing, tax accounting, storage inventories, and other general accounting and complex record-keeping functions. Fifteen persons from various state agencies have already been trained in the use of the system.

A novel approach to many problems of personnel administration was inaugurated by the city of Phoenix, Arizona. The city has put into operation a mobile personnel service office to bring safety, in-service training, medical-examination, and counseling programs to employees. The reconverted bus is also used for recruitment and testing programs. The bus will be taken to places where people congregate such as the state fair, shopping centers, and sports events.

Although industrial unemployment eased recruiting problems somewhat, many kinds of employees continued to be in short supply during 1958, requiring increased emphasis on recruitment programs. Both San Diego and Oakland, California resorted to nationwide recruitment for police jobs. Oakland secured 1400 applicants for police jobs as the result of its program under which an interview team traveled through the country to interview applicants and, in some cases, to conduct a complete examination program. San Diego sent interview teams to Chicago to interview candidates who passed the examination and also made intensive use of classified ads, radio and television spots, and similar publicity techniques.

More jurisdictions liberalized age restrictions in order to provide a wider recruitment base and, especially, to take advantage of the skills of older people. The Denver Career Service Authority dropped the age limit of 50 for laborers; a physical agility test is now being given in the belief that this is a better method for determining ability to do the job. Rockford, Illinois has adopted a variable minimum age for male city employees under which the minimum age will be reduced from 21 to 18 whenever feasible. Wayne County, Michigan reported success on lifting age limits on nearly 1000 classes in recent years, including most nurses, civil engineers, cooks, airport maintenance workers, and therapists. In this connection it is interesting to note that youthful applicants were often found to be lacking a knowledge of

grammar, spelling, and arithmetic. Older workers on the other hand were more stable and more punctual.

Residence requirements have also been liberalized by several agencies. Wayne County, Michigan allows county employees to reside in any of the four adjacent counties as well as in Wayne County and has opened its examinations to residents of the five-county area, with the exception of candidates for law enforcement positions. The Arlington County, Virginia Employees Advisory Council has proposed that policemen and firemen be required to reside within 15 miles of Arlington County, rather than in Virginia, and within 15 miles of the courthouse. Under the proposed change, policemen and firemen could live in Maryland or in the District of Columbia. The city of Portland, Maine has reported that the caliber of applicants for positions in the fire and police departments has improved since residence requirements were waived in 1956.

More jurisdictions have also adopted the practice of recruiting inexperienced persons and training them for technical jobs in scarce categories. New York State will fill positions in 15 beginning level professional classes by means of one-year traineeships after which trainees will automatically reach professional level starting salaries. St. Louis has also established a training classification for professional, scientific, technical, and administrative positions to make up for the lack of sufficient numbers of trained persons to succeed to these positions when vacated. Training rates may vary from 20 to 80 per cent of the established scale for the related positions. Trainees must pass a promotional examination in order to receive regular fulltime employment at the completion of their training period.

The city of Milwaukee, Wisconsin reported that the police apprenticeship program inaugurated in 1952 has been successful in bringing young men into the department by recruiting them at the time of graduation from high school. At present, 48 apprentices receive a full year of training which includes typing, shorthand, and other office subjects. After the first year, the apprentices are assigned to full-time duty on a rotating basis. They are members of

the pension plan and wear a distinctive uniform and a special badge.

New York City has adopted a seven-point program which will bring city operating departments and agencies into the examination process. The personnel department retains the decision-making power but line agencies are given the opportunity to make suggestions. The personnel department consults with the line agencies on such matters as statements of duties, minimum qualifications, and weights, scope, form, and dates of examinations. The city has also continued the practice of asking for operating agency appraisals of each examination following its administration.

The Puerto Rico Office of Personnel is one of the recent agencies to eliminate separate tests for classes requiring a college degree but no experience. A single mental ability test is used for all classes, and applicants may apply for as many jobs as they are qualified for, indicating the order of their preference. A single employment list is established, and a candidate may be certified for more than one class of positions at the same time.

The District of Columbia has recognized the importance of emotional factors to job success by employing a psychiatrist to screen applicants for the police and fire departments, to treat men with emotional problems, and to advise the retirement board on cases involving disability for mental illness.

Employee Training

The importance of employee training to a well-rounded personnel program continues to be recognized by more and more public personnel agencies. The State of Maryland is the latest among the larger agencies to create the post of Director of Training.

Interest in programs of executive development continues to increase. Connecticut State sponsored a series of 10 sessions on "The American Economy and Its Relationship to State Government Administration" in which 40 top-level career administrators participated. The Ford Foundation granted New York City and New York University \$250,000 to initiate a program for the development of executive and middle man-

agement personnel in municipal agencies in the Metropolitan New York area. The program will be administered jointly by the Graduate School of Public Administration and Social Service of New York University in the Personnel Department of the City of New York.

Public safety departments continue to be among the most training-minded of all governmental agencies. San Jose City College in California is offering courses in modern firefighting techniques in cooperation with the city of San Jose and fire chiefs in the San Mateo and Santa Clara County communities. The principal goal of this program is to develop courses which will prepare untrained men for fire department duties. Also, in California, the Monterey Bay Division of the League of California Cities has established a police training school to serve about a dozen small cities in the area. The Wisconsin State Board of Vocational and Adult Education has developed a training program for fire service personnel throughout the state. The Georgia State Vocational Training Program is sponsoring an itinerant school to provide training for policemen in communities throughout the state, in cooperation with the Peace Officers Association.

Training in general public administration continues to receive considerable attention. New Jersey State is expanding its evening college program to include an associate degree in arts with specialization in public administration for public employees who do not have college training in the field. The Fels Institute of Local and State Government in Philadelphia has established a 9-month full-time in-service course for public employees leading to a master of governmental administration degree. Trainees will be nominated by their employing agencies and the Institute will arrange for internships between the Institute and the employing agency following the course. The California State Personnel Board will pay tuition for employees taking scientific, technical, professional, and management courses which cannot be obtained as in-service training and are of direct value to the state. The State of New Mexico is the latest to provide public administration internships as a part of its personnel program.

Employee Relations

Unions are playing an increasingly important role in the employee relations of public personnel agencies. A survey by the New York City Department of Labor revealed that of the 500 U. S. cities of 25,000 or more population, 272 have employee unions, and 75 report a checkoff of union dues. The checkoff is, of course, most common in the larger cities.

New York City employees now have many of the same bargaining rights as employees in private industry, as a result of an executive order issued by the mayor early in the year. These rights include that of joining an organization, the selection of an exclusive bargaining agent to negotiate on terms and conditions of employment and to handle grievances. No form of compulsory union membership is allowed. At the same time, minority unions retain the right to present their views and to present requests of members to city officials.

Under the provisions of this executive order, the Uniformed Sanitation Mens Association, an affiliate of the International Brotherhood of Teamsters, became the first union of municipal employees to be recognized by the city as the exclusive bargaining representative for its members.

The Rhode Island legislature adopted a law which recognizes the right of state employees to organize and, at the same time, created a commission to study the possibility of mediation and arbitration procedures for public employees.

On the other side of the ledger, the Alabama Supreme Court upheld the Solomon act of 1953 which prohibited state employees from membership in labor unions. The U. S. Supreme Court had refused to rule on the act. Suit was brought by the American Federation of State, County, and Municipal Employees on the grounds that the act violated the 14th Amendment to the Constitution.

More jurisdictions adopted suggestion and incentive award programs. One of the power plants in the Tennessee Valley Authority has adopted a slightly different approach in that suggestions are requested on specific problems each week. The plan has created considerable enthusiasm among employees, al-

though administrators of the plan found that the problems listed need to be very specific in order to get usable responses. The Province of Alberta has been added to the list of jurisdictions which administer a suggestion program for their employees. The Alberta program will be administered by an award board whose membership will include two nominees of the Provincial Executive of the Civil Service Association of Alberta.

The city of San Diego, California, sought to increase employee understanding of the way in which pay policies are developed by sending a two-page letter to each employee. The letter explained what is meant by the basic jobs used in the survey, points out why rates for skilled trades must be lower than those for private employment because of job security, fringe benefits, etc. The letter also explains the very important matter of pay relationships among classes.

The U. S. Army Signal Corps Supply Agency in Philadelphia has established an Employee Assistance Committee which counsels employees with personal problems, assists employees on extended sick-leave, and helps families of deceased employees. The committee is composed of one representative from each major organization of the agency, and it maintains working relationships with other community agencies.

Employee Health and Welfare

In New York State, arrangements have been made by the temporary health insurance board to make employees of local subdivisions in New York eligible for participation in the health insurance program for state employees. More than 200,000 local employees are affected. New York State has also approved the plan of health insurance coverage for persons who retired from the state service prior to December 5, 1957. The retiree's share of the cost of the plan is deducted from his retirement allowance, and to be eligible he must have had at least 5 years of state service.

More agencies have initiated programs of group life and health insurance. In Oregon, a group health insurance program has been made available to employees of Oregon cities under sponsorship of the League of Ore-

gon Cities. A new group life insurance plan for Wisconsin state employees will go into effect on January 1, 1959. The Province of British Columbia has also established a medical insurance program for Provincial employees and their families to which the government contributes one-half the cost.

Forecast

The foregoing are representative of the developments of the past year. Further developments and more new solutions to emerging problems can be expected during 1959, especially in the areas of labor relations, the organization of the personnel function, and employee welfare and benefits.

Canadian Federal Service*

Toward the end of 1957, the Civil Service Commission, at the request of the government of Canada, began a comprehensive review of the Civil Service Act and Regulations, and an examination of the role of the Commission in the machinery of government. This project has been under way during the past year and the Commissioners' report to the government will have been made when this issue of *Public Personnel Review* appears.

The findings of the Commission, and their recommendations for legislative changes, will presumably be reviewed by the government of Canada early in 1959, and the government will then decide whether or not to make the Commissioners' report public. Thus it is not possible to give an outline of these proposals at this time. It may, however, be of interest to readers to know something of the Commissioners' method in this project.

Review of Civil Service Legislation

The first phase of this review involved a thorough study by Commission staff officers

* Editor's Note: The material describing developments in the Canadian Federal Service was contributed by G. A. Blackburn, Assistant Director, Planning and Development, Civil Service Commission, Canada. A fuller treatment was contemplated but was made impossible because of an explosion which completely wrecked the Jackson Building in Ottawa, where the Civil Service Commission had been housed.

of all operations of the Commission. This study yielded a detailed, but tentative, outline of the principles, policies, and procedures which it was felt should govern the performance of the personnel function in the Civil Service of Canada.

Meanwhile, the personnel heads of departments and agencies (Deputy Ministers) were asked to consider their problems and make suggestions for solution. Over 20 departments submitted detailed briefs and, in a series of meetings, nearly all Deputy Heads discussed these briefs with the Commissioners. As a consequence of this "departmental" phase, the Commissioners revised their views on many facets of the personnel function and made appropriate changes in the outline of principles, policies, and procedures.

The principal employee associations were also asked to submit their proposals. These associations did a great deal of work in preparing reasoned briefs, and, subsequently, they met with the Commissioners to discuss their representations in detail.

At this stage the Secretariat, established for this project, undertook a detailed study of the civil service legislation of most of the English speaking countries of the world—searching for ideas and the fruits of experience of other jurisdictions. At the same time, Commissioners paid personal visits to the United Kingdom and the United States to observe at first hand the administration of the personnel functions in these countries.

The Commissioners again reviewed and modified the outline of principles, policies, and procedures in the light of the knowledge gained from discussions with employees and the study of practices in other jurisdictions at home and abroad.

The Commissioners' Report

As 1958 came to a close, the Commissioners prepared a detailed statement of the provisions which they felt should govern personnel administration in the Canadian Civil Service. This statement is the heart of the Commissioners' report to the government.

The report sets forth in great detail the Commission's views on the fundamental principles which should govern federal personnel management and should, therefore,

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

be contained in the law. In addition, the report contains detailed proposals on policy and procedure to control day-to-day business and long-term planning. These latter proposals would be contained in regulations and Commission directives.

If the government accepts the proposals of the Commission, the next step will be the drafting of a bill for a new or revised Civil

Service Act for consideration by Parliament. If Parliament sees fit to approve such a bill, the Civil Service Regulations will then be revised. The final phase will, of course, be the implementation of such of the Commission's proposals as are accepted by Parliament and the government. This will, it is hoped, provide material for a story in "Personnel Panorama—1959."

Double Your File Space . . .

When typing an answer to a letter, use the back of the letter for your duplicate copy. This saves you a sheet of stationery, saves space in the filing cabinet, and simplifies your record system tremendously. You have the letter and a copy of your reply in one sheet. In addition, when you insert the sheets in the typewriter, be sure the letter you're using as a duplicate sheet faces you right side up so that, if necessary, you can read the content as you type the reply.—Idea of The Month from *The Civil Service Reporter*, The Philippines.

Instead of putting a copy of every form letter in the file of addresses, the New York Stock Exchange simply files a single copy of the form letter with its master mailing list.

* * *

Records control experts say there's only one relatively easy way to deal with paperwork: Practice "birth control" for office paper. Keep excess records from coming into being by cutting out needless forms, reports, and duplicates.

Don't clutter up expensive office space with "inactive" records. Move them to low-cost storage. Keep only "active" records close at hand, but file them so they can be reached at a moment's notice.

Remember that paper is used to transmit information. Keep it moving smoothly through the organization.

Most important, maintain daily supervision. The one-shot, meat-ax approach to house cleaning is spectacular. But it doesn't work. Three months later the ax has to be honed again. Daily attention to records is needed.—From *Business Week*, October, 1957.

Designing Public Service To Meet Modern Needs

John W. Macy, Jr.

A thoughtful address keynoting the 1958 International Conference of the Public Personnel Association.

DO THE PRINCIPLES and techniques of public personnel administration possess the vitality to support the rapidly accelerating demand for government services at every level?

Are personnel staffs and agencies equipped to man the modern institutions of democratic government?

Can traditional means attract and retain an ever higher quality of human skill required by today's public programs?

Have the already constructed career systems the dynamic and responsive character to initiate and foster the critical changes necessitated by evolving public policy?

Can the image of public service be brightened and heightened in the eyes of the citizen and taxpayer?

Can modern public service be the viable and continuing core of popular government in the free world?

In the accepted manner of the keynote speaker, these questions are, of course, rhetorical, and the like-minded and loyal audience is expected to respond with a vigorous affirmative to each and every one. But a keynoter in Chicago is at a serious disadvantage. For here is the happy vale of keynoters. With calendar-like regularity, every 4 years, at least once and sometimes more often, the air is filled with flamboyant political phrases, with ear-catching slogans, and with pile on pile of purple phrases. In fact, when the wind is from the southwest, the Loop is still knee-deep in the charged words of keynoters. Perhaps it is this wind from the keynoter's vocabulary that provides the city with its classic label.

In such an atmosphere my message suffers from colorful competition, but in all its

pallor I hope it may produce a comparable clamor for successful action within "this great party for the better public service." And we are, within the circle of this Assembly-Association, a party of many parts and interests, but dedicated to a common cause of international dimensions. We are commissioners, part-time and full-time, personnel administrators and directors, technicians in the personnel trade, representatives of citizen groups and employee organizations, and visitors from distant lands. Our binding cause is the promotion of ever improved public service as the action instrument of free governments. Thus, at our 1958 conference, it seems fitting to pursue a keynote theme with the slightly pretentious title: "Designing Public Service To Meet Modern Needs."

In my search for substance with which to construct my optimistic case in pursuit of this theme, I repeated a familiar experience: the encounter with a mounting literature of thought and words (some even my own) already expressed at meetings such as this. I point this out now, as advance admission, that "what you are about to hear is *not* new, fresh, and revolutionary." It is only hoped that the casting of these ideas in the current context may stimulate fruitful reappraisal and action.

Personnel Man Must Lengthen His Stride

Public personnel administration in virtually every jurisdiction is seriously challenged in the demands placed upon it to provide the human factor to a broad and ever-changing range of public programs. The pace of change has been stepped up immeasurably. To maintain this pace the personnel manager must lengthen his stride and carry his share of the new burdens of public

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

administration or become a burden himself. To avoid the generalities and clichés lurking in the usual discussion of "stride-lengthening" or modernization, I would like to offer, with your indulgence, an array of specific steps that might be considered as key elements in such an advance:

1. Take the Final Steps Toward Merit System Goals

The promotion of this step reveals a basic and emotional bias toward the selection, for public employment, of the best qualified in free, unrestricted competition. On this issue, we can reinstate the evangelical fervor offered by Curtis, Schurz, and Dorman. But to their moral motivation we can add the modern demand for the highest skills in a vast variety of occupations. And that objective of so many years ago has *not* been fully achieved. Many state and local governments still staff essential services with individuals sporting political qualifications as a prime asset. Even the federal government has been unable to clear the final hurdles to an optimum merit system coverage. In fact, significant federal appointments in every American community, those for the postmaster and rural carrier, are made under the guise of civil service when in truth a political test is applied. This type of hypocrisy, tolerated by all recent administrations, severely damages public confidence in the merit system and hampers efforts to attract well-qualified persons to public service.

This "last mile to merit" must be traveled. These remaining weak spots must be eliminated if a stronger service is to be developed.

2. Promote Recognition of Management Responsibility for Personnel Administration

Although there has been a growing trend toward direct executive involvement in the formulation of personnel policy, this trend has not moved rapidly enough. A "separateness" of the personnel function is still, in many jurisdictions, a prevalent pattern. This condition results in the failure of the line official to accept, as part of his management responsibility, the personnel function within his organization. New political executives

frequently believe that fundamental personnel decisions, often of critical importance to the success of the program they administer, must be made by others outside or on the fringe of their jurisdiction.

The ultimate operating success of any merit system is dependent upon the support and participation of responsible managers. An inherent distrust of these managers on the part of the administrators of merit systems can never breed constructive personnel policy or operations.

If these managers are spawned in the stream of a career system, the personnel agency shares responsibility for their acceptance and understanding of the values of personnel decisions based on merit. Where these managers are appointed from private life by political authority, it is increasingly important that management skills and an acceptance of the existing personnel system be among the criteria for selection. In every public jurisdiction there is a growing need for more considered selection and more comprehensive training for those who will exercise the high-level responsibilities of public management.

3. Strengthen the Policy Leadership of Personnel Agencies

If line management is to assume a broader participative role in personnel decision-making this objective becomes increasingly essential. The personnel agency, as staff advisor to the chief executive and his line managers, must possess not only a high degree of professional expertise but knowledgeable, creative, and forceful leadership. This is particularly important in the non-career, politically appointive posts, whether they be filled by commissioners or single directors.

The total personnel program is too vital to the success of public business to be the responsibility of those without experience in the management of large organizations, understanding of public institutions and relationships, and knowledge of fundamental principles of personnel management. Although the well-intentioned and motivated amateur may eventually learn his function and keep out of trouble, the current demand cannot afford such passive leadership nor

the lost time devoted to high-level training courses.

These are not posts to which the faithful party worker can be assigned by the top executive; he can ill-afford the risks involved. His administrative record should be judged by the quality of his appointees to these positions. Perhaps there is need—although at this late date one wonders why—for stated qualifications standards to assist appointing officials in selecting personnel leadership and for clearer identification of sources from which qualified talent can be drawn.

But we should not overlook the continuing requirement to strengthen and broaden the professional talents of the career staff in these agencies. Significant progress has been made in the past generation. The quality of training and literature has been raised. The development of techniques has been improved. But even this attention cannot be relaxed. With manpower problems developing new complexities on one hand and the social science disciplines revealing new findings on the other, the personnel technician is faced with an ever-widening horizon if he is to serve effectively as policy advisor to managers and as operating consultant to first-line supervisors. It is in this area where our Association, with its conferences and its publications, can contribute substantially to this continuing drive for greater professional stature.

4. Emphasize Quality at Every Stage

The reformers emphasized "merit," the management consultants "efficiency and economy," and the political scientists "representative bureaucracy" and "executive responsibility." It is small wonder that the man or woman faced with the day-to-day duty of administering a personnel program finds slight confusion in his operating goals. Obviously, all of these emphases have a place, but in my judgment the emphasis on *quality* frequently tends to be lost in a maze of policies, regulations, and procedures.

The competitive examination itself was originally designed to identify individuals of superior qualifications for public service. But what is frequently overlooked in the administration of the examining system is

the necessity for attracting to the examinations those of superior qualifications.

In our modern competitive society, with shortage skills in continually heavy demand, the recruitment phase of the examining process assumes even greater importance. In certain jurisdictions it can probably be demonstrated that higher-quality candidates are deterred from public service by the necessity of facing an examination when alternate employment opportunities, of equal or greater status, do not require this hurdle prior to appointment.

So, in attracting the skills required for modern government, the recruiting campaign must be developed quantitatively and qualitatively, and the competitive examining processes evaluated with penetrating and objective analysis to ascertain whether they truly serve their intended purpose.

But the search for quality should not cease with the oath of office. Unfortunately, many a merit system appears to terminate at that point. Promotion, training, and incentive programs should be tailored in such a fashion as to identify the best qualified and to provide them with significant recognition.

The reverse of this objective should not be overlooked. Are public agencies sufficiently scrupulous in identifying and weeding out the inadequately qualified and the non-producer? I fear that many of us have been far too glib in claiming that our complicated procedures for the protection of the inadequate really function to improve the quality of the service. Far too many restrictions are imposed upon the supervisor in this regard. Many an operating official has lost his confidence in the personnel program and confidence in his own supervisory ability through the frustrations involved in transferring or terminating the low-quality employee.

5. Assure Responsiveness of Career Services

In the past 40 years, radical changes have taken place in the dimensions and character of the public service. My summer reading has included a detailed study of the penetrating history of the U. S. Civil Service

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

written by Paul Van Riper. Viewing the expansion and evolution of the federal service from this deep historical perspective, I was impressed more than ever with the dramatic changes wrought in recent history.

Comments have frequently been made about the phenomenal growth of the public service since World War I. But equally impressive has been the significant institutional benefits provided for this expanding body of civil servants. Statute after statute has provided greater protection for those on the public payroll. These benefits and protections have been strongly supported as necessary conditions of employment to make the public service comparable with progressive employers in private enterprise. All of this represents proper management recognition of the necessity for a personnel system which must remain currently competitive.

But the combination of big government created to meet public necessity and greater tenure and protection for the individual employee creates a potent power bloc within the framework of democratic government. The very continuity of career personnel in a myriad of governmental activities affecting the citizen in many areas of his daily life constitutes a power far beyond the dreams of the early reformers. This power, if exercised by the group possessing it in its own interests, may produce conditions that in the long run would be hostile to basic democratic principles.

A strong and self-satisfied career core, regardless of how expert, may assume its own goals are identical to those of the citizen-taxpayer. Or it may become a braking or obstructing force to popular drives for change. Serious students of the present stage of public personnel development are expressing concern lest the permanent civil service create an environment resistant to change and creative progress.

I have the strong conviction that such negative conditions never need to develop as long as the civil service, collectively and individually, is responsive to popularly elected leadership. Such responsiveness is frequently difficult to demonstrate within the framework of existing legal or administrative restrictions. The career administrator is frequently cast in the role of constantly

advising political executives as to what they *cannot* do.

The requirement, it seems to me, calls for leadership throughout the bureaucracy with administrative instruments sensitive to shifts in program, either in emphasis or content, introduced by political leadership. Those exercising personnel responsibilities in public organizations can assist in the design and construction of such instruments and can train their fellow public servants in responding to the policy readings in an appropriate manner.

6. Increased Concentration on the Individual at the Worksite

Technological change, whether you call it automation or something else, provides the personnel administrator with a fresh opportunity for assisting in the re-engineering of a large mass of public jobs. This opportunity should be gratefully accepted as a means for creating more work situations which are centered on the individual worker.

With a generally higher educational level existent in the future labor market, the worker will seek employment where the content of the work is more meaningful, and where the work environment is more satisfying. Increased pay, benefits, or rest-rooms will not be enough. Concern for the work itself will increase and there should be preparation in government to meet that concern.

In adapting the principles of mass production to many government operations, there has been a destruction of many possibilities for human satisfaction in the work. In fact, the unattractive image held by large segments of the citizenry of the public servant is in the drab and uninspiring colors of routine clerical work. The escape from routine, although less efficient at first, should lead to greater productivity as well as higher satisfaction.

7. Advance on the Personnel Research Frontiers

Cecil Goode, in the Association's publication, *Personnel Research Frontiers*, provides eloquent support for this objective. It is clear from his survey that research effort in

the personnel field forms a vast undeveloped territory for personnel staffs. It is clear from his findings that many existing programs of public personnel have been launched and supported without the critical fact-finding and analysis required to support such action. There has been an attempt to answer the question, "Why is there so little attention to the personnel problems of government when all levels of government represent 1/5th of the nation's manpower, and when government is assuming such an important place in our scheme of things?" None of the answers to this question are particularly encouraging or flattering. And it is all too evident that public agencies and interested private organizations must focus far greater attention on the use of the tools of research in solving future problems.

8. Enhance Public Service Prestige

This perennial objective should not be allowed to wear out. The extensive efforts undertaken by federal, New York State, and New York City officials in connection with the 75th anniversary of their civil service systems have effectively called public attention to the traditions, values, and needs of public service.

But when the last anniversary candle is blown out these efforts should be renewed rather than forgotten. Government leaders and their personnel and information staffs need to broaden their channels of communication to all opinion-forming media. No segment of the American community is too small to be neglected in the process of reporting government operations.

In recent months I have been obliged, in pursuing a new career, to become acquainted with publications previously beyond my immediate interest. One such publication, *The Educational Review*, published by the American Council on Education, contained in its April issue a brief report of recent research into college student attitudes toward various careers in terms of their ranking on an ethical scale. Nearly 2,000 students were asked, "In which (occupation) do you think you would have to 'conform' the least and make the fewest concessions with your personal beliefs?" I was distressed by the responses. Government service was listed 10th

in the ranking of 13 occupations with only labor organization and politics given a lower ranking.

From my own recent association with the college generation I have found this value judgment confirmed and the existence of the well-known unfavorable stereotypes of the public service.

There is no easy solution to this problem of public prestige. Prestige will be elevated through more complete understanding of public programs, through improved attitudes and performance by individual public servants dealing with their customers, through public management alertness in conveying an affirmative regard for public work to their own subordinates, and through continuing demonstration that public servants are proud of their identification with public programs and are fully aware of their basic obligation to the people themselves.

The Challenge and the Opportunity

Perhaps these eight objectives constitute too immense a design for public personnel administration. But the magnitude of the needs to be served is immense. It is hoped that in sounding these eight keys in this keynote address I have provided a sufficiently provocative introduction to worthwhile discussion at this conference and to subsequent action in jurisdictions everywhere.

Public personnel administration is faced with the challenge and the opportunity to answer affirmatively the questions with which I opened if it can combine its powers of self-criticism and action in pursuit of these objectives. So, in summary, may we proceed to take the final steps toward merit system goals, to promote recognition of management responsibility for personnel administration, to strengthen the policy leadership of personnel agencies, to emphasize quality at every stage, to assure responsiveness of career services, to increase concentration on the individual at the worksite, to advance on the personnel research frontiers, and to enhance public service prestige. This, then, might be a public service design to meet modern needs.

Selective Placement in Hiring the Handicapped

Jack Pockrass

Experience resulting from employing handicapped workers has proved to the Air Force that these workers, properly placed, can be major assets.

INCREASING ACCEPTANCE by industrial employers of the physically handicapped as an integral and valuable part of the workforce and the labor market is due in large part to the diligent salesmanship of public and private organizations. This includes both those directly concerned with rehabilitation, such as the U. S. Veterans Administration, National and State Vocational Rehabilitation agencies, veteran, fraternal, and union organizations, and those actively engaged in promotional activities, such as the President's Committee and Governors' Committees on Employment of the Physically Handicapped, the American Federation for the Physically Handicapped, Federal and State Employment Services, to name but a few. Civil service and merit system agencies find themselves exercising a significant promotion role in assuring equitable consideration of the disabled in recruiting for the staffing of public agencies at all levels of government.

The payoff on rehabilitation and promotional activities is obviously the actual employment, practical utilization, and career retention of the physically handicapped as productive employees. These observations based on experiences in staff promotion work within one of the largest federal agencies may furnish some useful guides—both for the promoter and the utilizer. The Air Force now employs in the United States about 23,000 handicapped male and female civilians—all hired within requirements of civil service law and regulation. Many air bases, large and small, have received recognition from local, state, and national organizations for the quality and substance in their employment practices concerning utilization of the handicapped. Many public agencies can do as well or better!

The Intangible Considerations

While those engaged in rehabilitation placement activities, who do the face-to-face selling of handicapped individuals, rather than abstract principles, to prospective employers, must occasionally resort to emotional appeals, program promotion has been most successful on a continuing basis when geared to practical business-like considerations. Those agencies responsible for carrying out governmental activities are primarily concerned with getting their mission or jobs done.

They may be sympathetically aware that employment of the physically handicapped helps morale and psychological rehabilitation of such individuals; that useful employment contributes toward strengthening family unity and may reduce welfare expenditures; that such constructive employment improves the community's economy by converting dependents into taxpayers. Such appreciation may be a motivating factor in obtaining support for charitable enterprises, but are more properly considered as beneficial byproducts where productive employment is the prime consideration.

The following considerations—which reflect a practical Air Force point of view—are more likely to have some impact:

A. As in the case of other employers, the Air Force is concerned with labor market or manpower resources. With the present substantially full employment, any significant National Emergency calls for maximum availability of able-bodied manpower for military mobilization, for civilian logistic support of military installations and industrial contractors, as well as simultaneous manning of the civilian economy.

B. We are concerned that the communities in which air bases are located have a good impression of the Air Force as an

employer. A reputation for fairness in employment and management practices means better quality recruitment and lower turnover. A stabilized civilian workforce has a definite bearing on quality, effectiveness, and responsiveness in meeting military logistic support needs. The cost factors of recruitment, training investment, and excessive turnover are practical considerations for all employers, whether profit or service is the objective. Publicized studies clearly show that properly placed physically handicapped are equally or more productive than fellow-employees, and that they have better attendance and safety records. The built-in motivation responsible for such performance can be easily recognized.

C. The emotional factors previously mentioned can be reoriented in terms of recognition of community needs and objectives. Industry places a high dollar and cents value on "good will." For the Air Force, closer identification of the military installation with the community means better community relations. This can be translated in terms of local and national acceptance, understanding, and support. Any public agency will benefit by having similar public understanding and public support for its activities.

The Practical Considerations

However real may be the cumulative benefits of these intangible considerations, it is the utilizer who must be convinced that he is not making charitable gestures.

The attitudes of line supervisors confronted with production goals, deadlines, and voluminous service requirements may be summarized somewhat elegantly as: "Let the Boss (Administrator, Bureau Chief, Division Chief, Superintendent, Director, etc.) worry about such high level matters as budget support for the agency, tax structure, economics, welfare, and labor market statistics—I've got a job to do!"

The higher echelons of management may be better equipped or oriented to relate their over-all mission to the intangible considerations, and their overt support is essential for program promotion within their jurisdictions—and they, too, have the same jobs to be done. Their concern may be expressed in terms of "limitations of civil serv-

ice hiring practices," "budgetary limitations," or "rigid staffing patterns." They imply that employment of disabled persons either cannot be done under civil service regulations and examining standards, or that such practice would bring in substandard employees, thereby increasing operating costs and/or requiring additional people to get the same work done.

Such doubts are understandable but can be dispelled. Except for a handful of very top level jobs, Air Force civilian employment in the United States is completely under federal civil service law and regulations. Appropriations and civilian strength are successively controlled by congressional and administrative limitations. While manning may be increased during an emergency period, it is invariably followed by extensive reductions in force. Manpower utilization is under constant surveillance both within and outside the Department to assure that each manpower space is being used only for essential functions. As new requirements arise, spaces are taken away from those functions having the lowest priority.

Accordingly, Air Force supervisors are personally concerned that each employee is fully qualified and capable of full production. It is assumed that such motivation is present in supervisors of all agencies regardless of mission.

There is increasing evidence that civil service and merit system agencies are taking steps to remove legislative and administrative provisions which represent unfair or unintentional barriers to competing for civil service jobs. Additional progress is being made gradually to provide equipment or services to enable such candidates to compete on more even terms with other competitors. A pruning job is also being done in many jurisdictions to eliminate physical requirements actually unrelated to job requirements or working conditions. The proper emphasis is equality of opportunity in employment, not preference.

The most difficult part of the educational job to be done, if there is to be real payoff, is to reach those responsible for daily supervision and management of employees. In some agencies the line supervisor may also have responsibility and authority for hiring all or some of his subordinate employees.

But even if hiring authority rests above the line supervisor, it is his attitudes that will determine the extent to which the handicapped can be employed, will be used properly, or will be retained. The using supervisor, as the customer, can and should have a lot to say about what qualifications he needs for his jobs, what kind of performance will be acceptable, and what work or employee he considers least essential. It was recognition of these "facts of life" which led the Air Force to develop a film¹ designed to give line supervisors a better appreciation, through dramatic and more routine demonstration, of what was being done by selective placement throughout the Air Force to utilize the skills' assets of the handicapped.

The Opportunities

The educational job is by no means limited to conditioning negative attitudes or battling prejudices. These may not exist at the conscious level to any noticeable degree. One is just as likely to encounter sympathetic attitudes and the query as to what opportunity there is for the handicapped to be considered for civil service employment, or possibly encounter an attitude of disinterest expressed in terms of very limited occasion even to be concerned with considering a handicapped individual. This latter attitude may be widespread in terms of higher management levels.

The following will help focus the realities which demand that the administrative staffs of the merit system agency and the public agencies it serves give more than passing attention to these aspects of public employment and personnel management.

Veteran Preference. It is safe to assume that there is provision for veteran preference in all civil service and merit system regulations. Legislation and regulation normally provide further for absolute or enhanced priority in consideration be given disabled veterans. Accordingly, it may be expected for several years that there will be significant numbers of eligibles certified who will have a variety of physical handicaps

and may be entitled to priority consideration because of disablement! It is important that selective placement techniques be used to assure the most effective, productive placement.

Elimination of Age Limitations. The federal Service has already eliminated age limitations in employment for all occupations. With medical advances and the known aging of the population, increasing pressures may be anticipated for continued raising and ultimate elimination of age limits in other governmental jurisdictions. With the longer life span, we may anticipate increasing numbers of candidates with various physical limitations.

It is again important that the examination and/or selection and placement processes utilize selective placement techniques to assure that legitimate job requirements are met by candidates, and, conversely, that physical limitations which do not hinder job performance do not bar such candidates or eligibles from opportunity to compete for employment consideration in the public service.

Appointments Pending Examination. In periods of full employment, with heavy competition from industry or higher salaries being offered by various private or public organizations which have greater flexibility in adjusting wage scales to meet or outbid competitors, civil service registers are rapidly depleted and examination announcements are not always sufficiently productive to meet agencies' needs. Authority is then usually given to the agency to "beat the bushes" for temporary or provisional employees.

Under these circumstances those organizations engaged in rehabilitation and/or promotion activities have the greatest opportunity to "sell" handicapped individuals who are entering or re-entering the labor market. Frankly, a general or specific manpower shortage results in better opportunity for employment consideration. This is the best time for all these organizations, whether rehabilitation, promotion, and/or employing agency, to use demonstration techniques most effectively in obtaining understanding and enthusiastic support. An extended emergency period also gives the rehabilitators and promoters long-range opportunity for posi-

¹ Air Force Manual 40-1 Program Supplement 25, titled, "Who's Handicapped," USAF Motion Picture Film No. SF-397.

tive vocational guidance and training to prepare the severely handicapped for profitable employment.

Non-Veteran Handicapped Population. When we refer to the physically handicapped, there is probably a tendency to think in terms of severe disabilities of the obvious type such as amputees, the blind, or paraplegics. These represent the more difficult types to place, but there is a wide range of disabilities present in our typical population. For example, current Air Force statistics show that, of the over 22,000 physically handicapped employees, almost 50 per cent are non-veterans. This is interesting since just about 50 per cent of our total strength is comprised of veterans. The more commonplace handicaps of restricted vision, hearing, and motion of arms and legs, allergies, heart conditions, etc., must also be recognized as selective placement factors on a continuing basis. Supervisors must be aware of these conditions so that neither regular nor casual assignments will be made which may have adverse effects in terms of immediate injury or aggravation of certain conditions.

Incapacitated Employees. *On-the-job injuries*—Because of customary provisions in federal and state legislation for employee compensation to cover on-the-job injuries, there should be awareness that any employee so incapacitated requires special consideration. From the economics point of view as well as from the rehabilitation aspects, it is desirable that the employee be restored to productive employment as soon as medically and psychologically feasible. The nature of the injury will dictate the nature of action to be taken—whether the employee can resume the full load or an actual reassignment to another job or set of duties which he can perform effectively.

Similar consideration is needed for cases which may have been thought to warrant disability retirement. Many qualified and desirable employees who desire to continue working can be readily salvaged through selective placement.

Off-the-job incapacitation—Grim statistics of automobile accidents, the high incidence of accidents in the home, plus the fact that we are all subject to various illnesses and diseases with varying aftermaths, indicate

that we may expect a certain proportion of our employees to be incapacitated off the job. The problem and challenges for the employer are similar in most respects, the major difference being primarily that employee compensation is not involved. Management must concern itself with proper return of such individuals to the work force, short-term considerations, longer-range placement actions, and important decisions pertinent to retention or retirement. We must necessarily make ours a salvaging, not a junking, operation.

Sex Differences. Unquestionably, being of the female sex is not a handicap! The vast acceptance of women employees throughout industry and government in innumerable occupations speaks for itself in terms of non-discrimination. More than 25% of Air Force employees are women, and they are engaged in a very wide range of trade-skills as well as office-type occupations.

Nevertheless, psychological and physiological differences such as strength and endurance must be recognized as they pertain to specific job requirements. For some occupations involving such skills as finger dexterity and color perception, women have actually demonstrated consistent superiority in production. In effect, women, with the necessary skills and aptitudes, can do virtually any job a man can do—within limits of strength and configuration.

The Support and the Substance

It is evident from the foregoing that all governmental agencies, as employers do have a more than passing concern for employment and proper placement of the physically handicapped. What, then, is the most effective way of getting understanding, acceptance, support, and even enthusiasm for an active program for employing, utilizing, and retaining in productive employment sizable numbers of the physically handicapped?

Management Support. The highest level top support, the indispensable ingredient in program promotion, is available to all because the President of the United States and his top-drawer committee for employment of the physically handicapped have exercised admirable leadership for many years.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

General Maas' tireless devotion to this cause, as Chairman of the President's Committee, is a personal inspiration to all. His boundless energy, sense of humor, and globetrotting activities, despite being sightless, make him a personal "showcase."

State agencies find additional top support in their state's chief executive and the governor's committee in each state, the head of the state merit system agency, and the directors or commissioners of various state agencies. Additional support is readily found among federal agencies, industrialists, and civic leaders, and in a wide range of community activities.

In the Department of the Air Force, the air force secretary and chief of staff usually keynote major promotional and publicity activities in letters which are sent to all major commanders. Additional stimulation is given to installation commanders and top levels of military management at each air base by communication from the deputy chief of staff for personnel.

Program Substance. Annual letters, however, have limited value unless there is continuing substance. Utilizing this potent top-side support, program materials, which are the practical guides and requirements which give substance to the program, are issued by the director of civilian personnel to civilian personnel officers at the command and installation level. These issuances include policy objectives and principles which are also translated into operating guides.

At the installation level where the hiring is actually done, those members of the commander's staff primarily concerned with this activity work together as a team: the civilian personnel officer, the medical officer, and the safety officer. Since in our management philosophy we hold the line supervisor responsible for production, he is also responsible for selection. The education program, a continuing one, is then directed toward civilian and military supervisors: to get their understanding, acceptance, and support.

This educational program is not to enlist sympathy and must be sold on its merits: that it is *good business* to hire the handicapped; that, for the many reasons given, the supervisor is hiring an *asset* when he hires a handicapped employee. The careful intro-

duction into the work force of several handicapped employees attracts considerable attention and if the employee is productive and self-reliant this becomes a very effective demonstration technique. The supervisor of an efficient handicapped employee becomes your best salesman.

Program Promotion. Continuous Aspects

—The best promotion is the demonstrated need and the practical payoff. Any program which flourishes only during National Employ the Physically Handicapped Week is bound to wither quickly. Observance of NEPH Week is best used to highlight and publicize what has been done on a year-around basis. Continued effectiveness requires year-around publicity through the media of newspaper releases, participation in various community activities, and exhibits devoted to rehabilitation and utilization of the physically handicapped.

At Air Force Headquarters we include promotional materials in our personnel releases to the field. We have issued special pamphlets illustrating the effective use of the physically handicapped.

As previously mentioned, our most ambitious project was production of a motion picture film designed to orient supervisors by demonstrating the effective use of handicapped employees having a wide variety of disabilities in a wide range of occupations in different Air Force activities: combat support, research, training, administration, planning, maintenance, and logistics. This film is available in communities for showings on TV, in the theatre, and at meetings of interested groups. Copy of the film with correlated materials may be borrowed from the Civilian Personnel Office at any Air Force Base or from the Governor's Committee on Employment of the Physically Handicapped in each state capital.

Definition and Statistics—In launching and sustaining a promotional program, it may be desirable that a functional definition or practical criterion be established, so that a consistent "nose-count" can be made at any time; preferably on a continuing basis as an inherent part of the appointment process and the personnel statistics that are normally generated. Specialists in this field recognize a certain degree of confusion in definition. This is brought about in part as a

result of successful selective placement! If people are hired and trained on the basis of abilities, their disabilities are then inconsequential. They are not handicapped employees from a production point of view since they meet the same employment and performance standards.

For example, is the legless person who types "handicapped" as compared with the sightless typist? Or does the individual have to be adept at typing with the toes or some stylus device held in the teeth? Are we concerned solely with physical capacity to type, "normal" inability which has been compensated for or overcome? At the other extreme is the type of reporting that includes "hang-nail" cases as physically handicapped. Without reasonably objective criteria you get a confused picture.

An interesting experience of our own at the outset was the fact that we included all employees entitled to 10-point veteran preference. Seemingly a safe criterion—but we had overlooked the fact that "gold star" mothers, widows, and wives of disabled veterans could also qualify for this 10-point preference. For these and other reasons many companies having excellent programs prefer to ignore the quantitative aspects.

If statistical accounting is used, provision should be made for reporting beyond initial hire. That is, the life process and changes therein of an organic or mechanical nature will necessarily result in an increasing number of "handicaps" arising in a fairly stable work force. As previously indicated, these are of increasing number and importance—and the use of selective placement techniques to assign individuals to productive work which challenges their capacity can have a very significant impact on social processes, legislation, and the general economy.

Taking stock of your present employees may nevertheless be a good device in getting a program underway. The need for clear-cut definitions may be least important when there is still need to combat attitudes based on such dissimilar values as an emotional fear or revulsion where physical deformity is apparent; the desire to "overqualify" so that the individual can be a multipurpose employee; real or fancied concern as to insurance liability or possible losses repre-

sented by premature retirement costs. Successful handicapped employees already on your rolls can provide an excellent starting point for publicity.

Integration into Work Force—This program will be successful and effective as it is merged into prevailing management practices and does not stand out as THE PROGRAM with emotional overtones. These employees are hired on the basis of good business practices—they have met hiring standards and are required to meet the same performance requirements as any employee in their line of work.

They do not desire preference or any implication of preferred treatment because of handicaps. They do want and are entitled to equality of opportunity.

This concept is important to management and it is important to the self-respect and dignity of the individual. This, too, must extend beyond the initial employment.

Such employees should not be distinguished as a group or segregated from the rest of the work force. It is generally undesirable that certain occupations be available only to handicapped employees, except where the handicap itself happens to be a positive selection factor: such as the use of deaf employees in very noisy work areas or as we found to be desirable in one phase of aircraft modification and maintenance, the employment of dwarfs, midgets, and small stature persons to work *inside* the wing structure of certain planes.

Major modification of mechanical equipment to facilitate employment of disabled employees may be necessary when there are acute manpower problems but it is not desirable to advocate costly modifications. It is contrary to the "good business" approach and has the additional drawback of restricting future employment in manning such equipment. This does not mean that minor modifications are impractical nor that certain conveniences should not be provided such as access ramps for those who use wheel chairs or crutches; close-in parking spaces for those with walking handicaps; earlier dismissal time for those with a variety of handicaps who work in areas where large numbers of workers are employed, and it is necessary to walk distances, use elevators, or stairs; sitting facilities at bus stop; facil-

ities for seeing-eye dogs. Most of these represent courtesies we would extend without being asked!

The Technique: Selective Placement²

Perhaps the simple cliché of "the square peg in the square hole" is as good a way as any to express the essence of selective placement. Earlier books on this subject devoted dozens of pages to doing little more than listing possible occupations for theoretical average people with specific medical diagnoses, organic deficiencies, or other physical handicaps, singly and in combination.

This approach may have had some educational value but is an inadequate substitute for what should be standard procedure in any planned placement program. Its application to the physically handicapped is incidental to good placement practice. It is not a special program or technique to be used just for placement of the physically handicapped. The Occupational Analysis techniques fostered by the United States Employment Service and the affiliated state services gave a comprehensive foundation in industry for a logical, systematic approach to identifying jobs and establishing requirements pertinent to physical demands as well as the more traditional mental and educational qualifications.

Despite this valuable contribution, and the many well-known contributions from the fields of industrial psychology and scientific management, this abundance of knowledge has not been integrated into civil service employment practices as rapidly as could reasonably be expected. The central merit system agency's usual responsibilities for classification, recruitment, examination, and certification actually place responsibility for intelligent application of selection techniques related to job requirements squarely on the utilizing agencies. In most jurisdictions, however, the central merit agency will have to give the necessary leadership.

In addition to placing know-how in per-

sonnel techniques to agency administrators, it may also be timely for the merit agencies to examine the adequacy and flexibility of their own practices so that selective placement can function. Possibly legislative changes may be required so that qualification standards, examination practices, and certification processes will make it possible for specific as well as generalized job requirements to be satisfied. Selective certification techniques can help accommodate this need without compromising merit system principles.

Inherent in the challenge is the need for venturing beyond the superficial aspects of matching employee skills with job requirements. Since typical civil service job standards are necessarily generalized, there is need for the using agency to identify and use selection factors in terms of the actual worksite conditions: noise, vibration, fumes, restricted space, working at heights, use of ladders, scaffolding, unusual ranges of temperature, working in the open, etc. As known factors, these are significant in the medical evaluation and selective placement processes.

In the federal service there is a form for supervisors to check such pertinent factors which is then available to the medical officer and to the placement officer. The medico can then orient to job requirements and working conditions. While notation is made on the record as to physical deficiencies or limitations, the evaluation is focused on the candidate's ability to do the specific job duties under specific environmental conditions. Notations on disabilities which are not apparent are made available to the supervisor to whom the employee is assigned so that he will be aware of any hidden or latent disabilities and will not inadvertently assign a duty of potential hazard.

Establishing such procedures is basically good management! However, they also keep requirements on a realistic basis and soften traditional prejudices. Emphasis is then where it belongs: on the abilities.

A Few Inhibitions for Salesmen and Promoters

Do not oversell—either to supervisors or to the public. Like any other dependable

²The U.S. Civil Service Commission has issued, in its Personnel Methods Series, Pamphlet No. 9, "Selective Placement." This brochure sets forth, as indicated in its subtitle, "Aids for Placement Officers and Supervisors in Hiring Workers According to their Physical Abilities."

structure, program building must be on a very sound foundation. The use of the "demonstration" technique should not be mistaken for "showcase" employment. Bal-lyhoo for one or two cases, without real program substance, can backfire quickly and disastrously.

Do not force employment. Selling on an emotional basis is shortlived and leads to concepts of charity and "shelf jobs." The techniques of establishing quotas, as is done in many European countries as national policy, may be suitable there as a social welfare provision, but is completely out of our context.

Air Force experience is that employment can be built up on its merits. We now run close to 8%. Compare this with a required 2, 3, or 5% of the payroll.

In almost any kind of endeavor, where a quota is stipulated, this minimum tends to become the maximum. Such practice generates negative attitudes at management levels as well as among the work force.

The philosophy underlying employment of the physically handicapped in the public service is not the creation or the segregation of jobs to be used for this purpose. The objective of this presentation is to foster a concept of **EQUALITY OF OPPORTUNITY** for applicants and employees so they will be given equal and fair consideration based on merit and qualifications, without prejudice created by unrelated physical disabilities. It is not suggested that those responsible for hiring beat the bushes to look for physically handicapped. Rather, that they have an unbiased, receptive attitude when normal employment processes bring forward handicapped individuals for consideration. A prejudiced attitude is solicited in favor of eliminating any practices which inhibit or prohibit the operation of the democratic principles of equality of opportunity.

Don't exaggerate or inflate claims. Publicity invariably results in large numbers of handicapped applying for jobs, many of whom may actually be unemployable. It may also be anticipated that there will be individuals with either fancied or justified

grievances concerning inadequate consideration or improper handling.

All is never rosy—there may be limits to the numbers who can be absorbed in any given organization; in times of dollar or manpower austerity there is need for employees with greater versatility; since the great majority of severely handicapped have probably entered employment relatively recently, it is very likely that the order of retention in reduction of force may result in their being among the first to go.

As will be found in any group, there is a very small number of individuals who seek to trade on their handicap. A program in being conducive to employment of the physically handicapped is not designed to confer preference. A realistic and factual approach is necessary in meeting and anticipating such problems. As previously suggested, low pressure selling is most likely to obtain a sound program.

Don't "pigeonhole" such employees. Successful employment of the physically handicapped does not end with initial employment. These are all individuals, very much like any individual you know, with the same self-respect, ambitions, and aspirations. Because of handicaps they may be more appreciative, more highly motivated, and even more competitive. Employers benefit from these positive attributes.

But equality of opportunity must also extend to the opportunities for advancement, training, and recognition given all employees. If they have the skill to do, coupled with the will to do that is usually present in bonus quantities, these handicapped represent the best assets any employer could want!

Sell Sound Personnel Practices

To be successful in this undertaking, sell sound personnel management practices. Although repeated reference has been made to a "program" for employment of the physically handicapped, this has really been for semantic convenience. Install sound practices and instill receptive attitudes—the objective will then be on its way to realization.

Formal Education Programs For Local Government Employees

Beatrice Dinerman and Eugene P. Dvorin

*Extent, differences, current status, and rationale
of educational opportunities offered by city and
county jurisdictions.*

FROM TIME TO TIME, various local governments, both city and county, have announced the inauguration of programs to further the formal education of their employees. In March, 1958, a nationwide survey was undertaken to determine (1) the extent of such programs, (2) differences in such programs as may exist, (3) the current status of such programs, i.e., in effect, prospective, or abandoned, (4) the rationale under which the programs were instituted in both short-range and long-range perspective, and (5) the effect of such programs on in-service training.

Primary emphasis was placed on the Southern California region due to the large number of programs evidently in effect at the time. Other jurisdictions throughout the United States were sampled for the specific purpose of comparing variations in programs and approach, rather than attempting to determine any numerical superiority of one region over another. This paper summarizes the results of the survey.

Methodology

It is obvious that only a sampling of the great number of local jurisdictions could be attempted. As a result, the statistics which have emerged and the conclusions which follow are based only upon a sampling. However, a few words as to the method of sampling may lend support to acceptance of the findings.

First of all, the study was approached by geographical regions, i.e., the Western United States, Midwest, East, and South. Within each region, only selected states were covered. Each state was selected arbitrarily, and selection was not made on the basis of population, number of local jurisdictions, or any indices of material wealth.

However, once a state was selected, certain objectives were uppermost in determining those local jurisdictions to which questionnaires were to be sent. In this regard, two criteria were considered essential.

The first, to have within each state jurisdictions representative of small, medium, and large populations. The dividing line for the "small" jurisdictions was set at 50,000 maximum population, that of "medium-size" jurisdictions at 200,000 maximum population, and that of "large" jurisdictions at populations exceeding 1,000,000.

The second criterion was that no single form of government should predominate in the sampling. Thus, the survey covered jurisdictions with city or county manager, mayor-council, and chief administrative officer-type governments.

In total, approximately 500 questionnaires were sent out to local jurisdictions throughout the United States on the basis of the above points.

A Recent Development

The results of this survey reveal that local governmental assistance to public employees in furthering their formal education is, for the most part, a post-war development; even more specifically, a post-1950 development. Cities which had programs prior to the second world war represented various regions of the country: New York City, Signal Hill, California, and Coral Gables, Florida, for example. On a nationwide basis, over 70 per cent of the programs in effect were inaugurated in 1955 or later.

Returned questionnaires revealed that, among the Western states, if not the United States, California is a leader in this type of personnel program. Of 6 California coun-

ties and municipalities within those counties queried, a total of 27 programs was reported. No formal programs were reported by the 17 jurisdictions sampled in the State of Washington or by 25 jurisdictions queried in Colorado.

The great bulk of reported programs in the State of California is in the Southern California counties of Los Angeles, Orange, Riverside, and San Diego. Municipalities within Los Angeles County lead, by far, any other single area, with 18 educational programs in effect and 2 additional programs under consideration.

The Eastern states sampled comprised New York, Massachusetts, and Pennsylvania. Of 25 jurisdictions sampled in New York, none reported a program in effect and none had been considered at any time. Massachusetts, with 20 jurisdictions queried, reported only 1 program in effect, and Pennsylvania likewise reported 1 active program among 20 jurisdictions sampled.

The Midwestern states sampled included Illinois, Wisconsin, and Michigan. One program was reported out of 20 jurisdictions sampled in Illinois. Of 20 jurisdictions queried in Wisconsin, 3 programs were reported in effect, and of 20 jurisdictions in Michigan, none reported active programs.

Southern states questioned comprised Florida, Maryland, and Virginia. Of 20 local governments sampled in Florida, only 2 reported active programs. Maryland likewise reported 2 programs out of 16 jurisdictions sampled, and Virginia reported 3 active programs out of 18 jurisdictions sampled.

These figures would seem to show that this type of undertaking, while evident in various regions of the country, has yet to gain a nationwide significance among local jurisdictions. It must be remembered, however, that the growth of such programs within the past few years may well portend a future trend toward more attention to furthering the education of local governmental employees at public expense.

The survey reveals no significant correlation between population and the existence of educational assistance. While most programs were found in jurisdictions of "large" and "medium-size" populations, some exceedingly small local governments also have such

programs. For example, the City of Ipswich, Massachusetts, with a population of 6,895, reported a program in operation since 1957.

Who Initiates These Programs?

The outstanding characteristic of these programs is their great variety. However, certain basic similarities are evident.

Over 80 per cent of the programs in effect throughout the United States originated on the initiative of the city or county manager or executive, in contrast to 8 per cent originating through employee requests, and 5 per cent through the initiative of the local legislative body. It would appear that professional management assigns an importance to the educational improvement of its personnel to a far greater extent than the politically responsible community representatives or even the employees themselves.

Among reasons forwarded for the adoption of educational assistance programs, employee morale and increased employee efficiency and technical competence were cited as major factors.

In an overwhelming number of cases, programs are administered by the local jurisdiction alone, with educational institutions utilized in an advisory capacity. Only a few programs are jointly administered by the local jurisdictions and the educational institutions involved.

Two chief factors determine the extent to which local jurisdictions are in a position to support these educational programs: first, very specific and limited funds allocated in any one fiscal year for such programs, and, secondly, the realization that departmental operations must not be jeopardized by excessive numbers of employees undertaking classes at colleges and universities, either during working hours or in the evenings when their responsibilities might be adversely affected the following day.

Qualifications for Participation

No jurisdiction reported a program restricted to graduate work, and candidacy for a degree is not a condition of participation in any local jurisdiction. However, policies varied as to whether or not employees would be allowed to complete their high school or grammar school education and, in some cases, programs are restricted to higher

education on the post-secondary level. The City of Gainesville, Florida, allows employees to complete high school or grammar school education, provided such is needed for the employee's present job classification or the one immediately above it.

Some jurisdictions reported a contractual obligation on the part of the participating employee to remain with the jurisdiction for a period of 1 year upon completion of his course or courses. Otherwise, the employee would be required to reimburse the local government for expenses incurred. In most cases, however, there was no obligation to remain with the jurisdiction for any specified length of time.

In virtually every case, mere satisfactory completion of course work is required of the employee participating in the educational program. The City of Glendora, California, requires a 1-page summary outline of the course and a statement of benefits received, while the City of Covina, California, requires at least 90 per cent attendance of classes. Some jurisdictions require the maintenance of at least a "C" average grade.

A basic characteristic of most programs is the requirement that all work undertaken is to be directly connected with and relevant to the duties of the employee in his present position. The civil service commission of the City of Milwaukee, while it has no formal educational program in operation, does encourage promotion from within the service and, as a result, regards it as highly desirable that employees participate in job-related courses. Upon completion of these courses, the Commission's policy is to recognize this in the training and experience ratings which are given as a part of all promotional examinations.

About 80 per cent of all jurisdictions reporting give the employee a full choice as to the educational institution he attends. However, the employee's discretion may be modified in a number of cases by the limited educational facilities available in his area.

It is a common characteristic of these programs that all employees in good standing, other than probationary employees, are eligible for participation. The case of Coral Gables, Florida, is extremely unusual, insofar as persons other than those directly in municipal employment may also partici-

pate. For example, children of employees and spouses or children of deceased employees are eligible to take courses at municipal expense at the University of Miami.

On the other hand, some jurisdictions specifically restrict their programs to fire, police, and engineering personnel. Several jurisdictions reported that, in the latter instance, educational assistance is one device whereby sufficient numbers of engineers may be attracted to the public service.

A number of other local governments have established a screening process whereby applications for participation are evaluated. Among requirements in this process are approval of the departmental head alone, approval by the departmental head in addition to approval by the chief executive officer, and, in a few instances, approval of the city council.

San Diego County has established a Training Advisory Committee which passes upon the applicant's qualifications in addition to approval by his departmental head. The Training Advisory Committee comprises, by law, the chief administrative officer, the director of public health, the director of public welfare, the director of medical institutions, the director of public works, the county agricultural commissioner, the director of civil service and personnel, the assessor, the probation officer, the auditor and controller, the surveyor and road commissioner, and the registrar of voters.

The City of Ripon, Wisconsin, requires a written examination and oral interview in order for municipal employees to qualify for its program.

The City and County of San Francisco places great emphasis upon each individual case being considered on its own merits. While no formal program of educational assistance exists in that jurisdiction, suitable arrangements can be made, in certain fields, for part-time scheduling of classes and for the granting of leaves of absence without pay for the purpose of securing additional education which the civil service commission feels will enhance the employee's value.

For instance, a graduate engineer working for the city would be permitted leave to obtain his fifth year of engineering studies. However, a social service worker who has

had 3 years of law would not be granted educational leave from his social service position in order to obtain his law degree.

Employee Response Moderate

Despite available opportunities, the percentage of persons participating appears to be surprisingly low. Nearly 60 per cent of the jurisdictions reported only 1-10 per cent of their employees taking advantage of these educational programs, while 32 per cent reported a participating average of 10-20 per cent. The highest single percentage reported was from the City of Covina, California, which listed 35 per cent of its total working force as participating in the program.

Bare percentage figures, however, may be deceiving. For example, one city manager reports 10 per cent of his total working force as participating. At the same time, he points out there may be positions at the lower levels such as garbage collectors, road crews, and so forth, where the personnel have neither the ability nor the desire for this type of program. This same manager indicates that "if our average or above-average intelligence group" is considered alone, the participation figure rises to about 30 per cent.

Employee reaction to such programs, in the majority of instances, ranges from moderate enthusiasm to a neutral or uninterested attitude. Only one jurisdiction reported adverse employee reactions. The manager of Gainesville, Florida, in commenting on the "moderate" response of his employees, reveals that they prefer pay increases rather than the indirect benefits of this type of program. As a result, employee pressure is for increased salary allocations in the budget as opposed to educational outlays by the municipality.

What Assistance Is Given?

Assistance to public employees in furthering their formal education takes three basic forms: payment of tuition or a portion of tuition, provision of all or a portion of books and supplies, and rearrangement of working-hour schedules. Variations appear in the types of assistance granted.

Seventy-six per cent of jurisdictions reporting provide full tuition, 9 per cent provide 50 per cent tuition, and 15 per cent

have no provisions in this area. In no case does the employee have to repay all or any part of the tuition, with the exception of some instances when the employee leaves governmental employment prior to a certain stipulated period following the completion of his course.

The City of Lynwood, California, in addition to paying one-half tuition, grants "premium pay" at the rate of one dollar per unit of study satisfactorily completed. This "premium pay" is added to the employee's monthly salary and remains as permanent compensation as long as the employee is on the city payroll.

Another variation is to be found in the City of Glendora, California, whereby the employee is reimbursed by the city for the cost of auto travel to the educational institution at the rate of 8 cents per mile.

Of the total number of jurisdictions reporting, 43 per cent provide books and supplies. About 65 per cent of these local jurisdictions allow the employee to retain the books and supplies after completion of the course. The remaining jurisdictions require that such books and supplies become municipal property after their use by the employee.

More jurisdictions prohibit employees from attending classes during working hours than those permitting such a policy. Only a few of those allowing working hours to be used for formal educational purposes require that the hours be made up or deducted from salary.

A Substitute for In-Service Training

It is important to note that, in many cases, formal educational programs were adopted due to deficiencies in existing in-service training facilities. In other instances, these programs are regarded as important supplements. One local jurisdiction reported the educational program serving as an actual substitute for in-service training. No jurisdiction reported the program as having adverse effects upon existing in-service training. The City of Gainesville, Florida, reports that the existence of their employee educational program, while not replacing existing in-service training programs, has kept the municipality from broadening their in-service offerings.

Evaluation of the Program by Supervisors

Among local governments having formal educational programs, a vast majority of supervisors support such undertakings with great enthusiasm and feel that programs inaugurated in their respective jurisdictions have generally lived up to original expectations. The improved caliber of services offered by the employee, stimulation of promotional opportunities with a subsequent improvement of employee morale, and the facilitation of recruitment were attributed to the institution of formal educational programs.

One executive noted that such a program has increased the period of employee service to the city. In a few instances, supervisors were somewhat disappointed by a lack of employee response, while others noted a need for greater program direction and guidance.

Basic Issues Involved

Programs to assist employees in furthering their formal education raise some interesting questions regarding public responsibility in this field.

While most cities and counties sampled favor such programs, a minority rejected such personnel policies on the grounds that formal education should be taken only at the expense of the individual employee. In the words of the personnel director of the City of Pasadena, California, "There is great value to the employee making the sacrifice in time and money in reaching his educational objective. He will work harder for it and gain a greater satisfaction in the end."

Local jurisdictions supporting such programs, on the other hand, justify expenditure of public funds for this purpose largely in terms of benefits which will accrue to the jurisdiction through the services of a well-trained and educated staff, applying knowledge gained through advanced education to the duties and responsibilities of their present positions. Along these lines, the chief personnel technician of the City of Anaheim, California, indicates that advantages derived by cities and counties through the institution of such programs cannot be measured with any degree of accuracy or precision; he views the program in his city as a "long-term capital gain." Personal benefits

derived by the employee are looked upon as a favorable byproduct which does not, in itself, justify the expenditure of public funds.

An Aid to Recruiting

It is interesting to note the extent to which some jurisdictions sampled correlate formal educational programs with the recruitment process. Several local governments indicated that municipal provision of educational assistance stimulated recruitment by offering educational advancement as an added incentive for entering the public service. The role of educational assistance in the recruitment process is especially evident with respect to specialized positions such as police, fire, and engineering personnel.

It would seem that the expansion of educational assistance programs to more local governments depends, in part, upon the extent to which such governments view the allocation of funds for these programs as a public expenditure, justified in terms of improved performance within the jurisdiction resulting from a higher educational level among its employees.

Status of Future Programs

In any attempt to evaluate the type of personnel programs described above, it must be borne in mind that we are dealing with merely one aspect of a much broader picture. While this article is concerned with the local level of government, state and federal departments and agencies have numerous programs deserving careful consideration. Only then can a true perspective be gained of the role of the public agency in furthering formal education of employees.

While many persons disagree with the concept of educational improvement of local governmental employees at public expense, still the number of such programs in existence and under consideration points to its widely-held acceptance as a public responsibility in various regions of the country. This is a significant development that has, thus far, received little attention. Whether, in time, the concept may evolve into one universally accepted to the same extent as retirement programs and sickness benefits must await the unfolding of future developments.

The Federal Wage Board Program—Part II

J. Kenneth Mulligan

An examination of basic differences among federal agencies explains some of the dissimilarities found in wage policies and procedures.

SUBSTANTIAL DIFFERENCES are found among agencies of the federal government in their wage policies and procedures affecting wage board employees. Some of these differences have already been described in the first part of this article.*

To what degree do these differences stem validly from basic differences among agencies and therefore meet some special agency need? To what extent are they traditional or accidental? Can or should these differences be eliminated or reduced? Differences among the agencies in size, industry orientation, dispersion of staff, unionization, budget, and law appear basically to affect pay practices and policies.

Some Causes of Variation

Size. The great variation in size among those federal agencies employing wage board personnel, previously mentioned, has an obvious effect on the patterns of wage administration. An agency with 244,000 wage board employees, such as the Navy, will have a different need for variation, refinements, and complexity in its system than one with a thousand or a hundred employees, or the Export-Import Bank with 5 wage board employees. There will be the need for more formalized procedures; for the meshing of varied occupational families; for the recognition of unique compensation problems.

Organization. Differences in organizational pattern and tradition are influential. There is no single pattern for headquarters-field relationships which all agree is ideal. These patterns differ among agencies in terms of function, tradition, and management no-

tions concerning central control vs. delegation. Typically, the military departments, and new smaller independent agencies, tend to control field operations firmly from headquarters. Old-line civilian agencies, such as the Departments of Interior and Agriculture, have fewer controls over their bureaus, agencies, and field offices. Wage administration patterns in the agencies are consistent with these more basic patterns. In each military agency there is uniformity in practice concerning classification and internal pay rate consistency, with little delegation to the field activities or operating bureaus. The opposite is true in the Interior and Agriculture, with less coordination or control from the central personnel office.

Organization of work at the shop or work site also differs among agencies, with effects on wage administration. For example, in shipyards, shops are generally organized on a single craft basis, so that there are machine shops with over a thousand machinists, all generalists, supported by some machinist's helpers, but no other trades. Contrasted to this is multicraft organization, found in many Army and Air Force activities. Some agencies, such as Interior or Agriculture, are required to organize work with regional or area pools of workers. These differences in basic work structure have an obvious impact on job content and thereby on wages and wage policy.

Industrial Orientation. The industrial orientation of a department or agency has a profound effect on the nature and substance of its wage practices. To pay "prevailing rates" has been interpreted to require not only geographic limits but also job and industrial boundaries. Differences in pay, and pay practices, among private industries are as significant as are differences geographically, and are generally more consistent.

* This is the second part of a 2-part article on the Federal Wage Board Program. Part I appeared in the October, 1958, issue of *Public Personnel Review*.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

The pay pattern for federal employment is compared not as a whole to its many private industrial counterparts, but in industrial segments. Both employers and employees are concerned with such comparisons. A laborer in a federal metal working shop expects to get the pay of his industrial counterpart, not the pay of a laborer in a private hospital, which would be considerably lower.

Because the federal government is engaged in many industries and services, and because some of these are characteristic of certain agencies or departments, substantial variation within an agency and between agencies exists. Within an agency, for example, such as the Department of the Navy, there is need to conform to pay practices in such widely divergent industries or services as shipbuilding and repair, clothing manufacture, and the operation of vessels. Each of these, for the same area, requires different wage data and a different wage schedule. The Department of Agriculture must set rates for maintenance and operating personnel in forestry, farming, food storage and processing, and animal care. The Interior must determine industrial practice in power generation and distribution systems, fisheries, quarries, and mines. The Department of Health, Education, and Welfare has building custodial workers in hospitals and medical research centers. The Department of the Treasury sets rates of pay for some of its employees in the Bureau of Engraving and Printing in comparison with rates paid by the American Bank Note Company. This practice means that laborers in federal employ will be paid differently depending on whether they work in industrial plants (Defense) or in office buildings (General Services Administration) or in housing projects (Public Housing Administration).

The practice of orienting pay toward the most comparable industry achieves several purposes. It means that funds are spent prudently, by avoiding the adjustment of all rates to the level of those prevailing in the highest paid industries. It makes recruitment and retention competitive, thus giving no offense to the private employer. It facilitates movement of workers between industry and government.

Against these positive effects must be set the poor morale resulting from "cross-in-

dustry" comparisons within the federal government when made by federal employees whose pay has been set with reference to lower paid industries.

Geography. In addition to agency differences of size, organization, and industry orientation, other agency characteristics affect wage patterns. The size or configuration of a local prevailing rate area will relate to concentration, distribution, and location of an agency's employees.

The Department of Agriculture, with 9,160 wage board employees in over 1,000 locations, some assignable throughout a region of several states, contrasts with Navy with 244,000 employees in over 450 field activities in 152 local and foreign labor markets. The definition of the boundaries of a labor market using the same central point will be quite different for these two agencies, and pay differences may result.

The location of a work site with reference to other federal activities is also significant. Rates of pay for workers in a hospital for Indians, removed from other federal agencies, will be derived differently than rates of pay for workers in a hospital located in a naval shipyard, where the pay structure will be captive to and set by production rates in the shipyard.

Unionization. The degree of unionization in an agency, which varies greatly among federal agencies, shapes wage policy and practice. As an example, regard for union attitudes toward job evaluation has no doubt influenced the minimal application of these principles in wage practices of the Department of the Navy, where there is a relatively high degree of unionization.

Funds. Funds availability influences wage policy and practice. In the Defense agencies, where the wage bill is a relatively less significant part of a very large budget, wage increases have less budgetary impact than in Veterans Administration.

Consequently, in the former, wage increases are not delayed because of the non-availability of funds; in the latter this has been the practice for 2 years, delay occurring until payment could be made retroactively from deficiency appropriations. There seems to be more conservatism generally in wage policy among the agencies with smaller budgets.

Pay Differences

Differences in pay for wage board positions among federal agencies exist and cause concern to those who study the problem. Comparatively little has been published or is available demonstrating these differences, analyzing them statistically or in terms of their effects on pay objectives. Whether the differences which do exist have validity in terms of differences in job content, industrial context, and employment conditions has not been established. Whether the differences affirmatively or negatively affect legitimate goals of a pay system has been insufficiently explored.

No doubt differences do exist which are unexplainable, irritating, expensive, and irrational. Their significance, when considered together with the degree to which rates do agree, and the purposes for which the rates are set, has not been thoroughly evaluated.

History of Coordination—to 1954

The differences among federal agencies in their wage practices have been a choice target for critics for some time. Whatever the true faults or virtues of the present pattern are, the aspects of the problem attracting most criticism are:

1. Differences in pay for comparable work;
2. Duplication in wage surveys; and
3. Differences in basic approaches to pay setting and classification.

When the extension of the classification system to the field service was being considered by the Personnel Classification Board in 1931, it recommended, in its closing report, that trades, crafts, and laboring jobs continue to be excepted from the Classification Act "uniform compensation schedules" but that rates of pay for this group be "fixed and adjusted from time to time" by the board, in accordance with prevailing rates. The recommendation followed this statement:

In the organizations coming within the survey, there are more field employees in the excluded classes than there are within the scope of the survey, and these employees are distributed among the various departments and establishments in each of which a different procedure is followed for the purpose of determining pay rates. Under

these circumstances it is not likely that any degree of uniformity is being maintained in pay levels for similar work under like conditions.

In 1943, the Civil Service Commission, making the statement that "the lack of coordination in wage board rates among the various agencies is a direct interference with the government's war program" recommended that the commission be given "appropriate authority to coordinate pay schedules for wage board positions." In 1948, the Commission recommended coordination of "position-classification and compensation practices" for wage board employees, asserting "a serious lack of consistency among the agencies in fixing titles and rates of pay for these positions." The 1949 Report was less specific, recommending general "coordinating" authority, in commenting on the recommendations of the First Hoover Commission, which had reported in February of 1949. The latter had recommended that the Civil Service Commission be given authority to fix pay for wage board positions.

It should be mentioned that two studies within the Department of Defense, one in 1949 and one in 1954,¹ resulted in some accommodation between the two basic systems in use there. The principal accomplishments of these studies and administrative adjustments made during the period were:

- (a) close coordination of wage survey planning which eliminated all duplication in the conduct of wage surveys within the Department of Defense;
- (b) agreements to coordinate wage rate schedule construction to reduce differences in rates very substantially;
- (c) agreement on timing of adjustments;
- (d) agreement on some features of pay administration, such as number of step rates.²

During this period most agencies employing wage board personnel in the printing and lithographic field (excluding signifi-

¹ Personnel Board, National Military Establishment, *Development and Recommendation of a National Military Establishment Wage Policy*, July 1, 1949; and unpublished: *Study of Existing Wage-Fixing Processes in the Department of Defense*, October, 1954.

² In April, 1951, agreement was reached on 4 step rates, Navy increasing from three, and Army and Air Force reducing from five. In January, 1954, Navy dropped the fourth step (a merit increase step), returning to three steps.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

cantly the Treasury and the Government Printing Office) joined together voluntarily to establish the "Interdepartmental Lithographic Wage Board." Agreements exist, among this group, applicable to the Washington, D. C., area only, which have the purpose of standardizing pay rates for printing workers.

Aside from these developments, which may have been accomplished partly in response to the recommendations previously cited, no significant movement toward coordinated policy occurred prior to 1954.

History of Coordination—1954 to Present

A report was prepared by the Civil Service Commission and published by the Committee on Post Office and Civil Service in 1954³ in response to a request for information from that Committee. The Civil Service Commission, in its transmittal of the report, endorsed the principle of a centrally coordinated prevailing rate system. Subsequent attempts to develop a "Federal Wage Board Plan" resulted in a tentative proposal strongly supported by some agencies, opposed by others, and generally but not unanimously opposed by employee unions.

This proposal was to seek legislation to establish a Federal Wage Board within the Civil Service Commission or as an independent agency. This plan in its barest outline would have the Board perform these functions:

1. Conduct wage surveys, or supervise them;
2. Set wages for all agencies;
3. Develop and promulgate an evaluation and classification system in collaboration with agencies;
4. Train agency staffs and inspect for compliance.

A plan of this type would assure central agency leadership and provide supervision to guarantee that agencies use approved methods and standards. It would have as its goal like pay for like work for all federal employees in the same labor market area working under similar conditions of employment, irrespective of agency. Advocates of

a central plan recognize that flexibility should be provided within the over-all plan to permit adaptation of its features to the needs of each agency and to encourage independent development within basic criteria.

Opposition

Those who have reservations about this proposal believe that the great diversity in agency purposes and characteristics requires more flexibility than could be achieved operating under a central board. The responsiveness of present plans to employee and management needs, and to agency tradition and industrial orientation, is emphasized. Central control, they believe, would erode present agency acceptance of responsibility to develop and apply systems suited to their special needs. Also to be reckoned with is the general opposition of labor groups to this proposal.

Following the consideration of the "Federal Wage Board Plan," three occurrences before 1958 had some significance in the history of coordination of wage methods:

1. Extension of prevailing rates to about 70,000 additional workers, effective September 1, 1955;
2. A statement, made by Philip Young, as the president's advisor on personnel management, on June 7, 1956, establishing a policy of voluntary cooperation among agencies;
3. The publication by the civil service commission, in May, 1957, of a "Directory of Wage Survey Areas and Agencies," which was prepared cooperatively by an inter-agency group.

The extension of prevailing rates referred to created a problem of wage administration for many agencies not having a significant interest before. With leadership from the civil service commission, many agencies adopted systems in use by larger agencies, particularly the Army-Air Force systems and standards. The Young letter supported and encouraged the general adoption of procedures for voluntary coordination developing among agencies. The "Directory of Wage Survey Areas and Agencies" crystallized and formalized these procedures into specific working arrangements. The Directory defined all significant wage areas, listed the agencies and employee population

³ *A Study of the Prevailing-Rate Pay Systems for Trades, Crafts, and Labor Occupations in the Federal Service*, Committee on Post Office and Civil Service, United States Senate, Government Printing Office, 1954.

in each, and described the manner in which each agency related itself to the wage survey conducted in the area. It also set forth some very general principles to guide agency relationships in the conduct of wage surveys.

Present Coordination Program

On February 4, 1958, Rocco Siciliano, Special Assistant to the President for Personnel Management, enlisted the support of all agencies in renewed voluntary coordination efforts. He pointed out that "The wage programs are outstanding examples of the improvements that can be achieved administratively by agencies working together on a cooperative basis in the management of decentralized personnel programs." He asked

the civil service commission to continue to serve as a central point of coordination.

Through interagency work groups, and by consultation and advice, the present program is directed toward:

1. exchange of information and techniques among agencies;
2. reduction of duplication in wage survey and analysis activities;
3. elimination of invalid pay differences for the same work in the same locality.

The successful experience of recent years in a program of voluntary coordination encourages the hope that these objectives are attainable without impairing the basic strength of the present flexible, decentralized wage board system.

Go South, Young Man . . .

In Brazil, a civil servant gains job security after 2 years of satisfactory service and his so-called CS status there has real meaning. He can be fired only for cause. If his job is abolished or his duties transferred elsewhere, he remains on the payroll at full pay until he is reassigned to another position.

He gets 30 days of vacation a year. After 10 years of service he gets 6 months off with pay, and after 20 years, he gets a full year of special leave. . . . He can retire on full salary at any age after 35 years of service. Retirement is compulsory at age 70.

His government covers him with a combination retirement health plan which costs him 5 per cent of his basic salary. That system also covers most of the hospital and medical expenses of himself and his family. On his death, his family gets a full month's salary to pay the funeral expenses. However, only minor survivorship benefits are paid to widows and children.

The employee may borrow from the retirement fund to buy a home. . . . His salary is based not only on the job he occupies, but also on the number of children he has. The more children, the larger his family allowance. He gets a 40 per cent differential for hazardous work.

It's possible for him to hold two government jobs and to draw two salaries. A science teacher, for instance, can be paid for teaching in one job and for doing scientific work in another. Occasionally, the government, twice in the past 10 years, has given its employees a full month's pay as a Christmas bonus.

Panama's CS system is only 2 years old and covers part of its employees. Its civil servants get a month's vacation each year. The government has its own social security system which not only covers retirement but health and housing programs for its employees. The retirement funds also pay for employee funerals.—From Jerry Klutz's *Federal Employee Newsletter*, October 15, 1957.

Experience With a Cost-of-Living Pay Plan

William Monat

The cost-of-living formula in the Minnesota State pay plan minimizes periodic struggles with pay adjustments.

TWELVE YEARS AGO the Minnesota State Legislature approved the full implementation of a cost-of-living pay plan that is still unique among state merit systems. Since 1947 the plan has undergone several revisions—minor changes in 1951 and 1953 and a thorough overhauling in 1955. The scheme's basic feature, however, has remained the same—an annual determination of the need for adjusting the entire pay structure to significant changes in the living costs of employees and, if an adjustment is justified, the means of accomplishing it.

This adjustment plan has met broad acceptance by practically all groups; furthermore, it fills a need present in any state with biennial legislative sessions. Without some such compensation program, the legislature would have to appropriate for two fiscal years on the basis of relatively constant expenditures for personal services. With this policy, legislators can appropriate for personal services through the biennium at the same time that allowance is made for regular general salary adjustments when economic conditions warrant.

Near Accurate Predictions

In practice, the cost-of-living formula has enabled near accurate predictions of costs for personal services in the second fiscal year of the biennium even allowing for possible economic increments. Legislators have, therefore, escaped much of the pressure that otherwise might be exerted by employees and their organizations in behalf of general wage increases. In the absence of such pressure, however, the legislature has not been forced to re-examine periodically the adequacy of its over-all salary policies.

The author is indebted to Robert D. Stover, former Minnesota civil service director, John W. Jackson, present civil service director, and Edwin Lane, assistant civil service director, for their assistance in the preparation of this article.

Line administrators similarly have found in the plan much to their liking; budgeting has been facilitated, and administrators have been relieved of some employee agitation concerning salaries that might well have been generated if there were no mechanism whereby pay in general kept pace with living costs. It must be added, however, that administrators, as a result, have tended to consider salary policy settled. They have been inclined to infrequent review of internal salary policies.

Employees, too, have generally supported the plan. The tangible evidence of salary increases produced by the plan has weighed more heavily than the theoretical possibility that the formula might also cause salary cuts. To date, employees have experienced only benefit from the plan's adjustments. Few employees and employee organizations saw, in the plan's operation from 1947 to 1954, the basic cause of many serious salary problems. And in their attack on these problems, employees invariably sought position reclassification or salary range reassignment rather than drastic surgery in the compensation plan itself.

The conditions leading to adoption of the Minnesota plan and the stages in formulating and implementing it have been described elsewhere.¹ The present discussion has two objectives: (1) to analyze the major problems created by the plan's operation, problems leading ultimately to the need for revision in 1955, and (2) to describe those changes.

Features of the Original Cost-of-Living Pay Plan

The 1947 cost-of-living salary plan provided an "automatic" upward and down-

¹ Robert D. Stover, "The Minnesota Cost-of-Living Pay Plan," *Public Personnel Review*, July, 1948, pp. 133-37.

TABLE I

COMPARISON OF THE BASIC SALARY PLAN PROVIDED BY THE 1947 STATUTE AND THE ADJUSTED SALARY PLAN IN 1954 AFTER THE ADDITION OF 15 AND 16 COST-OF-LIVING SALARY ADJUSTMENTS*

| Basic Ranges | | | Step Value | | 1954 Adjusted Ranges | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|----------|-----------|------------|---------|----------------------|-----------|---------|----------|----------|----|---------|----------|----------|
| | 1 | \$ 95-120 | | \$ 5 | 1 | \$175-200 | | | | | | | |
| \$ 5 gap | 2 | 100-130 | \$10 gap | | \$21 gap | 2 | 196-226 | \$26 gap | | | | | |
| | 3 | 105-135 | | | | 3 | 201-231 | | | | | | |
| | 4 | 110-140 | | | | 4 | 206-236 | | | | | | |
| | 5 | 115-145 | | \$ 6 | | 5 | 211-241 | | | | | | |
| | 6 | 120-150 | | | | 6 | 216-246 | | | | | | |
| | 7 | 125-155 | | | | 7 | 221-251 | | | | | | |
| | 8 | 130-160 | | | | 8 | 226-256 | | | | | | |
| | 9 | 135-165 | | | | 9 | 231-261 | | | | | | |
| | \$ 5 gap | 10 | | 140-180 | | \$15 gap | | | \$29 gap | 10 | 260-300 | \$39 gap | |
| 11 | | 150-190 | | 11 | 270-310 | | | | | | | | |
| 12 | | 160-200 | \$ 8 | 12 | 280-320 | | | | | | | | |
| 13 | | 170-210 | | 13 | 290-330 | | | | | | | | |
| 14 | | 180-220 | | 14 | 300-340 | | | | | | | | |
| 15 | | 190-230 | | 15 | 310-350 | | | | | | | | |
| \$10 gap | | 16 | | 200-250 | \$20 gap | | | \$40 gap | | 16 | 350-400 | | \$50 gap |
| | 17 | 210-260 | | 17 | | 360-410 | | | | | | | |
| | 18 | 220-270 | \$10 | 18 | | 370-420 | | | | | | | |
| | 19 | 230-280 | | 19 | | 380-430 | | | | | | | |
| | 20 | 240-290 | | 20 | | 390-440 | | | | | | | |
| | \$10 gap | 21 | | 250-310 | | \$20 gap | | | \$40 gap | 21 | 430-490 | \$50 gap | |
| 22 | | 265-325 | | 22 | 445-505 | | | | | | | | |
| 23 | | 280-340 | \$12 | 23 | 460-520 | | | | | | | | |
| 24 | | 295-355 | | 24 | 475-535 | | | | | | | | |
| 25 | | 310-370 | | 25 | 490-550 | | | | | | | | |
| 26 | | 325-385 | | 26 | 505-565 | | | | | | | | |
| 27 | | 340-400 | | 27 | 520-580 | | | | | | | | |
| \$10 gap | | 28 | | 350-420 | \$20 gap | | | \$40 gap | | 28 | 560-630 | | \$50 gap |
| | | 29 | | 370-440 | | | | | | 29 | 580-650 | | |
| | 30 | 390-460 | \$14 | 30 | | 600-670 | | | | | | | |
| | 31 | 410-480 | | 31 | | 620-690 | | | | | | | |
| | 32 | 430-500 | | 32 | | 640-710 | | | | | | | |
| | \$20 gap | 33 | | 450-530 | | \$30 gap | | | \$50 gap | 33 | 690-770 | \$60 gap | |
| 34 | | 475-555 | | 34 | 715-795 | | | | | | | | |
| 35 | | 500-580 | \$16 | 35 | 740-820 | | | | | | | | |
| 36 | | 525-605 | | 36 | 765-845 | | | | | | | | |
| 37 | | 550-630 | | 37 | 790-870 | | | | | | | | |
| 38 | | 575-655 | | 38 | 815-895 | | | | | | | | |

* As a result of the preferential salary treatment given the lowest nine ranges they had a 1-step advantage over ranges 10-38.

Source: *Minnesota Session Laws of 1947*, Chap. 606.

ward pay adjustment mechanism.² The adjustment formula operated on a statutory

² The Minnesota State Legislature had enacted a modified cost-of-living plan in 1945. This scheme was patterned after a plan proposed by the Civil Service Department and the Public Administration Service that included a 40 range basic salary schedule and provision for both upward and downward revision. The 1945 measure allowed only downward revision and was based on a 34 range schedule.

salary schedule of 38 basic ranges, each range comprising five equal steps from minimum to maximum. The flat dollar-amount of the equal steps, ranging from \$5 for the lowest salaried employees to \$16 for the highest, divided the ranges into 7 groups determined by the step values. This can be quickly observed in Table 1.

Each March the state civil service direc-

tor determines whether or not there has been a sufficient change in the average cost of living in Minneapolis-St. Paul, as indicated by the Bureau of Labor Statistics January cost-of-living index, to justify salary adjustments.

Under the 1947 measure the base period used for the salary schedule was 1939. Conveniently, at least from the standpoint of the plan's initial internal consistency, the BLS index also used 1939 as a base year. Thus, working from a base of 100 on the index, the plan authorized a one-step increase or decrease for each 9 point change in the index, effective with the new fiscal year on July 1.

Two minor revisions in the adjustment formula were approved by the legislature in 1951 and 1953. In 1951 the index critical point was reduced from 9 to 6.5 points. The 1953 change altered the basis for assessing the need for salary adjustment. The newer, less cumbersome, revised consumers' price index, also published by the Bureau of Labor Statistics, was substituted for the old series cost-of-living index.

Use of the new index did not introduce any substantive change in the plan's operations, however. The 1939 base year for the salary schedule remained unchanged despite the fact that the new index used the base period 1947-49. The base figure and critical point used for the old index were merely translated into new index values; the base figure being changed from 100 to 60 and the critical point from 6.5 to 4.

Salary Administration Problems Growing Out of the Plan

By 1955, serious inequities had emerged in the salary plan. Most could properly be identified as consequences, albeit unintended, of certain features of the cost-of-living plan and the basic salary schedule.

1. The most apparent but not the most serious defect in salary administration under the cost-of-living plan has been the infrequency of adjustment. Only once each year is the index consulted to determine if fluctuations in living costs since the last reading have been sufficient to warrant pay changes.

Adjusting salaries in this fashion caused hardship during the first year of the Korean

conflict. Stable, although high, living costs from 1948 through the first half of 1950 meant that no cost-of-living increments were justified from July 1, 1948, until the inflationary spiral produced by the Korean hostilities propelled living costs upward. Six months after the outbreak of hostilities, in January, 1951, the cost-of-living index had risen almost 17 points. Despite a 9 per cent increase in living costs during the last half of 1950, salaries remained at their 1948 levels until the adjustments authorized by the plan could be effected on July 1, 1951.

The annual adjustment has proved adequate under a situation of relatively stable living costs. Such relative stability has prevailed since 1953, although at an inflationary level. Whether living costs be high or low is immaterial from the standpoint of the plan's effectiveness; so long as fluctuations are neither sudden nor drastic, the mechanism functions satisfactorily.

2. A problem of greater dimensions and with more serious consequences was the thorough distortion of the whole salary structure produced by the 1947 plan's operation. By the end of 1954, 15 cost-of-living increments had been added by the plan. Some of the consequences flowing from this persistent upward adjustment are illustrated in Table 1.

The most visible distortion, as a result of these adjustments, was the disproportion that developed in the gaps between ranges at the minimum and maximum rates. The gaps between range groups underwent considerable expansion, while those between ranges within range groups remained constant.

The obverse of this pulling-apart tendency between range groups was a relative compression within range groups. This compression can be illustrated best by underscoring its effects. Although the cost-of-living increases for each range by 1954 amounted to between 23 and 42 per cent of the maximum rates of the ranges, the gaps between the ranges *within* range groups remained constant—the dollar relationships between most ranges unchanged while the actual salaries were rising steadily. Therefore, many upward range reassignments and reclassifications in 1954 would not have been as great either in terms of purchasing

power or in comparison to the actual salaries as identical increases would have been in 1947. Furthermore, if the employee in 1954 were fortunate enough to find his range reassignment had boosted him into the next range group, he would have experienced proportionately a much greater increase than if the reassignment were to a range within the group of his previously assigned range.

An additional compression occurred within each range. With each cost-of-living increment, the relative value of merit increases and subsequent cost-of-living adjustments were decreased. With the flat dollar-amount steps unaffected by upward changes in both minimum and maximum range rates, the *relative* value of these constant steps diminished with each economic increment. Whereas in 1947 the spread between the minimum and maximum of range 1 was 20.8 per cent of the maximum rate, by 1954 it amounted to only 12½ per cent. The decreasing value of the step values was equally dramatic. In 1947, the steps in range 1 were 4.2 per cent of the maximum rate; by 1954 they had shrunk to 2.5 per cent. Similar and even more extreme shrinkage in the value of steps and spreads occurred within every range in the schedule.

3. Desirable in any salary range schedule is a regular progression of minimum and maximum rates from the lowest through the highest ranges. Aside from whatever aesthetic satisfaction one might derive from the symmetry of a range schedule, an important and practical administrative purpose is served by this progression. There are no "dead" or unusable salary spreads between the minimum of the bottom range and the maximum of the top range. That such gaps did develop as a byproduct of the incremental accretions of cost-of-living adjustments is apparent in Table 1. These breaks had the effect of transforming spreads ranging from \$21 to \$50 into blank spots in the pay plan to which no classes could be assigned.

The 1955 Cost-of-Living Pay Plan

In large part because of the problems just discussed, the Civil Service Department prepared and recommended to the 1955 Minnesota legislature a thoroughly revised

compensation program. With few modifications, the legislature enacted the plan as it was proposed. Although it retained the grid-like basic schedule and the "automatic" cost-of-living adjustment feature, the 1955 plan introduced several changes designed both to rectify the conditions described above and to assure that similar inequities would not develop in the future.

The major reform accomplished by the 1955 plan was in the basic schedule itself. The "equal step" concept that had been the core of the previous schedule was replaced by a "percentage progression" range structure. Instead of ranges having five *equal* steps with prescribed constant dollar values, the new schedule's ranges have five *unequal* steps whose values are determined by a 4 per cent progression calculation, each step being 4 per cent greater than the preceding step. This means that the 45 ranges of the new schedule provide a spread of steps from the \$150 minimum for range 1 through the \$1,028 maximum of range 45 in which every step has a value of 4 per cent higher than the step below it.³ Table 2 illustrates the progression-based schedule.

The 4 per cent figure was selected to correspond to the 4 point factor utilized in calculating cost-of-living adjustments. Under the plan as it is currently operating, for each 4 point or 4 per cent change in the consumers' price index a 4 per cent adjustment is effected in salaries.

The 1955 revision did not materially alter the features of the cost-of-living plan itself. The new basic schedule with its uncomplicated 4 per cent progression formula now serves as the basis for the adjustment mechanism and endows the whole plan with a more rational foundation. The new plan pegs salary ranges and range assignments to the 1949 base year. Since 1949 is also the base year for the consumers' price index, adjustments are based upon increases in living cost since 1949 and added to salaries that also have a 1949 base.

³ As enacted in 1955, the schedule had only 38 ranges. In 1957, the legislature approved the addition of 7 ranges to the top of the schedule. The 1955 plan also provided 2 "longevity" steps above the maximum rates of each range. These "longevity" increments are designed to provide salary "merit" increases for employees who have been 3 years at their maximum rates.

TABLE II
SELECTED BASIC AND ADJUSTED RANGES (1958)
OF THE MINNESOTA COST-OF-LIVING PAY PLAN

| <i>Basic Ranges</i> | | <i>1958 Adjusted Ranges</i> | |
|---------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|
| 1 | \$150-156-162-168-175- 182 | | |
| 2 | 156-162-168-175-182- 189 | | |
| 3 | 162-168-175-182-189- 197 | | |
| 4 | 168-175-182-189-197- 205 | | |
| 5 | 175-182-189-197-205- 213 . . . | 1 | \$175- 182- 189- 197- 205- 213 |
| 6 | 182-189-197-205-213- 222 . . . | 2 | 182- 189- 197- 205- 213- 222 |
| | | 3 | 189- 197- 205- 213- 222- 231 |
| | | 4 | 197- 205- 213- 222- 231- 240 |
| | * * * * * | 5 | 205- 213- 222- 231- 240- 250 |
| | | 6 | 213- 222- 231- 240- 250- 260 |
| 40 | 694-722-751-781-812- 844 | | |
| 41 | 722-751-781-812-844- 878 | | * * * * * |
| 42 | 751-781-812-844-878- 913 | | |
| 43 | 781-812-844-878-913- 950 | | |
| 44 | 812-844-878-913-950- 988 . . . | 40 | 812- 844- 878- 913- 950- 988 |
| 45 | 844-878-913-950-988-1028 . . . | 41 | 844- 878- 913- 950- 988-1028 |
| | | 42 | 878- 913- 950- 988-1028-1069 |
| | | 43 | 913- 950- 988-1028-1069-1112 |
| | | 44 | 950- 988-1028-1069-1112-1156 |
| | | 45 | 988-1028-1069-1112-1156-1202 |

Source: *Salary Ranges for Minnesota State Employees*, July 1, 1957.
 Civil Service Department, State of Minnesota.

The simplicity of such adjustment can be observed in Table 2. To arrive at the adjusted rates authorized by the index all that is required is moving up the range schedule one range or step for each 4 per cent rise in the consumers' price index. Thus, the minimum rate for range 1, adjusted to June 30, 1958, was identical with the fourth step in basic range 1 or the minimum rate for basic range 5—\$175. Additional adjusted ranges can be computed as needed by the same 4 per cent progression method, as has been necessary for adjusted ranges 41 through 45.

Under this new system there can be none of the distortion that undermined the old schedule. Ranges and steps will bear the same relationships with immediately higher and lower ranges and steps regardless of the absolute dollar values they have. What is critical if a compensation plan is to retain its internal consistency is the persistence of the same salary relationships, as provided in the initial salary determinations, unless these are altered through procedures and by overt actions stipulated by the plan itself. The 1955 schedule assures the stability of these relationships. Consequently, an employee

knows that a 1-step pay hike for whatever reason will be a 4 per cent raise regardless of the range to which his position is assigned or the number of cost-of-living increments that have been added to his pay over the years.

Problems Remain But Plan Widely Accepted

Although the 1955 revision eliminated major defects in the cost-of-living plan, certain important problems remain. The infrequency of adjustment could again produce hardship as it did in 1950-51. Unlike many of the escalator pay clauses in effect in private wage plans with their quarterly adjustment opportunities, the Minnesota program accommodated only annual adjustment—even these come after 6 months have elapsed once the need for adjustment has been determined.

One of the consequences of the plan's workings over the years has been a tendency to perpetuate the economic status quo existing when the initial range assignments were made. While salaries may be geared to measurable changes in living costs as re-

vealed in periodic indices reporting fluctuations in prices, wage scales may still lag seriously behind changes in the level or style of living, *qualitative* changes not reported by the indices.

The system does permit relief from inequitable and obsolete salary relationships. The state civil service director has and uses his power to allocate positions in the classification plan and to reassign classes to new salary ranges. Such changes tend to be narrow in scope, however, being limited to a single class or class series. Furthermore, these transactions can in no way be considered the over-all kind of review of salary policies that is desirable.

Employees and administrators do agitate occasionally for particular salary revision,

but the cost-of-living plan has had the effect of dulling the urgency for broad-scale review of wage policy. Most parties are inclined to let well enough alone.

There seems little likelihood, moreover, that a program so widely supported by employees, executives, and legislators will be drastically modified or discontinued, at least so long as it does not produce salary cuts.

With the cost-of-living plan, wage levels have kept fairly close to increases in measurable living costs. There is certainly no assurance that even this much could be achieved if salary levels depended upon the annual or biennial administrative and legislative budget struggles and the generosity of politically accountable officials already much besought by tax conscious constituents.

Editorial

(Continued from page 2)

talk about a trend away from the independent civil service commission. Such recommendations were made in the series of state "Little Hoover Commission Reports," in the presentations of many professors of public administration, and in the proposed Clark bill, applying to the U. S. federal service.

Here are some questions that call for answers capable of "holding water." Actually, is there a serious trend away from the traditional concept? How can we find out whether a commission could do a better job of "keeping the spoilsman out" if its major responsibility was to check on political activities, advise management, and serve as an appeals body? Parenthetically, it should be noted that none of the proposed changes would abolish the commission.

But can we be sure there is only one type of organizational form for the personnel function for all time and all types of communities? If politics are still an issue, are we satisfied with the present method of maintaining clean government through the traditional independent personnel agency? And if it does appear that the long-estab-

lished method stands greater chance of serving the general welfare, what can be done to convince elected and appointed political leaders that the present system well serves their interest as well as the public interest? Can the goals of lay citizen commissions and those of political leaders be achieved regardless of the "form" or "type" of personnel agency?

These are only a few of the questions we need to explore with objective deliberation. Lasting answers cannot be found without careful review of all pertinent facts, and judicious weighing of evidence. Due consideration must be given to the varying degrees of administrative maturity and sophistication of public jurisdictions.

That's why we believe that issues, people, and outlook are inextricably intertwined. Perspective and acumen will go far toward solving personnel issues to the satisfaction of all parties to public personnel administration—public, employee, and elected official.

What could hold greater human interest for those working in the personnel vineyard?

Kenneth O. Warner

EDITOR

Personnel Administration in the Middle East

Ferrel Heady

Accepted social patterns of action in the Mid-East modify Western methods of personnel administration with interesting results.

EVERY MODERN STATE, as a condition of survival, must maintain a civil service competent to perform the complex tasks of present-day government. This is true even of the transitional states of the Middle East, entangled in the turmoil of political upheaval and perhaps uncertain as to their fate as separate political units.

In developing their embryonic systems of personnel administration, these states have clearly been influenced by older and more advanced systems, particularly those of Great Britain, France, Germany, and the United States. Nevertheless, they also exhibit significant variations from their Western counterparts which can only be explained in terms of environmental factors in Mid-East political life.

In this brief survey, the countries given special emphasis are Egypt, Greece, Iraq, Iran, Israel, Lebanon, and Turkey.* This group of Mid-East states includes a cross section of the diverse societies of the region, reflecting a variety of historical, religious, racial, language, and other associations.

Many Civil Service Laws

The legal basis for Mid-East personnel administration is ample, at least in quantity. Civil service laws tend to be lengthy and detailed, but frequently are outmoded and loaded with matter that does not merit statutory treatment. Many of the laws now in

* Much of the source material used here came from interviews held and from documents collected during the course of field research by the author in 1957 in Greece, Iraq, Iran, Lebanon, and Turkey. Assistance through a travel grant from the Faculty Research Fund of the Horace H. Rackham School of Graduate Studies at the University of Michigan is gratefully acknowledged, as is the unflinching helpfulness of government officials, university professors, and technical assistance personnel who provided information and interpretive comment.

force date from the period between World Wars I and II. A few are recent, and draft laws are under more or less active consideration in several states.

Of the countries studied, Greece adopted an elaborate and comprehensive civil service code in 1951, resulting from several years of consideration. Egypt adopted new civil service legislation in 1952 establishing a civil service commission and setting salary grades. In Israel, a partial civil service law was enacted in 1955, but a draft bill dealing with disciplinary matters was reportedly still under consideration at the end of 1956. Iraq enacted a new law in 1956. In both Turkey and Iran, draft laws have been formulated, circulated for comment, and considered by the national legislature, but not passed in their current form. Most of these laws, adopted and proposed, have drawn extensively upon French and German civil service codes, particularly in their stress upon the status and prerogatives of civil servants as a class.

Makeup of Personnel Boards

Responsibility for the conduct of personnel management is generally a ministry matter, although a decided trend points toward the creation of a central personnel agency with some powers of over-all supervision.

Greece set up a civil service supreme board when the civil service code was adopted. Under the jurisdiction of the prime minister, the board is made up of three categories of members. Seven permanent members are appointed for life from among high-ranking civil servants and university professors, and 4 members are appointed for 3-year terms (a professor appointed by the Faculty of Law of the University of Athens, and three general directors from as many ministries appointed by the permanent

board members). In addition, as many as 7 assessor members with advisory votes only may be appointed by the permanent members.

This large part-time board has a small staff of about 20, including secretarial personnel. Its jurisdiction does not include the judicial and military services, or the employees of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Its powers are hemmed about by restrictions, and several important provisions of the code have not been implemented, even after several years of operation.

A civil service commission was first set up in Israel in 1950, but did not begin functioning fully until 1954. This agency is headed by a single civil service commissioner, and has sections dealing with appointments and transfers, establishments, general regulations, discipline and training. Egypt established a civil service commission in 1952, with nominal independence, but reportedly dependent for support on the Ministry of Finance, which has been reluctant to provide it. A president heads the agency, assisted by a vice-president and 5 directors general, each in charge of a functional directorate.

In Iraq, a public service board of 5 members was authorized in 1956, but not actually created until over a year later. Its newness and the 1958 political overturn in Iraq make it impossible to judge the prospects of this agency. It does have considerable legal powers over recruitment, appointment, and promotion of officials, but a variety of personnel functions related to pay, leave, staffing patterns, and training remain with the Ministry of Finance. Lebanon also, in 1955, set up a civil service council consisting of 6 high-ranking officials serving on a part-time basis, but its duties are only investigatory and advisory. Central personnel agencies have been proposed but not established in both Turkey and Iran.

Thus, the general picture is still one of decentralized responsibility for personnel matters on a ministry-by-ministry basis, presumably under policies set forth by statute but which may not be uniformly followed. Such central control functions as exist are usually found in the Ministry of Finance and relate mostly to pay and allowances. The central personnel agencies in

operation suffer from inadequate grants of authority, ministry resistance, and less than full high-level support. Within the individual ministries, despite the extent of ministry autonomy, there is no well-developed pattern of personnel offices. As part of a ministerial secretariat, there is likely to be an official charged with maintenance of essential personnel records, whose assignment is primarily clerical rather than involving the exercise of significant discretion. The legal and organizational arrangements, therefore, are still rudimentary despite numerous recent efforts looking toward statutory codification of civil services policies and the creation of central personnel agencies.

Excessive Personnel Rosters

One of the most prevalent features of personnel administration in the Mid-East is the inadequacy of ways of relating staff to workload. Local observers and outside investigators agree almost without exception that there are more civil servants on the payrolls than would be required for efficient conduct of government business. However, no country has managed to deal with this problem directly or satisfactorily.

Excessive personnel rosters can be traced to a number of causes. These include the relatively high prestige of public employment, the scarcity of job opportunities elsewhere due to chronic general unemployment or underemployment in the economy, wartime expansion of government employment, acceptance of the idea of using public jobs to pay social debts, and legal restrictions upon dismissal of civil servants. As a result, in large segments of these public services, hours of work are short, absenteeism and tardiness are widespread, and attention to work on the job is not demanded and may not even be possible.

Sporadic attempts may be made to ameliorate overstaffing. A favorite device, recently used in Lebanon, Iran, and Iraq, is to place a blanket ban on new appointments, which is apt to produce other maladjustments without accomplishing much by way of staff reduction. Iran has worked out a unique system of assigning excess personnel to a category of "waiting for service" employees, who remain on the payroll at 2/3 or 1/2 regular pay depending upon grade.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Another common stratagem is to create a temporary "purge" committee with far-reaching powers of dismissal. One guideline for these committees is that they should seek to eliminate excess civil servants, although punishment for corruption, or some other objective, may be more important in such purges. A formal purge committee was at work in Iraq during 1957, and a few years earlier in Iran. More openly, political purges are apt to take place with a decisive change of regime, as in Egypt after 1952.

Another serious dilemma stems from the practice of specifying by law the numbers and grades of positions in the permanent cadre of each ministry. Resulting rigidities in staffing patterns, and handicaps due to the low pay attached to positions in the cadre (which will be discussed in more detail later), force agencies with high-priority programs and sufficient political support to evade these normal limitations by resorting to contractual employment or the hiring of "temporary" or "expert" employees. This has the practical effect of placing important segments of public employment outside the regular civil service system and thus free them from whatever controls may be in effect normally over selection, pay, and promotion.

Eligibility Lists Subject to Pressure

It is impossible to generalize about "normal" selection practices in the Middle East, except to say that no country (with the possible exceptions of Israel and Turkey) has a comprehensive program for competitive selection which would be considered satisfactory by Western standards. Although language about merit as the basis of choice may be set forth in constitution or statute, the ministry concerned is usually free to apply this criterion as it sees fit.

In Turkey, merit seems to be a real basis for selection. Most civil servants are chosen on a competitive basis through a committee on examinations or selection in each ministry, which either administers a formal examination or considers and passes upon the qualifications of candidates. An unusual feature of Turkish recruitment is the custom of ministry support of schooling of promising students, with a commitment of service in the sponsoring agency after graduation.

Iraq and Lebanon also administer some examinations on a ministry basis through ministry committees. Customarily, the minister is free to appoint any candidate who passes, and does not have to choose in order of rank on the examination list. Where there is no well-established merit tradition, this often means that the actual basis of choice may have little relation to competence. In Lebanon, where distribution of posts proportionately by religious sects has been a prime consideration, pass examinations have been used because competitive examinations with ranking of eligibles would interfere with sectarianism in selection. Even in a country like Greece, where a central personnel agency has been given legal powers to require and administer examinations on an interministerial basis, progress has been slow, the tendency being to grant exemptions from competitive examination quite freely rather than arouse ministry opposition.

Israel, beginning in 1951, appears to have made the most progress in holding regular general examinations for government positions. The Egyptian Commission has also made some headway in conducting examinations and enforcing a rule of selection in order of rank on eligible lists.

Degrees Take Place of Exams

In filling positions requiring professional or technical qualifications, the use of formal examinations of any kind is extremely rare. Instead, educational credentials are the common standard for measuring suitability. The personnel laws usually try to gear selection to the educational system, with the level of education attained determining eligibility for appointment, as well as grade and pay after entry. This emphasis places a tangible premium on degree-holding, and builds up immense pressure for educational institutions to lower standards and provide "cheap" degrees. Since traditional educational curricula have no particular relevance to the general needs of government service, and there is little attempt to relate individual programs of study to the duties to be performed after entry, this custom of stressing educational credentials produces poorer results than might be anticipated. It must be conceded, however, that some restraint on

discretion in appointment can be exerted by a requirement of minimum educational qualifications.

Law and practice concerning promotions within the service coincide quite closely in making seniority the overriding consideration. Length of service is easy to apply and fits in with tradition. In the absence of adequate systems for evaluation of performance, or for conducting promotional examinations, an alternative to seniority would be hard to devise even if it were acceptable. In an effort to work out such a device, Egypt has adopted a quota system permitting a percentage of vacancies to be filled on the basis of merit, while reserving most positions for promotion in the usual way by length of service. In practice, this does not seem to have meant much of a departure from progression by seniority.

Systems of Classification and Compensation

A prevalent handicap to equitable treatment of civil servants is the haphazard and outdated treatment of status and pay. Grading of positions is mainly for the purpose of determining pay. A rank system of status is preferred to the American approach of classification of positions on the basis of duties and responsibilities.

No Mid-East country has a comprehensive position classification plan in operation, although in Iran a sporadic classification project has been underway for several years as part of the technical assistance program. As a result, the grade of a civil servant has no uniform relationship to the work performed. Education and length of service are much more significant factors in determining grade. The generally chaotic condition of job classification resembles that found elsewhere when no systematic effort has been made to examine the duties of positions and relate positions to one another in a meaningful way.

By way of illustration, in Lebanon the law provides two categories of civil servants—temporary and permanent. Temporary posts may be created and abolished by decree issued by the Council of Ministers. The permanent positions in the cadre of each ministry are created and abolished by law.

The cadre of a ministry consists of a general or administrative category, and a technical category depending on the functions of the ministry (such as diplomatic and consular services, gendarmerie and police, schoolteachers, etc.).

The administrative cadre is divided into six classes, each characterized as to age for entry, educational qualifications, promotional requirements, and salary range. These classes progress from such posts as doormen and drivers in the lowest grouping to directors general in the highest. Categories in the Greek permanent civil service likewise are broad groupings according to level of work, with each related to level of education.

A Grade 9 Janitor

The situation in Iran shows a typical scheme carried to extremes. The basic law of 1922 established nine grades of employees and set pay rates for them (the base pay has been unchanged for the last 15 years). Entry into the service is to one of the four lower grades depending upon educational qualifications. A wartime modification of the law put promotion strictly on the basis of seniority, with no regard to duties performed.

As a consequence, a secretary with long service may have worked his way all the way up to the highest grade, while a newly-employed secretary doing identical work may be at the lowest grade. Supervisors of shorter service may be at a lower grade with lower pay than older subordinates; an administrator at Grade 5 may have a janitor on duty outside his door at Grade 9. Utter confusion in the relationship between duties, status, and pay is the product of this system, and the only remedy is drastic reform action.

The Pay Straitjacket

Compensation laws for regular civil service positions tend to take the form of minute specification of pay rates attaching to positions in the authorized cadre, with modification possible only through legislative action. Such "bareme" laws place the civil service at a competitive disadvantage and make improvements difficult or impossible. Widespread efforts are made as a conse-

quence to escape from this pay strait-jacket. One device has already been referred to, by means of which favored agencies are exempted from the ordinary requirements altogether or are permitted to evade by employment of "experts" or "technicians" at special rates and under less binding commitments as to tenure.

For instance, the Highway Department in Turkey has largely freed itself from the confines of the regular civil service pay law. By such methods as interpreting "craftsmen" to include engineers and by employment on what is technically a per diem although actually a permanent basis, this agency has succeeded in developing its own "career service" at better pay, with advantages to both the agency and its employees. The economic development agencies in Iraq and Iran have received comparable favorable treatment, as have government corporations and public enterprises in several countries.

Fringing the Jacket

Where base pay rates are fixed at low levels which cannot be changed or evaded, various fringe benefits may be developed as a partial substitute. This is the explanation for complicated allowance systems to supplement base pay. In Greece, allowances are paid for a variety of reasons, including number of dependents, length of service, overtime, duty in Northern Greece, service on committees, and assignment to duty "on loan." The incentive of qualifying for these allowances may explain otherwise baffling features of administrative practice, such as the remarkable Greek fondness for committees. Bonus payments on special holidays or at the end of the year are sometimes offered as another supplement. Generous pension plans, at least in theory, also are intended to add to the financial appeal of government work.

Insufficient pay often is the indirect cause of such common phenomena as short working hours (the normal work week is usually under the 40-hour standard in the United States), an excessive number of holidays with pay (reaching as high as 50 in Greece shortly after the war), open or tacit permission for civil servants to hold a second job on the outside or to practice professionally

in addition to government duties, and general laxness concerning tardiness, absenteeism, and attention to work during office hours.

The cost of this pattern of inequities is hard to calculate, but it is tragically high. Governments operating under conditions of basic poverty of resources realize far less output than could be achieved even under these limitations. Potentially promising candidates refrain from entering the civil service; able public officials often leave and the mediocre and poor ones find it possible and profitable to stay; lines of hierarchical supervision and responsibility are blurred; morale and *esprit d'corps* fall; efficiency of performance is low; and public regard for the public service drops. However, ways of coping with this dilemma are not easy to find, and no Mid-East state has as yet succeeded in devising a satisfactory system for dealing with rank and pay problems.

Legal Status of Civil Servants

Despite numerous differences in details, the basic machinery for dealing with disciplinary cases shows a marked similarity in various countries. The influential outside pattern has clearly been French rather than British or American, as shown by the stress placed upon detailed provisions concerning disciplinary offenses and disciplinary penalties, reliance upon initial judgment by a disciplinary council, in which civil servants predominate, and appeal to some sort of independent administrative tribunal for serious offenses.

The statutory catalog of offenses (which may range as in Greece from such tangible matters as absenteeism or taking of bribes to intangibles such as "improper attitude in dealing with citizens, supervisors, and colleagues") seems intended both to inculcate desirable standards of conduct and to warn against transgression. Penalties which may be imposed for offenses are listed in order of severity and are usually grouped into minor and major categories, for the purpose of indicating whether or not final action can normally be taken in the ministry concerned.

The milder penalties, such as reprimand or temporary suspension, may be imposed

by the agency head. More severe penalties, including delay of promotion beyond normal time in grade, long-term suspension, demotion, and discharge can be made final only after a trial before a disciplinary council within the ministry. In Greece and Lebanon, each agency council consists of a judge as chairman and several permanent civil servants as members. In Iraq, the three members of each ministry disciplinary council are all senior officers of the ministry.

Where there is a council of state comparable to the *Conseil d'Etat* in France, which is customary, an appeal may be taken to it from the disciplinary action of the minister or ministry disciplinary council. As in the French legal system, the council of state, when it hears an appeal from disciplinary action against an official, cannot examine the question of guilt or innocence, or otherwise inquire into the merits of the case. It can only decide whether or not the action was legal, and annul the decision, if illegal, for specified reasons such as lack of jurisdiction of the administrative agency, procedural deficiencies of a serious nature, or abuse of power by the agency through improper use.

In Iraq, where there is no council of state, a general disciplinary council has been set up to hear appeals from decisions of agency disciplinary boards, with broad powers of review and reversal or modification of the ministry action. This decision can in turn be taken to the council of ministers for final disposition.

At all stages in the process of disciplinary action, the procedure to be observed is usually spelled out in minute detail in the governing law. A hearing is customary at the agency level, with decision by majority vote of the disciplinary board. No oral hearing is provided for consideration of a case by the council of state, where the proceeding is conducted in writing through submissions on behalf of the official and the agency.

Opinions differ as to whether the disciplinary procedures provided offer a feasible method of balancing individual claims to employment against the needs of the service for competent performance. Indications are strong that the system overstresses official prerogatives and does not function satisfactorily, even when it does operate. More-

over, the difficult procedure for taking disciplinary action may be a dead letter, leaving no practical means for dealing with an unsatisfactory tenure official. This is what has happened in Iran, where an elaborate statutory disciplinary system has been inoperative since 1941. Almost no disciplinary action is taken against civil servants; in extreme cases, the most drastic remedy is transfer to the inactive list at reduced pay.

Purging Committees

The periodic purge movements mentioned earlier reflect in part a reaction against the rigidities and delays of the ordinary disciplinary methods, by temporarily authorizing a special agency to investigate charges and take disciplinary action, including suspension and dismissal, without following the normal procedures.

The purge committee in Iraq is a recent example. It was established in 1956 on a 1-year basis, with a membership of two senior judges, a representative of the Ministry of Justice and a representative of the Ministry of Education. The committee carried on its work by examining the personnel files of large numbers of public officials, receiving complaints, and launching such investigations as it saw fit. There was no time limit on the inquiry, and charges of misbehavior years earlier were considered. The Committee carried on its own field investigations seeking evidence, in addition to relying on police sources.

At closed hearings, civil servants under investigation were confronted with charges and presented their defense. Recommendations made by the Purge Committee were referred to the council of ministers for final action, which reportedly was approval in each instance. Lists of officials suspended were published, but reasons for action were not publicly revealed. About 400 suspensions resulted, including a considerable number of higher civil service officials. No system of appeal was provided from the decisions of the purge committee as approved by the Council of Ministers.

Resort to such purge committees reveals the uncertain condition of standards for official conduct in the Middle East. The inadequacies of legal straitjackets overprotective

of civil servants may justify emergency action to cope with an accumulation of misbehavior. However, a purge campaign can easily cover up improper dismissals, not related to official misconduct, carried out under the guise of reform. Under such circumstances, the most elaborate legal safeguards are of no avail to the civil servant under attack. A purge is likely to combine both objectives, even though the over-all results are beneficial. A thorough reconsideration and overhaul of disciplinary systems appears called for if maintenance of competence and honesty in the civil service is to be made feasible without resort to risky emergency purge measures.

Mid-East Should Not Copy West

Two basic environmental conditions are most important in explaining the differences between Mid-East personnel systems and their Western models. One is the comparative poverty of resources of Mid-East states for the task of building up and maintaining a competent civil service, which results in a combination of overstaffing in *quantity* of employees with understaffing in *quality*. The

second condition is the divergence of critical accepted social patterns of action from those which underlie the public service systems of the West. Mid-East societies retain many of the social characteristics of earlier eras. Value orientations which result make it both unrealistic and unfair to apply Western standards in evaluating the conduct of personnel administration. This also explains why Mid-East countries when borrowing from the West have tended to stress those features of Western personnel administration which can be most easily absorbed and to avoid or de-emphasize those that require major adjustments in social values.

Mid-East personnel administration, despite widespread incorporation of Westernized features, is still dominated by the heritage of the past and ill-prepared for the demands of the present or the future. If these demands are to be met, it must be mainly through local initiative and leadership, which makes skillful and selective use of foreign experience and techniques, but adapts to regional realities which rest on history, tradition, and an emerging nationalism.

Quality Workers Needed by U.S. . . .

The educational attainment of women is of great importance because we know that the worker of tomorrow—perhaps more than at any other period in our history—will need to be a skilled worker—a person who strengthens our working population by quality as well as by quantity.

The importance of quality in our future labor force is underscored by projections of the Department of Labor. These projections, which are based on the assumption that our economy will continue to grow and expand, indicate that we will have some 10 million more workers in 1965 than we had a decade earlier.

Women are making progress in practically every field of endeavor, even in those which once were barred to them. Decennial census records tell us that in 1950 there were far more women in so-called non-traditional fields than in 1940. To be specific, in 1950, there were 6,500 women engineers, about nine times as many as in 1940; 7,500 women chemists, about four and a half times as many as in 1940; and 55,660 women accountants and auditors, some three times as many as in 1940. And there are over 1,000,000 women managers, officials, and owners or part-time owners of businesses in 1958—more than twice as many as in 1940.—From a speech by Alice K. Leopold, Assistant to the U.S. Secretary of Labor, as reported in *Vital Speeches*, May 15, 1958.

Effective Steps in Conducting Job Audits and Appeals

Robert A. Gross

Emphasis on good principles and practices in job classification increases acceptance, expedites appeals for St. Louis' Department of Personnel.

BASED PRIMARILY on the practices of the Department of Personnel of the City of St. Louis, this discussion centers attention on the principles and techniques of position classification audits and appeals with the emphasis (we hope) on "good" practice rather than an analysis of both "good" and "bad."

Our system attempts to follow the basic principles and methods outlined in the "bible," *Position-Classification in the Public Service*, written under the chairmanship of Ismar Baruch for the Civil Service Assembly, and the classification plan originally installed in 1943 by Public Administration Service and reviewed again by them in 1953-54. The Public Personnel Association publication, "Elements of Position Classification in Local Government," is also a valuable handbook.

Initiating Job Studies

Job classification studies are initiated in many ways: by the personnel agency in undertaking large scale reviews by departmental organization or by occupational groups; individual or group studies arising from reorganizations, transfers of functions, or technological changes; from information received during studies of other positions and through formal or informal contacts with operating officials.

A second major source of audits arise during routine operations of the central agency. These include review of personnel requisitions for new or replacement positions, wherein the description of duties and responsibilities indicate further information is needed in a field audit, and review of proposed transfers and demotions.

We have also found that by utilizing space on the six months' probationary and subsequent annual employees serv-

ice ratings, we provide supervisory and administrative personnel with an opportunity to notify us at least annually of any change in assigned duties and responsibilities of each position in the city service. This is a particularly valuable aid to an agency whose classification staff is too small to undertake periodic large scale organizational or occupational audits.

The third major source of job audits are individual or group requests from employees, employee groups, supervisors, and appointing authorities, made usually in writing to the Department of Personnel.

File Control of Information

When the classification division has been notified or authorized to begin an audit, an entry is made in a chronological job study log or journal. At the same time, for cross-index purposes, an index card is prepared and filed alphabetically by employee's name. After completion of the study, the audit report is filed by organizational unit.

Thus, for future reference, the results of an audit may be located chronologically, by employee name, or by organizational unit.

Routing the Questionnaire

A set of three position-classification questionnaire forms, enclosed in a double sheet of printed instructions and suggestions for completing the forms, are sent with a letter to the appointing authority, notifying him of the impending audit and requesting that the employee be furnished the forms and informing him of the procedure to be followed. The instruction sheet is a detailed explanation of the classification survey and detailed instructions and illustrations on how to complete the form. It also contains instructions to supervisors and administra-

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

tive officials regarding their role in completing the form.

The employee completes one of the three copies in pencil or ink in his own handwriting; this copy gives data pertaining to his name, title, place of work, shifts, etc., and a complete first-person statement of his assigned duties and responsibilities broken down according to his best estimates of the time it takes him to perform each task or assignment, and using as much space as he considers necessary to describe his job completely.

He also enters the name and class title of his immediate supervisor and names and class titles of persons under his supervision, if any.

He then completes items relating to equipment used, the nature and extent of the instructions received, the nature and extent of the review or check on his work, and contacts with other departments, outside organizations, and the general public.

The employee types, or gives his handwritten copy to his supervisor to have copies typed of, the other two copies of the form, after which the employee reads again, dates, and signs the questionnaire. His first copy is returned to him for his files, and the two remaining copies are given to the employee's immediate supervisor.

The supervisor reviews the employee's statements and makes comments, indicating inaccuracies and additional information. The employee's statements are *not* to be changed. He then indicates the most important duties of the position, and his opinion as to the basic and desirable qualifications needed to fill the position. This includes general and special education, length and kind of experience, licenses or certificates, special knowledges, skills, and abilities, and age, sex, physical or other factors.

This information is typed on the two copies, signed, and forwarded to the department head for his comments, additions, and signature. The typed and signed copy is returned to the personnel agency, and the carbon is kept in the originating department.

Enter the Analyst

The completed questionnaire form is logged in the job study journal, matched with the originating request documents, and

given to the assigned classification analyst who now, or prior to this time, begins research in the personnel records for data to assist in the audit. In an agency with good record-keeping practices, there is normally considerable valuable information available.

In the classification unit, the analyst may utilize previous audit reports on the same, similar, or connected positions; class specifications on the class series and related classes; prior classification questionnaires on the same position as well as all those in the same and related classes and in supervisory and subordinate positions; original allocation lists; and organizational, functional, and work flow charts of the unit under study. Review of the employee's central personnel record file, among other things, includes the personnel requisition which contains statements of duties and responsibilities at the time the employee was appointed; annual service ratings with notations regarding changes in duties; correspondence or reports relating to the employee's position and the incumbent's work history in the present and former positions. Other data normally available to the analyst are budget documents, annual and special reports of the unit, and the departmental correspondence files. For positions in occupations unfamiliar to the analyst, class specifications of other governmental jurisdictions are helpful.

After thorough familiarization of all the data available, the analyst studies the employee's questionnaire for possible discrepancies, inconsistencies, and missing information, and makes notes for use during the field audit.

On-the-Job Interview

The classification technician next contacts the department head to enlist his cooperation, secure his preliminary views, and get supplemental information. He then proceeds down the chain of command and begins the actual field investigation.

Valuable as it is, the questionnaire cannot present a complete and accurate picture of each position. Important aspects of the work may be neglected, trivial matters overemphasized, responsibilities ballooned, or supervisors and employees may differ in conceptions of the job duties, etc. The on-the-job interview gives the employee "his day in

court," and employee and supervisory acceptance of the audit result is increased.

Interviewing techniques differ between analysts but the essential common element is to interview and observe the employee at his job and secure information from him, his supervisors, and his co-workers so that the analyst secures *all* of the *complete* facts. The facts are thoroughly analyzed and written in the Report of Classification Investigation following the guidelines and evaluation standards of the ultimate classification factors: (1) subject matter, function, profession or occupation represented; (2) difficulty and complexity of duties; (3) non-supervisory responsibilities; (4) supervisory and administrative responsibilities; and (5) qualification standards. All of the basic allocation factors can be considered under one or more of these ultimate factors. Space does not permit full discussion of this major topic.

Disposition of the Audit

After writing the audit, the report may be reviewed with the employee and supervisory personnel for a final check on the completeness and accuracy of the findings. A discussion of preliminary findings with the department head is usually valuable.

The report is submitted to the Chief of Classification and subsequently to the Director of Personnel, with supporting documents and written or oral recommendations for review and discussion including the effect of the study results upon other positions and classes in the service. Recommended revisions of class specifications, if needed, are also submitted. If additional information is needed, further field investigation is made.

The person or group having allocation responsibility issues the decision in the form of a letter or allocation notice to the person originating the audit request, copies going to the appointing authority and the employee in any event. The written Report of Investigation is typed in at least an original and one carbon with one copy for the classification unit files and the other for the employee folder file. Copies of the decision and other documents are attached to the Report and filed, and decisions entered on the log and the classification index files.

The Right of Appeal

Some agencies prefer also to notify the employee and appointing authority of the reasons for the decision in an effort to "sell" the result. Employees and appointing authorities may also be notified of the procedure and time limits of their appeal rights in the event of a decision not to their liking. In the event of reallocation of the position, the question of employee status arises, a subject in itself not covered in this topic.

In the event of appeal of the position allocation, a further investigation of job duties may be warranted, especially for gathering facts regarding points raised by the appellant in his appeal request. The class specification should be available for review by the appellant.

The size, legal provisions, and organizational structure of the central personnel agency will determine the appeals process. Large agencies, for example, may create or maintain classification appeal boards to make recommendations to the allocating authority, or appeals may be heard directly by the civil service commission as an appeal from the allocation, an administrative act. Such appeals may be informal or formal. In St. Louis, the appellant may be represented by counsel if he chooses, as may the director of personnel (by an attorney assigned from the law department); witnesses may be subpoenaed by either side, and all testimony is transcribed under oath for the permanent records of the commission for possible appeal to the courts. Under the Administrative Review Act in Missouri, such decisions may be appealed to the courts.

Justifying the Allocation

The burden of proof of error in allocation should lie on the appellant for a number of reasons, basic of which, in my opinion, is the factor that position allocation is a subjective administrative action that should be sustained unless manifest error or malice can be proven. The appellant should be required to state his case first.

The position classifier or personnel director should have the opportunity of presenting the considerations which appeared to justify the allocation. Items normally to be

included in the record would include class specifications of the disputed classes, the Report of Investigation, and written or oral statements giving the reasons for the decision.

Detailed position-to-position comparisons should be avoided as much as possible unless ordered by the appeal body, and time given for further investigation. Unsupported statements or opinions by the appellant about a comparable position should not be accepted, as the appellant is normally not a trained classification analyst and does not have complete knowledge of positions other than his own. Further, position-to-position comparisons, if necessary, should apply to all positions in these classes in the entire service. Both sides and the Hearing Body should have the right of cross-examination.

Supplemental information may include organization, work-flow and functional charts, manuals of procedures, departmental reports, samples of forms or equipment used, supervisor's instruction manuals or description of duties, and the employee's personnel record.

The hearing itself should not be restricted to courtroom procedures or rules of evidence, and considerable leeway should be allowed so that the appeals body may have complete information in a coherent and orderly manner. The transcript and exhibits should be reviewed prior to the decision being issued. The decision should be formal and in such form as may be proper for court

review if such review is permissible under law.

The appeals decision should be noted on the Report of Investigation and other classification records, in the employee's file, and in the official records of the agency, such as Minutes of the Commission.

Looking Back

With approximately 9,000 classified employees in 540 classes of positions and using the basic principles and procedures noted in this paper, during the past 5½ years we have conducted one complete resurvey of every position in the service, one restudy of 815 positions comprising an entire city division, and about 400 individual and group position audits. There have been 23 appeals to the civil service commission on position classification during this period (including one mass appeal by 159 employees in 15 classes); the appeals of two individuals were granted as a result of their request for change in allocation.

I should like to mention in closing that we often like to think of our field as being somewhat scientific in the application of the principles of pure classification techniques in the making of allocation decision. However, we must always remember that there are a number of practical and realistic factors that must be taken into consideration by the allocating authority. Perhaps this could be made the subject of a future discussion by some brave contributor.

Mayor Gets Intimate . . .

New York City shows that it is in real earnest in its training program for it has established the precedent of having top officials as the speakers at a 10-lecture course, including Mayor Robert F. Wagner, Comptroller Lawrence E. Gerosa, commissioners of city departments, and Budget Director Abraham D. Beame. It's an in-service training course to acquaint city employees with the intimate details, as well as the broad service objectives, of operations of the city government. Some of the topics are highly specialized and will particularly benefit employees working in particular fields.

Other jurisdictions would do well to have the Governor, the Mayor, and other high officials as lecturers in training courses, and let the employees ask questions that the speaker will answer.—From the *Civil Service Leader*, September 23, 1958.

1958 Business Meeting of the Public Personnel Association

Kenneth O. Warner

A highlight summary of the Association's Annual Business Meeting, including excerpts from the President's address.

THE 1958 INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE on Public Personnel Administration, sponsored by the Public Personnel Association, was held in Chicago, Illinois, September 28-October 2. Almost 1,000 delegates and their wives attended this Conference, including 50 representatives from 22 different countries besides the United States and Canada. The annual business meeting of the Public Personnel Association was called to order by President William W. Shaw, with 250 members in attendance.

Election of Officers

In accordance with the PPA bylaws, President Shaw first called for a report from the Nominating Committee. This Committee consisted of the following:

Chairman: DR. JOHN M. PFIFFNER, Chairman, Personnel Commission, Los Angeles City Schools.

Committee members: HERBERT W. CORNELL, Secretary and Chief Examiner (retired), Milwaukee City Service Commission; J. STANLEY FRAZER, Director of Personnel, Alabama State Personnel Board; J. A. MURRAY, Director of Organization and Classification, Civil Service Commission of Canada; JOHN A. WATTS, Director of Civilian Personnel, U. S. Department of the Air Force.

On behalf of the Nominating Committee, Chairman John M. Pfiffner placed in nomination the names of the following:

For President: JOSEPH W. HAWTHORNE, General Manager, Civil Service Commission, City of Los Angeles, California.

For vacancies on the Executive Council: JOHN D. FOSTER, Personnel Director, Port of New York Authority; and ANGUS LAIRD,

Merit System Director, Florida Merit System.

There being no further nominations, on motion duly made and seconded, the membership cast unanimous ballots for the persons nominated by the Committee. Accordingly, JOSEPH W. HAWTHORNE was elected President for a 1-year term, commencing January 1, 1959; and John D. Foster and Angus Laird were elected members of the Executive Council, both for 3-year terms commencing January 1, 1959.

Election to Honorary Life Membership in the Public Personnel Association

President William H. Shaw presented the nomination of Charles E. Dunbar, Jr., New Orleans, Louisiana, for Honorary Life Membership in the Public Personnel Association in accordance with previous action taken by the Executive Council under the PPA bylaws. On a rising vote, the membership unanimously elected Mr. Dunbar to Honorary Life Membership; Mr. Dunbar was conducted to the platform by Honorary Life Members Dr. John M. Pfiffner and Mr. Herbert W. Cornell.

Citation read by President Shaw. President Shaw then read a citation honoring the work and deeds of Mr. Dunbar, as follows:

"To Charles E. Dunbar, Jr.,—

"For forty years, at great personal sacrifice of time and money, you labored for the institution of a merit system in the state and local governments of Louisiana before seeing the first true state and city civil service systems established as a result of your efforts. Serving as chairman of the Louisiana State Civil Service Commission initially, and when the state system was eliminated in

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

1948, working once again to reinstate it, this time protected by laws which you and your committee carefully redrafted and were successful in having them protected by being embedded in the state constitution—you saw its return to life in 1952.

"For many years a member of the Public Personnel Association and its sister organization, the National Civil Service League, and currently serving as vice-president of the National Civil Service League, you have continued your efforts and interests in modern public personnel administration, in recent years having served as liaison officer of the Louisiana State Civil Service Commission.

"Through years of study and effort in the light of the volatile political history of Louisiana, you devised unique methods of selecting and depoliticalizing civil service commissions and saw the wisdom of establishing a citizen organization, the Louisiana Civil Service League, as a continuous defender of the merit system.

"You, through your many and varied activities of local and national magnitude, have continuously kept before your associates the need of modern public personnel administration. As a professor of law at Tulane University Law School, through your business activities, while serving as president of the Chamber of Commerce of New Orleans; through your work with the American Law Institute and your long personal friendships with other nationally prominent individuals such as Murray Seasongood of Cincinnati, and the late Arthur T. Vanderbilt of New Jersey; through the interest you have shown in your students who have gone out to practice law and to hold public positions, you have championed the cause of the merit system. In your service as President of the Louisiana Bar Association, as the father of the present corporation law of the State of Louisiana, through the opportunities you have seized when honored by institutions of higher learning, you have never ceased to keep before the people, not only of your state but of the nation, the advantages of a modern merit system.

"The Public Personnel Association honors these qualities you have exhibited so well by conferring upon you the status of Honorary Life Membership."

Mr. Shaw then presented Mr. Dunbar with a beautiful, handlettered, commemorative plaque.

A Word from President Shaw

A summary of Mr. Shaw's remarks to the membership follows:

The experience of the past 2 years as president of the Public Personnel Association has been stimulating in every respect. I express to you my deep appreciation for the honor and privilege and for the opportunity to serve this organization.

From my visits to the Regional Conferences during the past 2 years, certain impressions stand out. Within the framework of this organization, a bewildering variety of activities go on. Here meet members of commissions, technicians, lay citizens, academicians, employees, management, and other interests. While each has his common problems, each also has special interests to which, in his opinion, the Association should devote greater attention.

Within this organization are the neophyte and the sophisticate—the newcomer with the "original" idea and the "oldster" who has heard it before. Herein meet functional specialists, departmental personnel officers, and representatives of many lands who speak many tongues. Thus our problems, our methods, and our horizons have expanded to a scope which shortly before were never dreamed of.

Through meetings, periodicals, reports, services, and special studies this Association pours forth the everchanging subject matter of our field. These activities reflect the constant broadening of public personnel administration and emphasize the need of widened knowledge and greater humility as one gropes toward the wisdom of maturing experience. So members of our Association read, discuss, and ponder the contributions of psychology, political science, economics, anthropology, sociology, history, philosophy, and mathematics, as the subject matter of these fields bear upon our own ever-expanding interest.

The zest and tang of all life is here. The contribution of the past is present and alive for us through the elders yet with us who bring back vividly the smoke of battle. We draw upon and profit by the experience of

Herbert Cornell, Eliot Kaplan, Charles Dunbar, Charles Messick, and many others. We fortify ourselves by knowledge of the experience of the past. We overcome our difficulties of today by mutual association, by congregating together and sharing our triumphs as well as our problems.

We find here pathos and humor without which one's work would be out of balance. By staying in the field, and by faithfully attending meetings, one gets to be known, accepted, and a participant. Time mellows, and soon the ease of long fellowship makes one a contributor to the folkways, the literature, and the humor of the field.

For another thing, as I traveled about over the extent of this land I heard expression after expression that the age of professionalism is not yet here. Attacks on the merit system, infiltrations, flank maneuvers, and other such tactical onslaughts were common. Only here and there were there islands of political stability, and adequate revenues available for the personnel function. Quite frequently the same old persistent problems of patronage, spoils politics, and lip service but not civil service, were discussed and rediscussed.

It remains clear that civil service reform is still a need that exists. It exists in many places where personnel agencies are in being as well as where there are no agencies. Many personnel officers feel the need of help from citizen groups if ever the merit system is to survive, let alone flourish.

In the field, I heard members cite the need to satisfy areas not now served by this organization. This has been voiced down through time; it connotes a growing field of work, peopled by individuals alert and eager to move on to uncharted areas, or to improve and expand those not now served adequately. But more and more services are being performed by this Association. Rapid progress is seldom found in any organization if it is to be lasting. Within this organization there is a desire to move as rapidly as our finances permit.

Of one thing I am certain. The Secretariat of the Association is a devoted and capable one. Ideas flow, not only from the staff to the membership, but also to the executive council and the president. Full-time staff, of a capability such as ours, is of inestimable

value. I express to it our heartfelt appreciation for work well conceived and well done. Occasionally, criticisms came to me, but they were few and understandable. Unanimity in so large an organization is impossible; what is so apparent is how few were the adverse and how many were the positive statements relating to the work of the Secretariat.

Within this Association I find an immense store of ability, with an endless stream of ideas, methods, and systems of thought. So it is that the Public Personnel Association becomes the appropriate medium for exchanging ideas.

It is pertinent to note how wide and deep are the interests of other organizations and disciplines in the field of public personnel administration. Many view the personnel function as theirs. General management does; political scientists do; psychologists do, and so we go. We need to recognize that here in this Association we meet to hammer out our knowledge, skills, and abilities; and that here will come those who want to know the answers and not somewhere else. Here all of public personnel administration has its home; here all the specialties in the field must congregate to contribute, learn, and experiment.

I am certain that if we hang together we will not hang separately—with due apologies to Benjamin Franklin—and I am certain that we will have adequate finances to move on if we continue to build as well in the future as we have in the past. Our Association is a growing one and it is a recognized one. Its stature is the result of recognized accomplishment.

Occupying the presidency of this Association at that point of time midway in its first century, I have found this organization full of vigor, capability, challenge, and devotion. In this Association must all of us not only remain, but grow and contribute so that the future will be as distinguished as the past.

Reports of PPA Committees

President Shaw called for and received brief reports from committees as follows:

Professional Development

President John Fisher stated that members of his committee had conferred during the

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

year through correspondence, and that members of the sub-committee on a Code of Ethics and a Statement of Principles (Personnel Credo), under chairmanship of Charles Meyer, met several times during the Conference. Mr. Fisher said the committee hopes to have a completed report for consideration by the members and executive council at the 1959 meeting in San Francisco.

Membership

Chairman Eugene C. Mathivet, Jr., presented the fourth annual report of the Membership Committee. He pointed out that 70 members of the Association contributed to committee efforts; they were instrumental in increasing membership from 793 in 1955 to 1,231 individuals by March 31, 1958. Results of committee efforts during 1958, Mr. Mathivet stated, had not been as gratifying as in the past. He believes, however, that there is great potential for increasing individual membership, that there is too little interest among some present members in promotional activities, and that the Committee should turn to the executive council to review its activities, and perhaps suggest some new and more effective approach to increasing individual membership in PPA.

Disaster Preparedness

Chairman Virgil Couch presented a brief report for the Committee on Disaster Preparedness. He called the members' attention to the second draft of a report which was made available at the Conference in multiple copies sufficient for each member to receive one. He stated that the Committee expected to revise the present report in the light of experience; meanwhile he welcomed comment on the report and urged members to study it with a view toward its implementation in their own agencies.

International Activities

On behalf of Chairman MacDonald Salter, who was out of the country, Mr. Hiram Phillips presented a report for the Committee on International Activities. He reviewed the purposes of the Committee as attempting

1. To strengthen personnel administra-

tion overseas through the services and facilities of PPA;

2. To find possible ways of stimulating cooperation and exchange of ideas; and
3. To establish a better liaison between PPA and international organizations respecting administration of international civil service.

Mr. Phillips pointed out that these areas need continuing study. The Committee proposed to further its purposes as follows:

1. To explore the possibilities of establishing PPA Chapters overseas, perhaps starting with a pilot project in San Jose, Costa Rica, which has an active civil service program;
2. To recommend that PPA explore the possibility of participation in workshops and seminars conducted by various governments, and governmental and international agencies, and provide necessary financial support for such activities;
3. To recommend that PPA provide leadership in making available more personnel literature in various languages, possibly starting with the selection of certain articles or books, arranging for their translation (and, if possible, their publication) and facilitate distribution of such writings.

Mr. Phillips concluded his report with the comment that the joint session of PPA and the American Society of Public Administration held at the Conference was a forward step, and one that went a long way toward the development of international cooperation and exchange of ideas.

Role of the Departmental Personnel Office

In the absence of Chairman Achille Albouze, Mr. Harry Chester presented this committee's report. Mr. Chester said the Committee reviewed a definition of the departmental office prepared earlier. The Committee agreed to undertake the following activities during 1959:

1. To prepare, with the assistance of the Secretariat, a directory of departmental personnel offices;

2. To obtain from central personnel officers a list of departmental personnel offices that fall within the Committee's definition;
3. To refine the "Model Statement" of the Role of the Departmental Personnel Office; and
4. To prepare, with the assistance of some university library, a bibliography on the subject of the departmental personnel office.

Committee on Personnel Function

Chairman Tom Page submitted the following report of the Committee on Organization of the Personnel Function.

The past year. The research design and proposal for a foundation grant to the Public Personnel Association to enable an extended study of the personnel function was circulated in draft form for criticism among committee members, to an advisory group consulted by the major foundations and to the executive council of PPA. The result of this process of criticism made possible the submission of a greatly clarified proposal but this was delayed by a misunderstanding of the willingness of the executive council to consider sponsoring such a proposal.

The future program. The present committee will submit a revised proposal for a research program to be supported by a specific grant from a foundation and to be initiated by the Public Personnel Association.

The Committee will seek to publish a *statement of research needs* in the field, through PPA channels. The statement will outline the issues needing exploration, probable factors influencing organization of personnel systems, and the methods by which fruitful study may be pursued. Purpose of this step is to encourage the research agencies, teachers who direct graduate research or conduct their own research, and professionals in personnel administration to undertake additional studies which will support the program recommended.

The Committee will sponsor an *inventory of organizational characteristics of public personnel systems* as an advance factual background for these studies.

The present committee members will indicate to the president and director of PPA

the extent of their continuing interest in and availability for advisory service in these efforts so that this committee itself may be reconstituted.

Director's Report

PPA Director Ken Warner explained that the membership would receive a full report on 1958 activities shortly after the first of the year. He said the Association continues to grow in agency members at a satisfactory rate, having increased from 480 to 525 since the last Annual meeting. Individual membership growth—important though it be—has not kept pace, he said.

Each phase of service activities carried on by the Secretariat continues to be drawn on by members in increasing volume, so that the staff is hard put to keep up with the requests for assistance. Many members attest the value of PPA services in carrying on their varied activities.

Earnings of the Association from membership fees, sale of publications, tests, and special consulting services are at an all-time high. The director commented, however, that PPA is now faced with increasing operating costs that bring its expenditures very close to its income, and that there may not be a surplus from current operations this year-end as was the case in several previous years.

The director warned that if PPA is to maintain its present quality and quantity of services, additional income must be found. Among increased expenses to be met are normal salary increments; costs of services performed outside of PPA such as mail table services, printing, supplies, and equipment; adequate space for staff and the augmented publication and test inventory. Although agency membership has almost doubled during the past 10 years only two additions to the Staff have been made.

The director concluded his remarks by extending thanks to the executive council, the president and members of the Association. He particularly acknowledged the assistance of all members of the PPA staff and said: "All of us in the Secretariat are primarily interested in two things: how we can render greater service to our entire membership, and how we can provide leadership to our field."

Resolutions

Chairman O. Glenn Stahl, on behalf of the Resolutions Committee, submitted resolutions which were unanimously adopted as follows:

Expression of sincere thanks to Miss Dolores Sheehan, chairman of the host committee, and all individuals and agencies participating in making successful the very memorable hospitality arrangements;

Special expression of appreciation to Governor William G. Stratton of Illinois, Mayor Richard J. Daley of Chicago, and Daniel Ryan, President, Cook County Board of Commissioners, for attending the opening session and extending warm greetings to members of the Association;

Expression of appreciation to John W. Macy, Jr., executive vice-president, Connecticut Wesleyan University, for his thoughtful keynote address;

Expression of appreciation to Robert E. Merriam, Deputy Assistant to the President for Interdepartmental Affairs, for his stimulating talk at the closing luncheon;

Expression of appreciation to the president and executive council for their leadership to the Association during the past year;

Expression of appreciation to Ken Warner, Jerry Donovan, and other staff members for their contribution to the success of PPA;

Extension of a warm hand of friendship from the Conference to the 47 colleagues and neighbors from other lands who joined with us in our deliberations in behalf of the merit principle and expressing the desire of PPA for continuing professional association, noting that delegates traveled from—excluding the United States, Canada, and the U.S. Territories and Possessions—these countries: Belgium, Bolivia, Brazil, Republic of China, Dominican Republic, Costa Rica, Ghana, Guatemala, Indonesia, Iraq, Israel, Japan,

Korea, Liberia, Libya, Netherlands, Panama, Philippines, Turkey, United Kingdom, Viet Nam.

Expressing sympathy to Mrs. Blix, widow of the late Ovid Blix, and giving testimony to his honorable career with the City Service Commission of Milwaukee and his outstanding service over the years to the Public Personnel Association, thus taking note of the death of Mr. Blix since the last Annual Conference.

Recognition of Outgoing and Incoming Executive Council Members

President Shaw invited outgoing Executive Council Members Joseph W. Hawthorne and Carl T. Sutherland to the platform, and former President Albert H. Aronson presented each with a plaque from the Association memorializing his service to the organization.

President Shaw then recognized Angus Laird, and John B. Foster, newly elected Executive members. Mr. Foster was absent; Mr. Laird expressed appreciation for the honor and promised to do his best in the interests of PPA.

Thereafter President Shaw recognized the president-elect, Joseph W. Hawthorne, who acknowledged the great honor accorded him and stated that he hoped to continue the splendid record made by outgoing President Shaw.

Mr. Aronson asked to be recognized in order to eulogize the good works of William W. Shaw as President and to present him with a plaque signifying the appreciation of the Association.

* * *

There being no further business, President Shaw adjourned the 1958 business meeting of the Public Personnel Association at 3:05 p.m.

Recruiting Among the Russians . . .

" . . . remember that when a Russian graduates from high school he has had 5 years of physics, 4 years of chemistry, 1 year of astronomy, 5 years of biology, 10 years of mathematics through trigonometry, and 5 years of a foreign language."—From a speech given by President Dwight D. Eisenhower at Oklahoma City, as reported in *Vital Speeches*, December 1, 1957.



research and results

edited by Cecil E. Goode

ASSESSING THE VALUE OF TRAINING

WE HAVE BLITHELY gone about training without much regard to whether it does any good. As in so many other personnel practices, we assume that training is good because the textbooks and professional literature say so or because others are doing it.

The relatively little research that has been done to determine the actual results of management and supervisory training has been discouraging. There is no clear evidence that such training is worthwhile. Most of the studies conducted to validate training techniques and programs for managers and supervisors have used the subjective responses of the trainees or their supervisors rather than observable performance. In other words, we have asked trainees and their supervisors whether the training did any good, and of course they have said "yes." That is what they are expected to say.

Training to develop manual skills is probably much more successful even though there is no attempt to evaluate it. The success of such training can be more easily observed even though the order and rigor of the scientific approach might be better.

Stating, simply, some of the principles of learning:

1. We learn best what we want to learn.
2. Learning should be geared to the expected behavior or application of the learning. In other words, learning should be acquired in much the same way it will be used.
3. Proof that learning has occurred is demonstrated in behavior and not merely in the verbalization of it.
4. The more we practice over a period of time what has been learned the more it will be retained and will continue to be used.

There is not much point in wasting money on training that does little or no good. Money and effort can be wasted either by teaching the wrong things or by using the wrong training methods. We need to devote more research effort to finding out what is needed for successful performance in a given field or line of work, and what methods are best to develop the needed skills, knowledge, and attitudes. Then we need to evaluate the worth of what we are doing, continually improving our efforts.

One of the most interesting and promising studies of the demands of executive leadership is being undertaken by the Educational Testing Service of Princeton, New Jersey. This is a 10-year project now in its third year and is employing some ingenious research techniques. The program includes these phases:

Criteria of executive performance.
Prediction of executive performance.
Psychological demands of the executive job.
Measurement of executive performance, and
What characterizes executives.*

An interesting study of the impact of sensitivity (human relations) training is being made by the Institute for Industrial Relations at the University of California, Los Angeles. This project is employing some novel study techniques including personality inventories, projective devices, analysis of diaries, sociometric measures, and clinical techniques. This is a healthy attempt to get away from the usual subjective attitudinal type of validation.

The current lack of proof that training of managers or supervisors does much good should not discourage efforts to improve. In-

* See "The Executive Study," John K. Hempill and Lewis B. Ward, *Personnel Administration*, January-February, 1958, Pp. 48-53.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

stead, this situation should constitute a challenge to managers and training officials to search for successful methods. In any training program, unless it is in an area and uses techniques that have definitely been proved, research should be as much an accepted part of the program as are instructional guides, flip charts, and practical demonstrations. In the article that follows, Michael G. Blansfield, Director of Management Development, Pacific Finance Corporation, Los Angeles, California, describes the current state of the training art and provides some suggestions on how to make research an integral part of training programs.

RESEARCH IN PERSONNEL TRAINING

Personnel training, in a formal sense, is a relatively young field. The famous Training Within Industry (TWI) Program of World War II was the harbinger of the proliferating programs of the last decade. The bell-weather of these programs has been the much touted executive or management development program. But with all this programming in evidence, one may search desperately for evidence of research activities that would validate the host of assumptions underlying these training efforts. While one may find stimulating studies on the effect of various behaviors on organizations and productivity, little can be found that attests to the effect of prior or subsequent training on the individuals so studied.

The No-Hope School

Some people who have been concerned with training results contend that there is little hope that we can ever objectively evaluate training. Such arguments center about the complexity of the process and the number of variables involved.¹ Others doubt the value of training programs, particularly in the human relations field, and would conclude that a "hands-off" attitude is the best policy.

These viewpoints apparently share a common distaste for the ambiguities apparent in this area and a willingness to rely upon such factors as "critical judgment" and "good common sense." Unfortunately, neither of these attributes is as reassuring as a properly executed research study. It might pay at this

point to look at some of the research now a matter of record in this area.

Current Research

One of the first things that will strike the reviewer of training research is the paucity of industrial studies. Most of the work that has been done has been initiated and conducted by our universities. The pattern of the famous Hawthorne experiments has been seldom repeated.

Looking first at the basic premise that workers who are systematically trained perform better than those not so trained, we can turn for support to the studies reported by Ghiselli and Brown² as well as Viteles.³ There would appear to be ample evidence to support this view.

Insofar as training techniques or methods are concerned there are some interesting studies pertaining to the effect of the knowledge of results on the training situation. The military services did a study on the teaching of Morse Code which featured immediate feedback of results and the use of "whole-learning"; it resulted in significant decrease of training time and an increase in the trainee success rate.⁴ There are a number of other studies supporting these conclusions reported by Viteles.⁵

In the area of human relations skills or the modification of attitudes and behavior, a number of significant studies have emerged. Seashore describes four approaches to the training of leaders for effective human relations in the recently published "Some Applications of Behavioral Research."⁶ The programs described are those conducted by International Harvester, Procter and Gamble Company, Detroit Edison Company, and the National Training Laboratories in Group Development. Based upon these analyses, Seashore hypothesizes that effective training in this area should take into account the social situation of the trainee, provide for evaluation and continuity of the training program, encourage adaption of programs through a continuous feedback mechanism and a reliance upon research procedures, methods, and results.

The results of discussion-centered human relations training has also been measured by Buchanan,⁷ Canter,⁸ and Blansfield⁹ with the

general conclusions that such programs can lead to job-related behavioral changes.

On the other hand, an interesting study reported in two parts in *Human Relations* concludes that training was not related to any of the criteria of supervisory effectiveness used in the study, and, further, that trained foremen did not display a different style of supervision from untrained foremen.¹⁰

In the same vein, Taylor, Berry, and Block studied the use of "brain-storming" in the facilitating of creative thinking and concluded that it actually inhibits such creativity rather than releases it.¹¹

Research in the Future

These studies are not, of course, a complete listing of the research that bears directly or indirectly on personnel training. They may be regarded, however, as a fairly representative sample. As such, they open the question of the future since, obviously, so much in the way of training concepts, procedures, and methods is still untested. This means that annually millions of dollars and man-hours are expended in efforts which may be not only incapable of achieving their stated goals but may have detrimental effects on the sponsoring organization.

If there were no hope of measurement, such blind flying could be condoned, but the evidence points to the inescapable conclusion that research can be done, and that it will pay off. Under these conditions it becomes the duty of those sponsoring or administering training programs to build into the program a research design that will assess the results of the program.

Some General Guidelines

If we are to do an acceptable job of building research designs into our training programs, we must follow certain general guidelines. I would suggest that some of these include:

1. *Participation in the planning of the research design.* If people are involved in the planning of a research design, they will tend to have a cooperative rather than a defensive attitude. Actually such involvement lessens fear and the necessity for defensiveness

that research plans may often engender. Also such participation can enrich the design by providing additional or improved material and by insuring an understanding participation during the actual progress of the program. This participation can and possibly should include both those in the hierarchy who are responsible for the over-all direction of the program as well as those who are going to be directly involved as trainees in the program.

2. *Sufficient time should be allowed to permit maximum involvement and adequate preparation.* There seems to be no substitute for an adequate period of preparation as well as sufficient time being allowed for the execution of the project and for the followup evaluation of the project. If a high-pressure, short-time, selling approach is adopted, the possibility of defensive reactions would appear to be greatly enhanced. With no pressure for immediate decision, people are more likely to be able to accept and understand the problem, and the design is more likely to be the product of considered thought. During the actual conduct of the training program itself, needless time pressures can result in actual impedance if not a total failure to achieve the learning goals that have been set forth.

An inadequate period of time allotted for followup evaluation can result in the trainees failing to gain the time perspective which is vital to the measurement of the results. In addition, the lack of adequate time can cripple the evaluation of the training by denying the use of those lengthy statistical techniques that are often vital to adequate measurement.

3. *Those involved both in the management and the trainee group should be continuously apprised of the results of the research.* If those concerned with the research are provided with no information until the final study is completed, they may be confronted with data that:

- (a) Is difficult to assimilate.
- (b) Is overwhelming in scope.
- (c) Is laden with surprises.
- (d) Presents a "take it or leave it" situation.

Since people find it difficult to change their thinking quickly, it would seem to be eminently desirable to keep them continu-

ously apprised of the results of the research so that the new knowledge and attitudes which the research may ask them to encompass can be gradually accepted.

4. *Top management support must be in evidence.* Any endeavor in an organization that lacks the understanding and active support of executive management faces severe obstacles. The attitudes of executive management are likely to be emulated throughout any organization. If these attitudes, in regard to the research project, are primarily indifference or even hostility, such attitudes are likely to prevail on the part of subordinate management. A research effort faced with a large majority of the people involved being actively hostile or indifferent is sure to fail.

On the other hand, the active interest and support of executive management is likely to be reflected in all echelons of the work force. Such an atmosphere permits enthusiastic participation and acceptance of the research plan and the data that it produces.

5. *The data resulting from a research project should be so presented as to motivate those responsible for programming to further action.* If data is presented that is obscure, unintelligible, or non-motivating in nature, it is very likely that there will be little or no positive action resulting from the findings. This, of course, means that the facts determined will be lost as far as subsequent application is concerned. This, in turn, means that the effort expended in the research will be largely wasted.

The foregoing is predicated upon the assumption that the results of the research will be either positive or negative. There is, of course, a possibility that the research will have neutral results, and that the maintenance of the status quo is indicated. In this case, the problem of motivation to further action is obviously not important. It might be emphasized that negative results can be and often are as important as positive results, that a theory disproved can be as meaningful as a theory proved. The mere determination of the negative results themselves should not be considered discouraging or grounds for the discontinuance of research, but rather as valid evidence that underlying assumptions can be inadequate or erroneous.

Guidelines on Specific Measures

Personnel training is primarily concerned with the interaction of people and the effects upon attitudes and behavior of various pedagogical methods. This broad base enables the researcher to use certain common tools with some degree of security. But these tools have their weaknesses. Let us look at some of the more common measuring devices and discuss them in terms of their strengths and failings:

1. *Validated Tests.* There are a large number of tests which measure assimilation of course content or potential ability to perform skilled tasks. These tests must be validated against successful performance on the job. Tests of this nature suffer from the major weakness of being able to predict only the "can" and not necessarily the "will." Unfortunately, even the most able and willing may be faced with a job environment that does not motivate toward, but actually militates against, performance.

The major concern of the researcher in this area must be the validity of the test in terms of its ability to predict the success of performance on the basis of the selected criteria.

2. *Interviews.* This relatively common approach to measurement suffers from the disadvantage of being both time consuming and unreliable. An interview involves a face to face relationship for a relatively long period of time between the researcher and each of the respondents. It further involves the use of judgement on the part of the researcher who must interpret, analyze, and classify the responses. Such interpretation, analysis, and classification is largely a product of the psychological world of the researcher and is subject to many variations.

Interviewing techniques are made more reliable by the introduction of interviewing guides or by the use of scales which are checked by the interviewer. Interviewing reliability is improved by the use of controllable interviews by different interviewers and the computation of correlations between interviewer's ratings on each subject. Necessarily these refinements call for skilled and experienced interviewers as well as for the construction of proper interviewing guides.

3. *Questionnaires.* One of the commonest

methods of measure has been the questionnaire. However, there are a number of difficulties encountered in its use. One of the principal such difficulties would appear to be the lack of agreement on the dimensions to be measured. Not only do dimensions differ from study to study, but it is extremely difficult to find agreement as to the definitions of dimensions used. In addition, there are several major *types* of questionnaires ranging from scales with Likert-type questions through Thurston-type scales to forced-choice tests.

One of the major problems inherent in using these questionnaires is the fact that respondents may reply in terms of what they *think* the question is attempting to elicit or in terms of their perception of the goals of the training program. These difficulties may be partially overcome by administering questionnaires not only to the trainees but to control groups and to others who have had an opportunity to observe their behavior (i.e., subordinates, peers, and superiors). This technique has been successfully used by the training staff of the Employee and Career Development Branch of the San Bernardino Air Materiel Area in recent measures of leadership and sensitivity training programs. The reliability of the results is determined by correlating the responses of the observers on areas of behavior which do or do not change.

4. *Managerial Ratings.* Many research programs have involved the construction of rating forms in which superiors are asked to rate the trainees either after the training experience or both prior to, and following, the training experience. The reliability of this measure can be calculated by comparing the rating of the same group of trainees by different raters. This type of rating can be affected by the nature of the relationship between the raters and the persons being rated. Another weakness of this rating method has been the development of a halo effect in which raters would tend consistently to rate people either high or low based on their reaction to some particular item or their general feelings about this person.

5. *Behavioral Observations.* In certain recent training programs, for example those conducted by Weschler and Reisel at the University of California at Los Angeles,¹²

and the Leadership Training Laboratories conducted by the San Bernardino Air Materiel Area, attempts have been made to determine the mean daily volume of trainee thought units and indices of emotionality and satisfaction by means of an analysis of diaries. These diaries are completed after each training session by the participants. While such studies have shown definite changes in all three factors, it has not, as yet, been possible to relate these changes to lasting behavioral changes on the job.

6. *Correlation Against Production Data.* Certain researchers have measured the relationship of supervisory behavior to productivity. These findings indicate that five dimensions of supervisory behavior are related to increased productivity.¹³ This opens up the possibility of seeking correlations between training results and shifts in production data. Inherent in this approach is the danger of the effect of uncontrollable factors such as workload increases, manpower reductions, reorganizations, etc., which can contaminate any research results. The use of a carefully chosen control group, selected to be as similar as possible and subject to all of the influences bearing upon the experimental group, would tend to minimize such extraneous effects.

Conclusion

In conclusion it might best be said that research in personnel training is in embryo. While a number of important results have been obtained, they are minute in comparison to the volume of activities that are conducted in this area by government, industry, and education. Daily, thousands of untested assumptions are the basis for the expenditure of millions of dollars. Almost unbelievably, some of these assumptions have actually been disproved and yet are still being used as a basis for training programs.

The executive, the manager, the personnel director, and the training specialist all must be concerned with this vital problem. It is their mutual responsibility to stimulate as much research as time and funds will support. Only then will they know that the time and effort expended in the training programs are producing the results that they so eagerly anticipate.

References

1. Stolz, Robert K. "Management Development: Where Does It Stand Today?", *The Management Review*, Volume XLVII, Number 10, October, 1958.
2. Ghiselli, E. E. and Brown, C. W. *Personnel and Industrial Psychology*. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1948. (Chapters 12 and 13).
3. Viteles, M. S. *Industrial Psychology*. New York: W. W. Norton & Co., Inc., 1932. (Chapters 19 and 20).
4. Keller, F. S. "Studies in International Morse Code I," A new method of teaching code reception, *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 1943, pp. 407-415.
5. Viteles, M. S. "Motivation and Morale in Industry," New York: W. W. Norton & Co., Inc., 1953, pp. 142-146.
6. Likert, R. and Hayes, S. P., Jr. *Some Applications of Behavioral Research*. UNESCO, 1957, Science and Society Series, Chapter III.
7. Buchanan, Paul. "Factors Making for Effective Supervisory Training," *Personnel*, March-April 1958, pp. 46-53.
8. Canter, R. R., Jr. "An Experimental Study of a Human Relations Training Program," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 1951, pp. 38-43.
9. Blansfield, M. G. "Building and Evaluating a University Executive Development Program," *Personnel Administration*, May-June 1958, pp. 35-40.
10. Argyle, Michael; Gardner, Godfrey; and Cioffi, Frank. "The Measurement of Supervisory Methods," *Human Relations*, Volume X, No. 4, pp. 295-314, and "Supervisory Methods Related to Productivity, Absenteeism, and Labour Turnover," *Human Relations*, Volume XI, No. 1, pp. 23-40.
11. Taylor, Donald W.; Berry, Paul C.; and Block, Clifford H. "Does Group Participation When Using Brainstorming Facilitate or Inhibit Creative Thinking?" *Admin. Science Quarterly*, June, 1958, pp. 23-47.
12. Weschler, I. R. and Reisel, Jerome. "Inside a Sensitivity Training Group." Human Relations Research Group, Institute of Industrial Relations and Graduate School of Business Administration, University of California, Los Angeles, 1958. (Unpublished manuscript).
13. Comrey, A. L.; Pfiffner, J. M.; and High, W. S. "Factors Influencing Organizational Effectiveness: A Final Report," ONR Contract N6-ONR-23815, University of Southern California, 1954.

PPA Tests Pay Their Way!

IT PAYS to use a PPA Ready-to-Use Test to assist you in selecting any of the following employees:

- Policemen
- Office Workers
- Truck Drivers
- Firefighters
- Engineering Aides

PPA also publishes a Classification Test for use in selecting employees for other public service jobs where ability to learn to do the job is required.

Write NOW to the Public Personnel Association for a descriptive folder on any or all of these tests that will save you TIME and MONEY!

PUBLIC PERSONNEL ASSOCIATION
1313 East 60th Street Chicago 37, Illinois



around the personnel world

● INDIA

More Saris in City Hall.

The governor, Mr. Sri Prakasa, summing up a debate on "Municipal Administration Should Be Handed Over To Women," organized by the State Women's Council in Bombay . . . said that, though he did not agree with the claim that women should be given exclusive control of municipal affairs, he very much supported the idea that men and women should have a fifty-fifty share in managing public affairs.

Quoting a Sanskrit couplet, he said women were intelligent by nature and could act by insight whereas men sought guidance for their actions from books. He also quoted some instances of tribes whose women folk go to work while their men relax at home. Enumerating the qualities of men, he said they were more practical and had a better awareness of the problems and difficulties of life than men.

No, No, A Thousand Times, No

Opposing the motion, Dr. R. N. Kulkarni said that women ordinarily liked to have authority without responsibility and as such they were not competent to manage municipal affairs all by themselves. Even otherwise, there were enough troubles for the Municipal Corporation, but if women were to be given charge of the administration, he shuddered at the consequences.

Mr. S. G. Barve, who supported the motion, said that he did not think that women were good enough only for the "trivialities" of the municipality and pleaded for their participation in all other public affairs.

A lively rejoinder to this came from Miss Amy B. H. J. Rustomjee, who opposed the motion vehemently by exposing the weaknesses of her own sex. She said that she could not even conceive of women managing municipal administration. But if men in their chivalrous mood were to concede the demand only God could save it from ruin. (From *Civic Affairs*, July, 1958.)

● ISRAEL

Pension Based on "Determining Salary."

Upon separation from service, the employee is entitled to a sum, the size of which depends on his length of service and on the "determining salary." The rate of compensation is 2% of the determining salary for each year of service up to a maximum of 70% of that salary. The next of kin are also entitled to a pension if the civil servant dies subsequent to retirement.

In the former case, the pension payable to the survivors is based on a percentage of the employee's determining salary; while in the latter case, it represents a percentage of the last annual pension payable to the deceased.

Purchasing Power Safeguarded

It is interesting to note that by employing the term "determining salary" the law safeguards the pensions of Israeli civil servants against a possible drop in purchasing power. The determining salary is not a fixed amount as paid to the employee at the time of separation. It is the salary payable—at the time of each pension payment—to civil servants in the same salary grade as that which the pensioned employee had reached prior to retirement.

This method creates so-called flexible or "dynamic" pension scales and a retirement system designed to maintain the purchasing power and prevent the erosion of the real value of pensions. This is accomplished ingeniously by tying pension scales to an index which reflects and includes the cost-of-living allowance, as well as any other changes in salary levels which may occur, insofar as they are translated into changes in salary grades (by way of explanation, it should be noted that the cost-of-living allowance, which is granted in addition to basic Israeli civil service salaries to compensate for increases in living costs, is in itself tied to the official cost-of-living index). (Excerpt from *Public Personnel Administration in Israel*, July, 1958.)

● PANAMA

Seminar in Public Administration.

Early in 1958, the government of Panama inaugurated a program of training for a period of a year for senior officials of the government. A seminar on public administration with the general title, "Problems, Techniques, and Development of Public Administration," was arranged at the University of Panama under the auspices of the School of Public Administration and Commerce and the Carrera Administrativa, the central personnel agency.

The participants are limited to 24, representing each of the ministries and autonomous agencies of the government. The twice-weekly, 2-hour sessions are designed:

1. To familiarize the officials with some of the basic principles of the public policy and modern techniques of administration;
2. To study some of the basic problems of administration that are common to most public agencies; and
3. To review the more urgent typical problems in the several functional fields of government (i.e., health education, traffic control, etc.).

Over a period of a year, approximately 200 hours of study and discussion have been scheduled. In the first 100 hours, attention is being focused on principles and practical theory, and their application to current problems of public administration in the Republic. The second 100 hours will be focused on descriptions and analysis of current problems involving suggested application of the knowledge revealed in the first 100 hours of discussion.

The participants rotate as chairmen of the discussion sessions. Discussion leaders are limited to 40-minute presentations of subject matter. The leaders are selected from among officials, educators, and technical assistance experts of the United Nations and Point 4 technical missions.

Taped Discussions Are Published

The materials presented at the seminar and edited transcriptions of tape recordings of the discussions are being organized into a series of publications by the University's School of Public Administration. These publications, it is generally believed, will be of

greater usefulness than the translations from other languages currently in use in the School.

Thus the University has initiated a systematic approach to the compilation of indigenous materials, case studies, and descriptions of current practice that will ultimately enrich the literature on the subject of public administration in Panama. These materials will also be available later for use in agency and ministry in-service training programs.

The original plans for the seminar were developed by the United Nation's Technical Assistance Administration Advisor on Public Administration who has served in Panama for 2 years. The Director of the Carrera Administrativa, who also teaches at the University, serves as coordinator of the seminar to implement proper scheduling of subject matter, to avoid duplication in the presentations, and to acquaint future discussion leaders with past discussions.

Summaries of each session are mimeographed and distributed to participants, facilitating coordination and the development of the seminar. (Information supplied by Louis E. Hosch, Consultant on Administration, United Nations, Panama City, Republic of Panama.)

● JAPAN

Present Pay Plan.

Experience revealed a number of inequities in the former pay system for employees in the Regular Service (comparable to the "classified service" in U. S. jurisdictions). This system consisted of 4 special schedules for tax collectors, police and related security occupations, seamen, and educational personnel, plus a general schedule covering all other employees. Some of the difficulties encountered with this system were:

1. The heterogeneity of occupations assigned to the general schedule made promotions and step increases difficult to administer so as to meet the actual needs of the occupations involved.
2. The narrowness of the previous salary ranges resulted in too many employees being at the top of their ranges, or over the top.

A new system, approved by the Japanese Diet and now in effect, breaks the old general salary schedule up into 6 new salary schedules, 2 for the Administrative Service, 1 for the Research Service, and 3 for the Medical Service.

Three of the 4 special schedules were also divided into 2 or more schedules each so that there is now a total of 14 schedules with a total of 74 different salary grades, as opposed to the former system which had 4 schedules with a total of 77 grades.

Salary Increase, Allowance Decrease

Other features of the new pay system are as follows:

1. Upon installation, employees received increases averaging 6.2%.
2. Area allowances, to compensate for differences in living costs in certain areas, have been abolished, although they will be temporarily retained for a time to avoid undue hardship.
3. Most pay increases will now be given at 12-month intervals. Under the old system the frequency of increases depended upon the monetary differences between the steps involved.
4. Employees will receive increases if their service has been satisfactory for the specified period.

5. More than one step increase may be given at a time, or the waiting period may be shortened if the employee has rendered exceptional service.

Here is a skeleton outline of the present plan:

| <i>Schedule</i> | <i>Covers</i> | <i>No. of Pay Grades in Schedule</i> |
|----------------------------|--|--|
| Administrative Service I | Roughly equivalent to clerical, administrative, and fiscal | 8 |
| Administrative Service II | Machine operators, custodians, etc. | 5 |
| Taxation Service | Employees engaged in assessing and collecting taxes | 7 |
| Public Security Service I | Policemen, imperial guards, prison guards, and related occupations | 7 |
| Public Security Service II | Employees of public procurators' offices, of the public security investigation agency, of homes for delinquents, and of the maritime safety agency | 8 |
| Marine Service I | Maritime officers | 5 |
| Marine Service II | Other ship personnel | 4 |
| Educational Service I | University teaching personnel | 6 |
| Educational Service II | High school teachers | 3 |
| Educational Service III | Grade and junior high school teachers | 3 |
| Research Service | Laboratory research workers | 7 |
| Medical Service I | Physicians and dentists | 5 |
| Medical Service II | Pharmacists, dietitians, etc. | 6 |
| Medical Service III | Nurses, public health nurses, midwives, etc. | 4 |

(Information supplied by Tomoo Sato, Director-General of the National Personnel Authority.)

The Indirect Sell . . .

Public and parochial high school students are offered an opportunity to win \$2,500 in prizes by City Personnel Director Joseph Schechter. This is part of the city's program in celebrating the Diamond Jubilee of Civil Service.

All that students are required to do is to write an essay in school in the presence of a teacher without notes or other reference material on the topic "75 Years of Civil Service in New York City." One hour will be allowed.

As October 21 is the deadline, parents and teachers should encourage students to write the essay. It is an excellent way to celebrate this anniversary and at the same time receive bonds for \$200, \$150, \$100 or \$50 for the essays selected by the judges.—From *The Chief*, October 17, 1958.

IMPORTANT QUESTIONS of personnel policy and practice seldom yield "cut-and-dried" answers. The editors have posed the question below to several persons representing different points of view to give readers guidelines in formulating their own policies.

THE QUESTION

"Under what conditions, if any, should a public employee be disqualified for a pension because of misconduct?"

Says H. ELIOT KAPLAN . . .

*President,
Management Services Associates, Inc.*

Whether a public employee found guilty of misconduct in office should be deprived of his pension benefit has long been a moot issue. The notion that an employee disloyal to his employer should be "rewarded" with a pension benefit invariably offends public sensitiveness. Many private pension plans expressly provide that an employee discharged for a deliberate offense against the company's interests, such as furnishing harmful confidential information to a competitor, embezzlement, or willful destruction of the employer's property, shall forfeit his pension benefits. Express provisions of similar purport are included in some public pension plans.

Generally speaking, forfeiture of pension benefits, except under most extraordinary circumstances, should not be encouraged. If pensions are to be viewed as deferred payment of part of the salary to an employee, withheld during his period of employment and payment deferred until he is eligible for retirement benefits,¹ it would appear that the employee under no circumstances should be deprived of the benefit which has accrued to him.² Where he has contributed out of his own funds toward the payment

of the pension benefit one must agree that he at least is entitled to the return of his own contributions, no matter what the circumstances. In any event, only in the case of an employee guilty of a heinous offense against the employer's interest would there be any justification for withholding the pension benefit even where such pension benefit is provided exclusively at the expense of the employer.

As related to the public service the problem is neither new nor novel. Ever so often the issue pops up in discussions among civic leaders and in the legislatures, particularly after revelations of stealth of public funds or startling disclosure of breach of trust on the part of a public official or employee. This is accentuated when such an unusual event is magnified as a public scandal.

That an employee might be punishable for committing a misdemeanor or a crime and, therefore, he should not be subjected to "double jeopardy" is hardly a sound reason, some contend, for compulsory granting of the employee pension benefit. Basically, a pension benefit is provided primarily, if not exclusively, for the employee. In many cases, however, such pension benefits are contemplated not alone for the employee, but also for his dependent survivors. This is particularly true where there is a survivorship benefit, or where the retiree is given the privilege of selecting an optional form of payment wherein a survivor beneficiary could participate in the

¹ See *Gordon v. Monaghan*, 309 N.E. 336, 342; 130 N.E. (2d) 882.

² See *Keegan v. Board of Trustees*, 412 Ill. 430; 107 N.E. (2d) 702.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

remainder benefit to which she might be entitled.

Criticism of forfeiture of pensions as a public policy emanates from two theses. It is claimed that a pension benefit is a property right to which the employee is inviolably entitled. Forfeiture of the pension benefit would be tantamount to depriving the employee of a "property right" which the employee has more or less been guaranteed by the employer. The employee has presumably patterned or geared his economic future planning on such assurance. It is urged by others, however, that, aside from "double punishment" which forfeiture of pension benefits inherently involves, a forfeiture penalizes not alone the retiree but also the innocent family dependent survivors as well. This, they maintain, is a grave injustice to the latter. Though they concede such is generally the result when a breadwinner is convicted of a crime and punished for it, and the family dependents must suffer along with him because of his derelictions, they maintain that the situations are not analogous. They contend that to deprive family dependent survivors of the pension benefit is tantamount to depriving them of part of his property.

Those opposed to forfeiture of pension benefits also point to the "contractual relationship" which the pension benefit contemplates, and which in many jurisdictions is so recognized by judicial interpretation, if not by express statutory provision. Once the employee has fulfilled the conditions for eligibility for a pension benefit it is maintained that he should not be deprived of such benefit. Any misconduct on the part of the employee should not be reflected in impairment of his pension, but should be punishable solely by disciplinary action of administrative agencies, or, if involving a crime, through judicial process.

The subject has been before the New York state legislature in recent years through a proposal sponsored by a prominent citizens' organization which advocates forfeiture of the pension benefit provided by the employer where an employee has been convicted of a crime involving his official duties. The proposal contemplates forfeiture of the pension benefit only for extreme misconduct involving moral turpitude, such as

embezzlement of public funds or falsification or willful destruction of public records. It would apply to any such wrongful act before retirement is effected as well as to discovery of wrongdoing within one year after retirement. In support of the latter phase of the proposal it is contended that occasionally an employee guilty of a serious offense might take advantage of his right to retire with a pension before his misconduct may become known, and that the employee should not be permitted to receive a benefit at the cost of his employer in such case.

More and more is the view accepted that pension benefits are not "rewards" for service, but only salary withheld by the employer to provide the pension benefit. With this the prevalent view of the pension relationship, the likelihood is that the legislatures will not be encouraged to support a policy of forfeiture of pensions of public employees, preferring to deal with the subject through punishment of offenders through administrative and judicial channels. Realizing this, the public will insist on higher standards of professional conduct in the public service and hold administrative supervisors to stricter account in enforcing a more rigid code of ethics.

Says B. H. PETERSON . . .

Personnel Director, City of Vancouver.

This question has many interpretations. Since most public service pension plans are contributory, let's deal with the question within the scope of a joint plan.

Under such a plan there is normally a vesting schedule whereby, if the employee leaves after a certain number of years of service and does not withdraw his own contributions, he receives, when he subsequently reaches normal retirement date, the pension he had accumulated for service up to the date of retirement.

According to consulting actuaries it would be difficult to have such vesting granted or withdrawn on the basis of the employee's misconduct. Misconduct is a very broad term; it may mean anything from moderate loafing on the job to stealing public funds. However, if the employee is guilty of theft, the employer should have a

right to the employee's contributions to the extent of the felony.

The Canadian Government Public Service Superannuation Regulations make the following provisions for a contributor convicted of an indictable offence:

"Where a contributor is convicted of an indictable offence committed by him while employed in the Public Service, if the Treasury Board is of the opinion that the commission of the offence by the contributor constituted misconduct in office, any annuity or annual allowance payable under the act to or in respect of the contributor shall be reduced by such amount as the Treasury Board in its discretion considers appropriate."

According to an official who is responsible for the administration of a superannuation plan, the only type of misconduct which should be taken into account in the plan is one where the employee betrays a trust to the extent of involving the employer in financial loss. This heading would include theft, misappropriation of funds, and improper accounting methods used to hide misuse of funds.

The Municipal Superannuation Act for the Province of British Columbia protects the employer with some means of recovering, in part at least, the loss suffered as a result of the misconduct of the employee. The repayment is accomplished by suspending the employer portion of the allowance only. The employee portion continues to be payable even while he is in prison.

I would say that the portion of the pension which accrues from the employee's contributions is considered a deferred wage whereas that accruing from the employer's contributions could be considered a reward for service. I do not agree with the B. C. Municipal Superannuation Act of only suspending the employer portion of the pension. If the employee is found guilty of a theft from his employer, the amount involved should be recovered from the employee's contributions.

Says O. W. WILSON . . .

*Dean, School of Criminology,
University of California.*

The question of disqualifying a public employee for a pension because of miscon-

duct requires consideration of whether the misconduct occurred before or after the employee was pensioned or became eligible for a pension, the seriousness of the misconduct, and the provisions of the pension system.

Consideration will first be given to misconduct after the employee has been pensioned or has become eligible for a pension. Here the answer seems clear on both legal and moral grounds—the pension is a property right which the pensioner has earned, and he should not be deprived of this right because of misconduct. While this right could be legally abrogated by a provision in the pension plan that would terminate a pension following conviction for specified offenses, such a practice seems as undesirable as the medieval practice of forfeiture to the crown of the estate of a convicted felon. Not only would the pensioner suffer, but his innocent dependents also.

Whether misconduct by an employee before he has become eligible for a pension should disqualify him for a pension is dependent in the first place on the seriousness of the misconduct. Misconduct that does not result in separation from service should under no circumstances disqualify an employee for a pension. To withdraw, in part or in whole, the benefits of a pension as a disciplinary measure would present opportunities for abuse of the legal rights of the employee that clearly justify rejection of such a proposal.

Whether misconduct that leads to dismissal should disqualify the employee for a pension is dependent on the provisions of the system. Pension plans that contain no such disqualification provisions vest in the employee a property right which must be respected on both legal and moral grounds. Since pension plans usually provide that, on voluntary resignation before the employee is eligible for a pension, he will forfeit his pension rights and receive his own contributions with interest, similar provision should be made for employees who are dismissed for misconduct. The employee who is dismissed for misconduct should not enjoy a pension status that is more advantageous than that of the well-behaved employee who resigns voluntarily.

In brief, misconduct should not disqualify

a public employee for a pension provided that, when he is dismissed for misconduct before becoming eligible for a pension, his rights should be the same and not better than those of a well-behaved employee who voluntarily resigns.

This opinion is based on the convictions that (1) contributions made by the employee are a part of his estate held in trust pending their application, with contributions by the employing agency, to provide a pension, (2) when eligibility-for-pension conditions are met, whether accepted immediately or temporarily postponed, the employee has then earned the employer's contributions which are then as much a part of his estate as are his own contributions, and (3) the estate of an employee should be immune from confiscation as a disciplinary or penal measure.

Says A. A. WEINBERG . . .

Consulting Actuary, Chicago.

In connection with this question we shall assume that misconduct has been established conclusively, and that disciplinary action has been found warranted. Misconduct may have been due to an act of commission, or caused by an act of omission. There may have been a deliberate performance of a wrongful act to the detriment, loss, or injury of the governmental employer, or misconduct may have occurred as the result of dereliction or shortcomings on the part of the employee in the discharge of the duties of his position causing some loss or damage to the employer. The discharge or removal of the employee from his position, therefore, may be assumed to have occurred for good cause.

To give rise to a disqualification for the receipt of a pension, the cause or action must have been one of serious consequences, such as the commission of a felony as distinguished from a misdemeanor. In the former type of action, the offense must be of some enormity showing a criminal purpose, malicious or villainous, which is usually punishable by death or incarceration in a state prison. In the latter case, an offense of a minor degree is assumed for which punishment generally consists of a fine or imprisonment in a county jail.

Obviously, a misdemeanor could not rea-

sonably be considered as a justifiable cause for an action to deprive the employee of his pension, because this type of offense encompasses a broad area of many minor forms of misconduct. Although we could reasonably dismiss this type of offense from consideration under this question, we shall assume that the question presented is intended to deal with every form of misconduct or offense resulting in the discharge or removal of an employee from his job.

Under such circumstances, should the earned or accrued pension credits for the employee or his beneficiaries be curtailed, reduced, or completely cancelled?

This question, in my opinion, is inextricably bound up with the issue of vested or contractual rights. It has long been firmly established that employees acquire no vested rights in any public office or employment. Apart from such rights of tenure as may be afforded by civil service or other tenure laws, there exists no right of property in public employment. Even civil service laws may be repealed or jobs abolished for legitimate reasons of economy or governmental policy. But we find an anomalous principle that has developed during recent years that a public employee has no vested right in his employment, but he does have a measure of vesting in his pension plan for himself and his beneficiaries.

The early traditional concept of a public pension was that the pension did not create a vested or contractual right in the employee. This still remains as the prevailing judicial view in a majority of our states. However, the impact of a developing social consciousness concerning the need and importance of pensions and their acceptance as an integral part of our economic and social structure has resulted in a number of courts adopting the view that such pensions possess contractual or vested rights. The scope and extent of these concepts remain somewhat obscured in some jurisdictions by reason of judicial reluctance to impose a total restraint upon the legislature in respect to limitations or modifications of rights under pension laws.

In a clash between legislative policy relative to amendments to pension laws impairing or affecting pension expectancies, or otherwise imposing limitations or restric-

tions, and the employee expectancy of promised benefits to be unequivocally available upon fulfillment of conditions stipulated in these laws in terms of a vested right in accrued benefits, the courts have been called upon to define the basic character of a public employee pension. In this area of judicial determination, it has been held that a pension is pay withheld to induce long, continued, and faithful service, and that pensions were not extra compensation, donations, or gratuities, but deferred compensation for services rendered which could validly be offered as an inducement to continued service.

It has also been held that public pensions constitute deferred compensation for services previously rendered for which adequate compensation was not paid at the time of rendition of the services.

Certainly the accruing cost of a pension is properly a part of the employee's compensation for services rendered. This cost is actually an integral part of the employer's payroll. It is incurred only by the rendition of service and becomes an increased salary expense to the employer. It is accumulated during the time the employee is in performance of active duty, but its disbursement is deferred until he retires. Thus the contributions made by the employer represent deferred salary, the payment of which is con-

ditioned upon the employee continuing in service until he fulfills the prescribed minimum age and service qualifications for retirement.

It would appear, therefore, that the basic character of public employee pensions has a definitive classification approaching a contractual or vested status. The unequivocal expressions to the effect that pensions are not bounties, gratuities, or contingent expectancies but are instead deferred compensation for services rendered would indicate that the legislative interference in future years with employee's rights under such laws for misconduct of any form may receive little or no judicial sanction.

In the light of these considerations, an employee and his eligible beneficiaries may not be deprived of pension rights earned and accrued for services previously rendered regardless of the character of the misconduct for which an employee may have been removed from his position in the service. It is assumed that the employee has qualified for a pension by fulfilling the requirements as to age or service, or both, as prescribed by the pension law. If he did not, he should be entitled to a refund of his own contributions to the pension fund on the same basis as any other participant terminating his service without having qualified for a pension benefit.

the

bookshelf

The Essence of Management. By Mary Cushing Niles. Harper & Brothers Publishers, New York, 1958. 398 pp. \$6.00.

Reviewed by

FERREL HEADY

Associate Director,

*Institute of Public Administration,
University of Michigan*

This book is a welcome contribution to management literature by an author well prepared for her assignment. Mrs. Niles is best known in public personnel circles for her work in Washington on the staff of the Federal Personnel Council and as author of *Middle Management* and *The Office Supervisor* (with her husband, Henry E. Niles). In this new book she has undertaken what is essentially an effort at summarization and interpretation. The result will prove useful for several purposes.

The author describes her objective as an "attempt to synthesize the newer findings of the social sciences with the organization theory of scientific management." Her sense of identification with the traditional scientific management movement is strong, but she is anxious to show how management theories have been drastically affected by the findings of "human relations" research. Like Lillian M. Gilbreth, to whom the book is dedicated, she stresses "the importance of the human element in management" as well as "the need for managerial competence." She has succeeded notably in achieving this combination of the old and the new in management thought.

In organizing the material, she has followed a somewhat unusual sequence of treatment. The 31 chapters are arranged in what she calls "a spiral by which the reader may see certain subjects from different angles of view." In general, this method of presentation is well adapted to her purposes.

She begins with short summaries of the genesis of the management movement, its

development, and its central concepts. She then deals with factors affecting behavior in organizations, placing special emphasis on small work groups and the function of supervision. Subsequent chapters explore a wide range of topics, including organization structure, morale, work improvement, planning, change and resistance to change, automation and its implications, and problems of executive direction and decision-making.

In developing these themes, Mrs. Niles has drawn upon an extensive and varied range of source materials. "Management" literature has been supplemented by writings, from foreign as well as American authors, in psychology and social psychology, economics, political science and public administration, anthropology and other fields. The book is replete with quotations or adaptations, some of them lengthy, from these sources. A valuable annotated bibliography appears at the end. These features, combined with a helpful index, make the volume a handy compendium and reference book for this scattered and disparate literature. There are no more than the usual number of lapses in documentation, such as the mistake in title for *The Human Group*, by George C. Homans, which is listed (on p. 376) as *The Family Group*. Several useful figures and tables are provided to supplement the text.

The Essence of Management was originally written and published for use abroad to meet a need detected by Mrs. Niles and Mrs. Gilbreth when they were engaged in management consultant work in India, Japan, the Philippines, and other countries in 1953 and 1954. Earlier editions have been issued in India and Japan prior to revision and publication in the United States. The version under review shows evidences of this origin. The inclusion of numerous quotations is partly in recognition of the unavailability abroad of many of the books and periodicals cited. Frequently a problem under consideration is discussed with spe-

cial reference to conditions of economic underdevelopment.

She stresses that management thought and practice in the United States "is not canned food, merely to be warmed and served. It must be critically evaluated by nationals of other countries. What is useful, within a particular cultural situation, must be adapted to the systems of belief and social organization there existing and emerging." The concluding chapter is on "Application of Management in Other Countries."

Thus the book serves the dual function of informing people abroad of the development of management concepts in the United States and of giving Americans some insight into the difficulties of applying similar concepts abroad.

Business enterprise is the type of organization which has received most attention from scientific management people, and this book reflects such an emphasis. What relevance, then, does *The Essence of Management* have for administrators engaged in the operation of governmental enterprises? Mrs. Niles makes her own response to this question on page 360.

"My own experience in the United States indicates that there is no essential difference between management in the public and private sectors except that the first is somewhat more difficult. Public accountability requires a more meticulous accounting and adherence to formal policy than is necessary under private enterprise. . . . Managerial problems are no less difficult in government than in the private sector and in many cases are much more so. . . . I have a strong opinion that the likenesses between government and private management far exceed their differences and that each can learn from and cooperate with the other."

In this broad area of comparability, her study will be equally relevant for the conduct of both public and private management.

For the reasons mentioned, *The Essence of Management* will be widely appreciated. The author has succeeded in her main aim of synthesizing current management concepts as they have been modified by research findings in the social sciences. In doing this, she has demonstrated a thorough mastery of the pertinent literature and a talent for selection of facts and ideas to include. She has drawn often upon her own experience as a management consultant for effective illustration of issues discussed. Permeating the book is abundant evidence of the earnest-

ness of her conviction that "management development is a key social responsibility and a prime necessity for fulfilling personal, organizational, national, and international goals."

Public Administration. By Marshall Edward Dimock, Gladys Ogden Dimock, and Louis W. Koenig. Revised Edition. Rinehart and Company, New York, 1958. 573 pp. \$7.00.

Reviewed by

LEE S. GREENE

Head, Department of Political Science,
The University of Tennessee

The teaching field of public administration today bristles with controversy, for it shares heavily in the strife which characterizes political science generally. Dissatisfied with traditional ideas, hordes of critics have descended on the old *corpus administrationis* like a swarm of embittered mosquitoes. This book attempts to benefit from the criticism with results that are not always completely satisfactory to the reviewer and with results, too, which may be confusing to the student.

The book is best considered as an introduction to the field, its subject matter, its technique, its problems, and its controversies. Regarded in this light, it is a very useful volume, for it is well-written (not surprisingly, in view of its authorship), informative, fair. Because of the sweep of its coverage, it presents too many problems and too few conclusions (even admitting that there are more of one than the other).

And I do not feel that the authors have been able to reconcile the old and the new too effectively, so that the student is often faced with contradictory points of view. Thus the authors quote frequently from Mary Follett's criticisms of the authoritarian executive and the authoritarian structure, only to say at one point that the success of management depends on several basic factors, number one of which is listed as the integration of a program under the executive direction of a single person. The contradiction is, of course, not complete, and could be made to disappear, possibly, in a mist of human relations words, but I think there is some contradiction left nevertheless. On the whole, the book accepts the human relations approach too uncritically.

At another point, "manualitis" is noted as a pathological manifestation, but at another the manual is approved as an indis-

management, responsibility, personal, national, sensible guide. Won't the student be puzzled? I presume the authors mean to say that the manual is necessary but can be over-used, but, of course, this can be said very briefly unless we can say, in a text, when it is over-used.

Edward A. human relations approach, suggest the authors, is to be combined with the most reliable tools for measuring performance that can be devised. But, actually, this is not much more useful than saying that the operator of the guillotine should separate his clients' heads from their trunks in as charitable a spirit as possible.

Organization must necessarily mean some subordination of the individual and this fact needs some re-emphasis for the sake of balance. When the top minister and his ministry come into conflict, I can't believe that the conclusion is certain.

I thought the chapter on Cooperation and Conflict was especially good in its analysis of bureaucratic behavior. All the same, to say that Miss Follett has explained how conflict can be put to work by breaking down contentions into components and then reintegrating them arouses all my impatient scepticism. I have known a lot of so's-and-so's whose contentions wouldn't dove-tail with mine by any amount of subatomic reintegrations. I think the world is full of bitter-tenders and I don't believe the student is helped by being told that he won't meet up with this. I wouldn't want to throw hope overboard, but neither would I give it complete command of the ship.

Part VI on Operational Administration gets down to some very practical problems of technique and method. I liked this portion of the book very much and I believe it contains the kind of thing which could be profitably expanded for the student. If the student cannot be taught to be a successful administrator, at least he can be prepared with some techniques. This section of the book, I believe, comes closest to what the public administration course should be.

The Evaluation Interview. By Richard A. Fear. McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., New York, 1958. 288 pp. \$6.00.

Reviewed by

CHARLES H. BENTLEY

Director of Personnel,

American National Bank & Trust Company

Predicting job performance in business and industry is the sub-title of this book,

and the author makes a direct attack upon his subject. Other authors have written on the techniques of interviewing and of all the psychological devices that may be used in different kinds of interviews, but few authors have come to grips with the practical aspects of interviewing applicants for higher level jobs.

It is safe to say that this book should be in the library of every civil service commission that has a permanent staff and should also be in the library of departmental people who interview as an employee selection device. The book provides suggestions for handling the applicant from the time he walks in the door until the interview is eventually terminated. The author uses frequent illustrations of the specific kinds of questions that can be used and, equally important, how responses to these questions can be interpreted. An interview guide is also provided—a 2-page checklist of points that should be covered and thoroughly explored by the interviewer, including the applicant's work history, education, early home background, certain social adjustments, and self-evaluation. Illustrative case histories provide the reader with an understanding of how the pieces of the puzzle fit together—how interview findings may be interpreted and integrated in such a way that a clear picture of the candidate emerges.

Mr. Fear bases his method on the assumption that the best indication of what an individual will do in the future stems from what he has done in the past. Past performance is not to be considered in terms of a single factor, such as work experience, but rather from the standpoint of the person as a whole. Thus the interviewer is called upon to explore all important areas of the individual's background.

This assumption is nothing more than an extension of the basic principle that the more relevant information one can obtain about the applicant, the better the basis for an intelligent employment decision. The interview is a patterned interview based on the interview guide, but is not mechanical. The author shows how the candidate is encouraged to tell his own story, the interviewer interrupting only to obtain more specific information or to direct the discourse to channels that lend sequence to the talk in accordance with the general plan of the interview.

Fear maintains that when thoroughly trained in these methods, the interviewer does only 10 to 15 per cent of the talking,

for the most part permitting the candidate to take the center of the stage. This is the basic plan of Richard Fear's book which he presents in a readable style that makes sense.

Some years ago the use of interviews for selection purposes fell into some disrepute. We were given to understand that paper and pencil tests could tell us everything there is to know about an applicant, and that the interview was a highly unreliable and unscientific device that was used only by those who did not know any better. In spite of all these warnings, however, most employers would consider it inconceivable to hire a person for a high level position without a complete interview. Undoubtedly, the employment interview will continue to be with us for many years to come. The question is, not whether we are to interview at all, but whether we are to interview well. Richard Fear's book does a great deal to place the interview in its proper setting as a part of the total selection process, and to establish a logical, reliable method for evaluating a person through the interview process.

The Theory of Wage Determination. Edited by John T. Dunlop. St. Martin's Press Incorporated, New York, New York, 1957. 437 pp. \$7.50.

Reviewed by

E. A. SHELLEY

*Director of Personnel
Tennessee Valley Authority*

What determines the general level of wages? What determines the differentials that make up wage structure? What relationships exist between wage level and wage structure? Between wage policy and employment level? Between wages and inflation? What effect do unions have on wages? How can wage theory be integrated into a general theory of national income distribution?

These and other questions related to wage theory were discussed by leading economists in a conference of the International Economic Association at Seelisberg, Switzerland, September 4-13, 1954. The papers and a summary of the discussion have been published in a volume edited by Professor John T. Dunlop, of Harvard University, Chairman of the Programme Committee.

The International Economic Association was founded in 1950 under auspices of Unesco. Each year it holds a roundtable

conference centered on a single major economic topic. The 1954 conference, focused on wage theory, drew 35 participants from 13 countries. They included general theorists and specialists in labor economics; academicians and men experienced in various fields of labor and government; experts from countries with diverse economies, wage practices, and labor market institutions.

American participants besides Professor Dunlop were Professor F. H. Harbison of Chicago, Professor Clark Kerr of California, Professor Charles A. Myers of Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Professor Lloyd G. Reynolds of Yale, and Dr. Melvin Rothbaum of Harvard. Messrs. Dunlop, Kerr, Myers, and Reynolds presented papers.

The book groups the 22 papers presented at the conference into seven sections.

1. The introduction examines the task of contemporary wage theory. It must explain the structure of wages, the whole complex of differentials; the interrelation of the general wage level and the wage structure; the wage structure as a reflex of the pattern and speed of industrialization.

2. Six papers consider the general level of wages—determination of the level, its relation to the level of employment, the movement of real wages, the relation of wages to the total economy. One paper in this group, on "Wage Policy and Full Employment," raises the fundamental problem of whether inflation is inevitable under full employment and the related problems of price and wage controls. The danger of inflation varies with different methods by which full employment is reached.

3. The next four papers explore the impact of the labor union and other institutions on wage determination. The last of the four, "Wage Theory and Social Groups," concludes that the theory of wages must be merged into a general theory of national income distribution. The parties to be considered are no longer the traditional groups of those who supply labor, those who supply capital, those who supply raw material, and entrepreneurs. Rather, there are two groups: those who have activity incomes—workers, entrepreneurs, farmers—and those who have property incomes, interest from capital, or rent from real estate.

4. An important section deals with wage structure, wage differentials, and the effect of collective bargaining and inflation on wage structure. The first paper, "Wage Relationships—the Comparative Impact of

Market and Power Forces," is a general treatment of wage differentials—between persons, firms, occupations, industries, and regions—and union influence on these differentials. Unions have had major effect on interpersonal and interfirm differentials, somewhat less effect on interregional differentials, and little effect on interoccupational and interindustry differentials. Union motivation is clear and strong in the first three areas, where equal work can be seen; it fades in the last two, where work is unequal. The narrowing of differentials between occupations and industries is a wider social process. The other papers in this group draw evidence from particular countries—United States, Sweden, Britain, France.

5. Two papers attempt to establish a theory of bargaining, which must have a bearing on any theory of wages.

6. Two papers deal with labor market and labor supply.

7. A final section records the discussion of the papers. In 16 half-day sessions the economists take each other apart and try to put the pieces together. Chairman Dunlop

is quoted as ending the conference on this note: The discussion had been valuable if it had left everyone with a feeling that we did not yet know all the answers.

This is not a book the layman can skim lightly. The papers were written by economists for economists. The content ranges from highly abstruse arguments and mathematical presentations to quite readable statements. But for the reader who knows his way around in economic terminology and for the less sophisticated reader who is willing to dig a little, here is a valuable spread of the recent thinking of leading American and European experts on an important branch of economic theory.

Particularly, the book is an antidote for economic provincialism. As Professor Dunlop points out, even the experts have a tendency to generalize from the experience of their own countries. As they—or we—examine the diversity from country to country and writer to writer, they—and we—more quickly reach questions of basic theory and a framework of general analysis.

Useful PPA Publications

—to add to your personal personnel library

Manpower for Government—A Decade's Forecast. Eli Ginzberg and James K. Anderson. How government agencies can more effectively develop and use the nation's manpower resources.

List price, \$2.00—PPA members, \$1.50

Public Personnel Councils. Theodore H. Lang. Procedures involved in setting up a personnel council, its composition, functions and purposes, and its operation.

List price, \$2.00—PPA members, \$1.50

Personnel Research Frontiers. Cecil E. Goode. Why are governmental personnel research needs lagging? The answers, given here, are of vital importance to personnel executives and their staffs.

List price, \$3.50—PPA members, \$2.50

Write for PPA Publications Catalog, listing 40 personnel publications.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL ASSOCIATION

1313 East 60th Street

Chicago 37, Illinois



BOOK AND PAMPHLET NOTES

Personnel Practices in Colleges and Universities. College and University Personnel Association, 809 South Wright Street, Champaign, Illinois, 1958. 171 pp. \$5.00.

In recognizing the need for information concerning staff (nonacademic) personnel policies and practices, The College and University Personnel Association began this series of studies in 1949. The present survey has enlarged its scope to include certain data concerning personnel practices for academic personnel. This step into the new area of academic personnel practices was made because of popular demand on the part of many institutions. William D. Poore, Personnel Director at the Alabama Polytechnic Institute, has been in charge of the survey.

Creativity and Conformity. Foundation for Research on Human Behavior, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 1958. 46 pp. \$3.00.

How do you spot a really creative person? How do you assess your company's (or agency's) creative resources? How do you increase the flow of ideas? How do you maintain the discipline of production without stifling originality? How do you cope with the inhibiting pressure of conformity? These are problems which confront every executive. They are also problems which concern social scientists. In April, 1958, businessmen and social scientists met to examine research which had been done on creativity and conformity. This is the report of their meeting.

Retirement Plans for Public Employees. Municipal Finance Officers Association of the U. S. and Canada, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois, 1958. 46 pp. \$2.50.

The purpose of this publication is to present an explanation regarding the principles governing the formulation of an adequate retirement plan for public employees and to discuss the methods for bringing about the establishment of a plan. Only by thoroughly understanding the objectives to be attained and by adhering to accepted principles and concepts governing the benefit and financial provisions of a retirement plan, can a satisfactory plan be developed and maintained. Only then will it merit the support of the employees and bring about the desired results to the employer without placing undue burdens upon the financial resources of taxpayers.

Public Relations and the Empire State. Bernard Rubin. Rutgers University Press, 30 College Avenue, New Brunswick, New Jersey, 1958. 357 pp. \$7.50.

Public relations has come in our time to be a necessary function of democratic government. This case study of how the administration in one state planned and carried out its PR program is based on a large number of direct interviews with PR officials on the job in the state government of New York.

Television News Reporting. The Staff of CBS News. McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., 330 West 42nd Street, New York 36, New York, 1958. 182 pp. \$5.75.

The inside story for those whose publicity activities may take them into range of the TV cameras. And anyone interested in layout and makeup of publications will find this book full of novel and exciting ideas to adapt or just plain steal.

Have You Added to

YOUR PERSONAL PERSONNEL LIBRARY

Recently?

"Beware of the man of one book."—Proverbs

PERSONNEL BIBLIOGRAPHY

This feature is possible through the cooperation of the U.S. Civil Service Commission. It was prepared by the staff of the Commission's Library under the direction of Mrs. Elaine Woodruff, Librarian. Selections are made on the basis of (1) general availability, (2) pertinence to the public service generally, and (3) recency of material.

Group Insurance for Public Employees

Health Insurance

Commission on financing of hospital care.

Financing hospital care in the United States. New York, Blakiston co., 1954-55. 3v.

Contents: vol. 1, Factors affecting the costs of hospital care, edited by J. H. Hayes; vol. 2, Prepayment and the community, edited by H. Becker; vol. 3, Financing hospital care for non-wage and low-income groups, edited by H. Becker.

Harrow, Herman.

Growth of hospital service plans—a look at the Blue Cross. Personnel administration, vol. 21, no. 1, January-February 1958, pp. 17-24.

Examines development of Blue Cross plan from viewpoints of hospitals, labor unions, private insurance companies, and industrial employers.

Levine, Sol, Odin W. Anderson, and Gerald Gordon.

Non-group enrollment for health insurance; a study of administrative approaches of Blue Cross plan. Cambridge, Harvard university press, 1957. 171 pp.

Charts a course which will ensure safe, successful enrollment of non-group populations in hospital plans by identifying the critical factors that determine success or failure of such attempts.

New York. Department of civil service.

Health insurance for New York state employees. Albany, 1957. 32 pp.

Presents highlights of new health insurance program for New York state employees. Plan consists of three parts: Basic hospitalization; basic surgical-medical coverage; major medical coverage.

Oregon. University. Bureau of municipal research and service.

Fringe benefits in municipal employment; a survey of practices in Oregon cities having over 1,000 population. Portland, 1954. 44 pp. (Information bulletin no. 93)

Contains table showing group hospital and surgical plans available to municipal employees in Oregon, pp. 20-22.

Tennessee valley authority.

TVA health insurance plan. Chattanooga, 1957. 1 v.

Presents benefits contained in the basic hospital-surgical-medical plan and major medical expense plan provided by Blue Cross and Blue Shield.

U. S. Civil service commission.

General answers to questions on the new major medical expense insurance proposal for federal civilian employees and their families. Washington, 1956. 11 pp. (News release of April 2, 1956)

U. S. Commission on organization of the executive branch of the government.

Federal medical services. Washington, U. S. Govt. print. off., 1955. 88 pp.

Recommends that the executive branch develop a voluntary contributory program of medical care and hospital insurance to be conducted through a pool of private health insurance agencies for all civilian employees of the federal government.

U. S. Commission on organization of the executive branch of the government.

Task force report on federal medical services. Washington, U. S. Govt. print. off., 1955. 139 pp.

Recommends enactment of legislation under which the federal government would develop for its employees on a voluntary prepayment basis a program of contributory medical and hospitalization insurance based upon utilization of payroll deduction.

Young, Philip.

The Administration's new group health insurance proposal. Washington, U. S. Civil service commission, 1956. 4 pp. (News release of March 15, 1956)

Explains in some detail the proposed group health insurance for federal employees. "Designed to supplement the employees' own basic health insurance coverages, the proposal would cover all active federal employees insured under the Federal employee Group Life Insurance program and their eligible dependents. It would not cover employee retired prior to the date the program would go into effect."

Life Insurance**Balmer, Bert A.**

Fringe benefits in Washington cities. Seattle, University of Washington, Bureau of governmental research and services, 1957. 27 pp. (Report no. 136)

Outlines group medical and life insurance benefits available to employees of cities in the state of Washington, pp. 10-12.

Gregg, Davis W.

Group life insurance. Rev. ed., Homewood, Ill., Richard D. Irwin, 1957. 262 pp.

Analysis of concepts, contracts, costs and company practices.

Irons, Warren B.

Federal employees' group life insurance program. Public administration review, vol. 14, no. 4, Autumn 1954, pp. 268-270.

Considers briefly the benefits provided federal civilian employees by the Group Life Insurance program. Outlines steps by which the major mechanics were completed and comments on means whereby enough information was given employees so they could decide whether to take or reject the insurance.

Kidney, Edith B.

Fringe benefits for salaried employees in government and industry. Chicago, Civil service assembly of the United States and Canada, 1954. 33 pp. (Personnel report no. 542)

Discusses group insurance, both life and health, which are available to public employees in certain jurisdictions.

Massachusetts. Legislative research council.

Report . . . relative to sharing costs of group insurance for retired local government employees. Boston, 1958. 26 pp. (H. rept. 3014)

Statistical research and fact-finding report on House bill which proposed that local governments may share equally in the cost to their employees of the premiums for certain group insurance, after as well as before the retirement of those employees.

National industrial conference board.

Trends in company group insurance programs. New York, 1957. 44 pp. (Studies in personnel policy no. 159)

Compares group benefits in 187 companies in 1949 and 1956. Two changes are especially apparent: Level of benefits has risen; somewhat more companies pay the entire cost of the benefit. Points out medical and life insurance protection which is being extended to retired employees.

U. S. Civil service commission.

General answers to questions on group life insurance plan for federal civilian employees. Washington, 1954. 6 pp. (News release of August 18, 1954)

U. S. Congress. House. Committee on post office and civil service.

Group life insurance for federal employees. Washington, U. S. Govt. print. off., 1954. 6 pp. (H. rept. 2579, 83rd Cong.)

U. S. Congress. Senate. Committee on post office and civil service.

Group life insurance for federal employees. Washington, U. S. Govt. print. off., 1954. 9 pp. (S. rept. 1654, 83rd Cong.)

Report to accompany S. 3681 sets out the provisions of the plan, and its purpose, and analyzes bill section by section. Contains agency reports as well.

U. S. President, 1953- (Dwight D. Eisenhower)

Contributory group life insurance for federal civilian employees. Washington, U. S. Govt. print. off., 1954. 2 pp. (H. Doc. 398, 83rd Cong.)

Outlines plan for contributory group life insurance for federal civilian employees and place of such a program in strengthening administrative efficiency of government by benefiting career service employees.

Van Eenam, Weltha.

Group life insurance for federal employees. Social security bulletin, vol. 17, no. 10, October 1954, pp. 11-14, 22.

Outlines the federal employees group life insurance program.

Administration

What About the Future of Personnel Administration? Charles A. Myers. *Personnel Administration*. September-October, 1958.

Serious questions raised by critics of current personnel administration compel us to evaluate its contributions. One critic has charged that personnel administration is largely a collection of incidental techniques without much internal cohesion. Others say that the "human relations" approach to personnel policy has resulted in training supervisors to mesmerize and manipulate people and is producing "organization men."

Too often, personnel people become attached to technique and lose sight of purpose. This results from the concept that management's task is harnessing passive human energy to organizational requirements.

However, social science research suggests that the essential task of management is to arrange conditions so that people can direct their own efforts toward organizational objectives.

We need a re-emphasis on the underlying philosophy of dealing with people in a democratic society. Personnel administrators have a responsibility to help put this concept into practice. To do this they need to improve staff-line relationships in their organization through patience, persuasiveness, and understanding. Further, this challenge has a wider significance than at the organizational level. For we need to prove to a world choosing between our system and Communism that free people are more productive, more dynamic, and lead fuller lives than those who are not free.—NORMAN SHARPLESS.

How To Undo a Mistake. Charles A. Cerami. *Nation's Business*. June, 1958.

Every executive is sure to face the problem of changing his course or undoing a mistake from time to time. Yet no other

recurring business situation gets so little attention or planning. Modern advanced management techniques put all the emphasis on good decision-making, but no matter how carefully plans are made, no matter how fine the decisive judgment, a certain percentage of the new directions any business takes will prove to be dead-end streets. Sometimes even the soundest decision becomes a boomerang because of a totally unexpected sequence of events.

A pattern for undoing error should be a regular part of every businessman's thinking, something he keeps stored in the back of his mind for occasional use. The course of necessary action will fall naturally into three phases: Laying the groundwork for change, timing the change, and handling the unforeseen error. There's nothing defeatist about having such a plan—any more than skill in handling customer complaints is a sign of pessimism.

There are two major reasons for having a standby program for use when a decision must be changed, and neither represents negative thinking: (1) The moment when a mistake is realized is almost always a time of pressure. The greater the error, the more acute the crisis. Sudden hunches are always suspect, and particularly so when an alarm bell has sounded. It's safer to know in advance what to do in case of fire. (2) Knowing that a move can be reversed, being familiar with the point of no return and the toll that a change of course would exact, actually promotes aggressiveness. It is the subconscious feeling that decisions are almost irreversible that tends to shackle the decision-making process and to encourage undue timidity.

The article suggests a standby, course-adjustment policy, involving four main points:

1. Admit frankly that an error has occurred. Psychologists say some people find it almost impossible to admit—even to themselves—that they have made a mistake, but the average person

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

has no such problem if he sees a general policy of open admission on everyone's part.

2. Make a heroic effort to avoid useless blaming and recrimination, substituting instead an analysis that will prevent recurrence.
3. Let the man who made the original decision handle the corrective procedure.
4. Move ahead in the new direction with the spirit that the change represents an entirely new and separate decision.—
RUTH L. OLSON.

Communication

Communications Only Seem Simple. Fred Dowling. *Personnel Journal*. October, 1958.

The executives' skill in all phases of communication is dependent on a sensitive appreciation of the theory underlying the methods of communication. The first step for anyone who wishes to improve his own communication skill is to recognize that the communication process is highly complex. Traditionally, the communication process includes: sender—encoding—message—decoding—receiver. Because of human frailties, no sender can hope to see a situation with 100 percent accuracy so he is unable to formulate his message perfectly.

Thus, every program aimed at improving communication must include training in analysis and observation.

Serious difficulties are encountered in encoding since the sender is limited by his own working vocabulary and the receiver's vocabulary, and both are limited by the inadequacies of our language. The seemingly logical assumption that a sender transfers his ideas from his mind to the receiver's mind is false. All the sender can hope to do is observe accurately and meaningfully and then stir up in the receiver's mind an idea close enough to his own to prevent serious misunderstanding.

In decoding, the receiver listens toward the words he hears or reads according to his own experiences. Every idea the sender directs to the receiver's mind finds substance in what the receiver knows. If all receivers could be objective in listening, many of our communication ills would disappear; however, his emotions, prejudices, and his concern about himself elicit interpretations about what he hears to an extent that he cannot objectively consume the full intent of the sender.

The man who hopes to communicate well receives guidance from those he tries to reach. As the exchange of ideas increases, speed, accuracy, and morale of communicators also increases.—GRACE M. PIERSON.

Employee Relations

The Executive Procedure for Handling the Emotionally Upset. Harry Levinson. *The Office*. August, 1958.

An executive can help emotionally upset subordinates by understanding that emotional disturbances are a common illness often affecting all of us. When our personality is out of balance, anxiety may restore an equilibrium or cause panic or breakdown. Immediate first aid relief can be given disturbed persons when the executive talks over the problems with them or serves as a "friend in need" when the employees come to him for help.

The executive's own anxiety may cause difficulty which becomes apparent in implementing two basic principles: listening and limiting. *Listening*. This is the key to emergency relief, but it is not understood well. The troubled person should tell his own story, but the listening process is disrupted by the listener's own feelings, impatience, or pontification. "Telling" the employee he should not "feel" bad is not the way to give help. *Limiting*. "Relief counseling" has some limitations, and the executive should not attempt to give help in all problem situations. Some emotional problems require professional help and should be referred to outside sources such as psychiatrists, community resources, or the employee's own physician.

The greatest help can be given where problems relate to external stress, or to acute family or job difficulties.

An employee who bares his emotional problems expects that his troubles will be kept confidential. The emotional condition can be magnified if this trust is violated by allowing outsiders to know what is bothering the employee.

When a problem is referred to an outside source, the employee may misunderstand the move and feel he is "crazy." Such misunderstanding can be avoided by the executive if he would summarize with the employee what has gone on, and where the matter now stands.

Frequently the people who seek counsel feel embarrassed later and tend to ignore the person who tried to help them. The

executive can prevent such behavior by indicating to the upset employee that such a feeling is natural, and that he understands it and is not offended by it.—FRANK B. KRUPIARZ.

Executive Development

Executive Development After Ten Years.

Marshall E. Dimock. *Public Administration Review*. Spring, 1958.

Executive development programs—attempts to sharpen administrative skills of individuals believed to possess leadership potential—have become prominent since World War II in both government and private industry. Executive development programs normally are on three levels: the primary level designed for relatively inexperienced administrators; the intermediate stage for individuals with 10 to 15 years experience in the ranks of middle to top management; and the third level for top, and usually younger, executives.

The intermediate level is most in use, but shares two common objectives with the other levels: first, to prod and mature the individual's philosophy of administration, and, second, to prepare him to undertake policy planning and decision making. With the increasing demands of his job, the higher an executive is promoted the more he deals with policy decisions that are complicated and impelling; and the higher one goes in administration the greater is the importance of values and judgments growing out of the intuitive and the nonlogical.

Too much is expected of executive development programs and we cannot expect a narrow specialist to suddenly take on the glow of executive inspiration like a sinner responding to a revivalist, simply because he has been exposed for a few weeks to the magic of an executive development program. An executive's biggest problems are not always administrative in the conventional sense. They are more often concerned with policy and survival issues including pressure groups, competition, etc. A common dissatisfaction with executive development programs is that they do not meet the need of preparing for policy making but concentrate instead on administrative techniques.

Also such programs are becoming formula-like and stereotyped. To improve these programs we should spend less time on the *process* of decision making and more on *what* is being decided and *why*. In brief,

the quality and content are more important than the method.

There should be more emphasis on training at the top level which in turn will make it more popular and effective at the junior level. A development course is successful when the executive gains the insight that administration is a philosophy, a way of life, something that is not only challenging in his job but that could even unify his personality and interests in a way he had never suspected. The program should have self-generating features and the curriculum arranged to produce an enthusiasm for the process-policy activity known as administration, in a way that will enable a man to form his own philosophy and provide his own ongoing stimulus to improvement.

In the next decade there will be fewer programs, with refresher courses as needed. The courses will be better, there will be advances in the training of top executives, and it will become widely appreciated that there is no magic that will produce a qualified executive.—GENE HUNTLEY.

Seven Deadly Sins of Executive Placement.

Saul W. Gellerman. *The Management Review*. July, 1958.

The techniques for finding and evaluating management potential are frustrating, hard to manage, inexact, and expensive. Seven common sins and insights that have helped make executive selection less frustrating, less expensive, and more exact are:

Careless treatment of candidates. Many selection programs hurt the company's prestige because of misunderstanding and disappointment traceable to the way in which candidates are handled. Situation would be improved if results were discussed with candidate, and if rejected candidates were more tactfully informed of their rejection.

Overdependence on expert opinions. Some managements abdicate decision-making responsibility to consultants who are not in a position to see the whole picture. The man who does well on a test is not necessarily best for the executive job, and the final decision should rest with management.

Overestimating or misjudging job requirements. The job description often lists unnecessary traits or even the wrong traits. Management must set specific and realistic qualifications based on firsthand knowledge of the job to be filled.

Making stop gap appointments. It is better to promote a man who is not fully prepared

for the immediate job, but who can grow into and beyond it than to appoint a fully trained man whose growth is already at its peak.

Pigeonholing prospective candidates. Classifying a man's potential entirely on his previous experience is a widespread sin. Assignments to positions for which a candidate's experience is slim, but for which his talents and personality are evident, should be attempted.

Disregarding the company personality. Companies in the same industry can and do have widely divergent attitudes toward the ways in which their business should be carried out. An intimate knowledge of the psychological atmosphere in which the candidate would be working is necessary.

Overlooking personal compatibility. As companies have personality, so do individuals. The psychological environment in which the candidate would be working must be considered.—TOM D. WOMBLE.

Professionalization

Let's Stop Professionalizing. James M. Jenks. *Personnel Journal*. July-August, 1958.

Personnel and training men need and should try to attain elevation in status in the eyes of top management, but their misguided efforts to professionalization are sounding a death knell. For at least a decade, they have been busily engaged in sawing off the limb they are sitting on—putting themselves outside top management councils, eagerly seeking recognition as a professional adjunct rather than as an integral part of management. Major companies award top jobs to managers—sales, production, financial, or control—rather than to people in training and personnel who actually encourage setting themselves off in consultative positions.

True, top management has bought important research developments, often couched in mystifying and impressive vernacular. However, in so doing, it has developed a phobia about personnel people and a tendency (encouraged by Personnel) to look on the personnel function as it views that of outside management consultants. Buying personnel programs, like buying consultant programs, too often consigned to the files without action, does not "buy" a place on top management councils.

Personnel benefits are measurable in intangibles, a fact that may breed an unconscious sense of insecurity in personnel men.

However, it is significant that personnel functions already exist in all major companies "whether top management recognizes their true value or not." Solutions to the problem of attaining top management recognition and acceptance of the value of personnel functions are (1) to improve standards of personnel and training procedures and (2) to forget "self-importance."

If personnel and training people want to make a career in management, participate in management's councils, and progress into top management positions, they must "not fight 'em, but join 'em." Understanding management's problems will be reflected back by management's greater understanding of the personnel function. Herein lies the only route to top management, a route open to insiders and closed to professional personnel practitioners.—HELEN THOMPSON.

Public Relations

Who Wants to Work for the Government? O. Glen Stahl. *Personnel Administration*. September-October, 1958.

A teenage poll indicates that 96 per cent of today's teen-agers are not interested in governmental service because the economic benefits are insufficient.

This attitude is part of the general anti-intellectualism of our times. In part, it is also a product of the American habit of ridiculing various groups in our society. Today's young people are turning their backs to pursuits in which the rewards lie in the intellectual satisfaction of work itself because our society has stressed too exclusively the material rewards of work. Careers in public service will not attract a sufficient number of young people as long as the current exaltation of mediocrity continues. A revolt against anti-intellectualism and an increased esteem for the public service go hand in hand.

Government activity will increase and with it the need for good governmental workers. The tendency of industry may well be toward the expansion of trivial satisfactions through multiple radio and television sets, cars, etc. Satisfaction of the more important needs such as better education, public health, welfare, and the wise use of leisure time demands expanded government programs and a larger need for and use of dedicated workers.

Although the value of scholarships in the physical sciences is gaining recognition,

thanks to Russia, care must be taken that we do not overlook other areas of knowledge. The achievement of government workers must be publicized. Explorer was the result of the cooperative endeavor of the civil servant and the military personnel. Public servants themselves must also share in the responsibility of creating favorable public opinion and realize that good service builds good public reaction.

It is hoped on the 75th anniversary of the merit system that we do not have to wait another 75 years to see scholarship honored more than physical prowess, government given a place of distinction in society, the merit system in public employment understood and supported vigorously by all citizens, and the ethical standards in our society reach a level at least as high as that existing in the public service.

We need the courage to instill into our children a respect for intellectual values, for work aside from its monetary rewards, and for service. Holding fast against the mob psychology of anti-intellectualism and anti-public service requires just this kind of courage.—DOROTHY C. PIEZ.

Supervision

Supervising Older Clerical Workers. Waino W. Suojanen. *Personnel*. May-June, 1958.

It is estimated that by 1975, about 17.5 million women between the ages of 35 and 64 will be in the American labor force. Better ways of supervising them will have to be found.

Supervision of older women clerical workers generally differs from supervising men. The older, female clerical worker has a semicareer orientation toward her work in that she plans to work for a long period of time (20 to 30 years) but does not have firm expectations of being promoted beyond the first-line supervisory level. She tends to respond to immediate rewards and direct satisfactions. She has acquired a range of experience in making decisions and working under general supervision. She tends to be more critical about the human relations abilities of her supervisor, her responsibilities, the lack of variety in her work, and her inability to make decisions.

Two ways to keep her interest are job rotation and job enlargement. Job rotation may be repeated until, in time, each worker learns how to perform every job in her section. In job enlargement the job is changed

to provide more decision making and greater variety, and the training time is longer.

Training courses must emphasize the fact that supervision of older, semicareer-oriented women involves somewhat different assumptions than that of young girls straight from school who are putting in time until they get married. As machines take over more routine clerical tasks the mature, intelligent woman will increasingly be recognized as the "ideal" clerical worker. By understanding her job interests and motivations we can find the means of improving the job climate in clerical operations, and thereby reduce expensive turnover. (Article contains charts showing the learning curve.)—LERAY S. HOWELL.

How To Live With Worker Cliques. John D. Stanley. *Personnel Journal*. June, 1958.

Are cliques affecting the performance of the personnel director? Groups with no official standing—and of whose existence management may not even be aware—can throw wrenches into the works. One way they can do this is to begin "whisper campaigns" to discourage recruits. The motive for such a campaign may be a selfish desire on part of the clique to prevent competition from new employees.

A young man of Germanic extraction, who had a stable work history and possessed skill in his trade, failed to meet his production norm for a long time. Eventually he requested a transfer, stating that the work crew was "unfriendly." The shop was dominated by a well-intrenched clique of middle-aged Anglo-Saxon Yankees who had rejected this placement.

One of the most effective measures which a firm can take to insure a friendly reception of the new employee is to use a criteria of social acceptability as a guide rather than a requirement. A written description of the social structure of the group may help. Care must be exercised to avoid violation of "fair employment practice" laws.

The personnel management should consider predictive or weighted application blanks showing not only the definitive requirements of a job but also the personality attributes of the job seeker. Socio-dramatic performance tests which aid in evaluating the recruit's aggressive tendencies, leadership qualities, ability to accept criticism, and social intelligence are valuable.

The functions of promotion and transfer are also not immune to interference by the informal group. Promotional action without

and greater regard for dominant clique sentiments and expectations is one problem. It is feasible to promote a person who is a "natural leader" of an informal group. This individual may carry informal power as well as formal authority.

An existing work group may be sociometrically tested to determine which individuals are least acceptable to the group. These "misfits" can then be transferred. This process has two advantages: (1) to establish a "pool" of workers for reassignment with the least group resistance, and (2) the removal of disquieting elements should have a beneficial effect upon the remaining workers' job satisfaction.

Sociometric studies may be helpful even though expensive, but, in time, the benefits gained will offset the initial cost and the negligible cost of continual use.—JAMES R. GRAY.

1959 PPR Abstracters

The following members of the Public Personnel Association have accepted the editor's invitation to serve as abstracters of articles for the "Personnel Literature" section of *Public Personnel Review* in 1959.

Roger E. Belanger, Personnel Officer, The St. Lawrence Seaway Authority, Montreal, Canada

Leroy J. Brenneman, Personnel Director, Phoenix Civil Service Board, Phoenix, Arizona

Virgil T. Dreiling, Personnel Technician, Kansas Department of Administration, Topeka, Kansas

John Paul Gaquin, Personnel Assistant to County Manager, Montgomery County Personnel Board, Rockville, Maryland

James R. Gray, Chief of Employee and Public Relations, Department of Employment Security, Providence, Rhode Island

Fred Henne, Personnel Officer, Arkansas Department of Welfare, Little Rock, Arkansas

LeRay S. Howell, Supervisor, Utah Merit System Council, Salt Lake City, Utah

Gene Huntley, Director, Division of Personnel & Public Relations, Oregon State Highway Department, Salem, Oregon

Frank B. Krupiarz, Chief, Personnel Section, Michigan Department of Health, Lansing, Michigan

Ruth L. Olson, Bureau Personnel Officer, Bureau of Aeronautics, Department of the Navy, Washington, D. C.

Grace M. Pierson, Associate Personnel Examiner, California State Personnel Board, Sacramento, California

Dorothy C. Piez, Recruitment Officer, Career Service Authority, City and County of Denver, Denver, Colorado

Norman Sharpless, Assistant City Personnel Director, Milwaukee City Service Commission, Milwaukee, Wisconsin

Helen Thompson, Assistant Personnel Director, City of Atlanta, Atlanta, Georgia

Tom D. Womble, Director of Personnel, Miami Beach Civil Service Board, Miami Beach, Florida

1959 PPA INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE

SAN FRANCISCO

October 4-8

Sheraton-Palace Hotel

**Include the post-conference trip to Hawaii
in your travel plans**



Our Readers Write . . .

● Stimulating Stuff

. . . Really I often wonder why I maintain my interest in Personnel since I will probably never return to that field, but I find your stuff stimulating and helpful in organizing and operating my own agricultural section, and it does keep me informed of some of the latest developments in the public management field at home.

W. Gordon Loveless
Member, American Mission to Iraq
(formerly State Personnel Director
of Vermont)

● Reader Exchange

. . . In the current issue of the *Public Personnel Review*, Mr. Fulker asks for two copies of our article "How To Design Reading Comprehension Tests." There has been a substantial addition of new material since the original publication of this article which might be useful to Mr. Fulker in his reading program. We would like Mr. Fulker to have the amended article, but we are not sure of his address. It would be greatly appreciated if you would forward the enclosed letter and reprints to Mr. Fulker.

Harry Reiner
Chief, Law Enforcement and
Social Service Examinations

● Exceptional and Excellent

. . . We find "The Personnel Man" of exceptional interest in our home and wish also to comment on the excellence of your "Public Personnel Review." It is literally packed with informative material, presented in a most attractive manner, and we wish you continued success in its publication.

(Miss) Kathleen Keller
International Association of
Personnel in Employment Security

● Get-Up-And-Go

. . . Thanks for the excellent article on the Canadian Pay Research Bureau.

We note in the excerpts quoted below, an object lesson for us in the exercise of the American characteristic of get-up-and-go.

The article points out that:

"Soon after his appointment in May, 1957, the Chairman of the Commission—set up a three-man committee in the Commission to study the feasibility of creating a separate unit to conduct research into rates of pay.

"The report of the committee was approved by the Commission and on September 2, 1957, the formation of the Pay Research Bureau—was announced".

In contrast to this we have an Interdepartmental Committee on Civilian Compensation, established by a Cabinet Paper dated April 6, 1957. It issued a summary report dated November, 1957, which advocates adoption of a number of proposals to improve the federal pay systems. So far none of these has been implemented except that another study commission has been discussed.

Apropos this appointment of another commission it is of further interest to quote from this summary report that "the staff group examined 33 previous studies of federal compensation. Twenty-eight of the 33 studies reported "failure to set pay realistically and flexibly" as a major problem. This finding is repeated in the current report—the 34th. Can we now hope for a repetition of this finding in the proposed 35th commission study? And perhaps even some relief?

John Bamberg
Salt Lake City, Utah

BARRINGTON ASSOCIATES, INC.

230 Park Avenue, N.Y.C., Murray Hill 4-0141

Established 1926

Consultation with government in:

- Salary and Classification Study
- Organization Analysis and Planning
- Records Administration
- Systems and Procedures
- Performance Budgeting

We welcome the opportunity to review your administrative problems with you.

*Member Association of
Consulting Management Engineers*

J. L. JACOBS & COMPANY

*Counselors in Personnel Administration
Since 1915*

**POSITION CLASSIFICATION—SALARY PLANS
RECRUITING AND EXAMINATION
STANDARDS**

**EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE RATINGS
PERSONNEL RECORDS SIMPLIFICATION
RULES AND REGULATIONS
PERSONNEL MANUALS**

53 West Jackson Blvd. Chicago 4, Ill.

LOUIS J. KROEGER and ASSOCIATES

A complete staff of public personnel specialists available for personnel installations, reviews, test preparation, and related services.

64 Pine Street, San Francisco

426 S. Spring Street, Los Angeles

LEE ASSOCIATES INC.

Established 1946

FR 7-2718

An experienced staff of public personnel specialists available for surveys and installations.

The Johnston Building
Charlotte 2, N. C.

MANAGEMENT SERVICES ASSOCIATES, INC.

* * *
H. Elliot Kaplan—President

Specialists In Public
Personnel Administration

**POSITION CLASSIFICATION SURVEYS
SALARY PLANS
PENSION STUDIES**

93 Worth Street, New York 13, N. Y.

JAMES O. YARGER AND ASSOCIATES

PERSONNEL AND MANAGEMENT SERVICES

Services for all units of government:
Position Classification and Salary Plans
Retirement Systems
Personnel Ordinances and Regulations
Employee Selection and Evaluation
Administrative and Fiscal Surveys

An experienced senior staff for your use

309 Walnut St., Falls Church, Virginia

PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION SERVICE

A Unique Service to Governments

- A record of more than three hundred successful personnel surveys and installations at all levels of government.
- Consulting services in all areas of governmental management.
- Pertinent publications in many branches of public administration.

1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois

"A LANDMARK FOR PROGRESS"

PERSONNEL RESEARCH FRONTIERS

By Cecil E. Goode

"RESEARCH" is the magic touchstone marking the way to progress in many fields today. Everywhere we see evidence of the gains that science and technology have made possible.

. . . But what's the story on research in the personnel field? Up to now, not many people knew the answers to questions like these—

WHO does most of the personnel research today?

WHAT is the significance of research findings?

WHY are governmental personnel research needs lagging?

WHO is financing most of today's research?

WHAT action program is needed for the future?

WHY should personnel people be more research-minded?

Aided by a Ford Foundation grant, the Public Personnel Association recently undertook a comprehensive survey to track down the facts . . . to find the "WHO," "WHAT," and "WHY" . . . to make the answers widely available. The survey was conducted by Cecil E. Goode, Editor of the journal *Personnel Administration*, and broadly experienced as a personnel executive and writer.

In *Personnel Research Frontiers* Mr. Goode presents his survey findings and recommendations for a program to produce and use more and better personnel research on governmental personnel problems. Those who reviewed the report in draft form have acclaimed it as a "landmark for progress."

If you're now in personnel work . . . if you're interested in looking ahead to the future . . . you'll want a copy for your professional library.

List price, \$3.50—Price to PPA members, \$2.50

PUBLIC PERSONNEL ASSOCIATION

1313 EAST 60TH STREET CHICAGO 37, ILLINOIS